



## Editorial Board

Ednan Aslan, University of Vienna  
Karl Baier, University of Vienna  
Nicole Maria Bauer, University of Innsbruck  
Martin Baumann, University of Lucerne  
Alexandra Grieser, Trinity College Dublin  
Birgit Heller, University of Vienna  
Andreas Kowatsch, University of Vienna  
Dominika Motak, Ruhr University Bochum  
Almut-Barbara Renger, University of Basel  
Robert Segal, University of Aberdeen  
Levent Tezcan, University of Münster  
David Václavík, Masaryk University, Brno  
Zdeněk Vojtíšek, Charles University, Prague  
Franz Winter, University of Graz

*Religion in Austria* is peer-reviewed

Hans Gerald Hödl and Lukas K. Pokorny  
(editors)

# Religion in Austria

## Volume 7



PRAESENS VERLAG

Published with support from  
the Research Center “Religion and Transformation  
in Contemporary Society”



The emblems on the previous page and the front cover show various logos/symbols representing the religious traditions, institutions, and contexts discussed in this volume. Permission to reproduce the logos has been granted by the respective organisations. The emblems signify (from left to right): (1) Fóguāngshān; (2) the Austrian Buddhist Religious Society (*ÖBR*), which organises Buddhist religious education at schools; (3) the Holistic Dance Institute; (4) Chinese Christianity (the symbol used is the Chinese term for “Christianity”—*jīdūjiào* 基督教); (5) Shaolin Chan Wu Chi; (6) the State Collections of Lower Austria; and (7) Euro-Buddhism (the symbol used is the *dharmacakra* or “dharma wheel” representing Buddhism in general).

**Bibliographic information published by the  
Deutsche Nationalbibliothek**

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>

ISBN 978-3-7069-1187-0

Copyright © by Praesens Verlag  
<http://www.praesens.at>  
Vienna 2022

All rights reserved. Right holders, who could not be determined, are requested to contact the publisher.

# Contents

<i>Hans Gerald Hödl and Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	ix
Preface	

## Articles

<i>Joseph Chadwin and Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	3
“A Shared Passion and Love for the Light of the Buddha”: A History of Fógūāngshān in Austria	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny and Martina Anissa Strommer</i>	37
Buddhist Religious Education at Schools in Austria	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny and Gabriella Voss</i>	101
“Coming Home to Oneself through the Body”: The Holistic Dance Institute in Austria	
<i>Joseph Chadwin</i>	139
Religiously Apathetic, Hybrid Christians, and Traditional Converts: An Ethnographic Study of How Chinese Immigrant Children in Vienna Engage with Christianity	
<i>Joseph Chadwin and Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	179
Shàolín Buddhism in Austria: The Case of Shaolin Chan Wu Chi	
<i>Rocco Leuzzi and Dirk Schuster</i>	209
The Popular Piety Display of the Lower Austria Museum’s <i>Haus der Geschichte</i> and Its Classification in Cultural Studies	

## Sources

- Lukas K. Pokorny with Hubert Weitensfelder* 233  
 “To Preserve the Teachings in their Original Simplicity and Purity”:  
 An Annotated Translation of the Correspondence between Anton  
 Kropatsch and A. A. G. Bennett, 1955–1956

## Resources

- Lukas K. Pokorny* 377  
 Religion in Austria: An Annotated Bibliography of 2021  
 Scholarship
- Lukas K. Pokorny* 469  
 Religion in Austria: Master’s and Doctoral Theses Submitted at  
 Austrian Universities 2021

## Book Reviews

- Lukas K. Pokorny* 495  
 Alois Musil. Interdisziplinäre Perspektiven auf eine vielschichtige  
 Persönlichkeit (Benedikt J. Collinet, Ludger Hiepel, Martina  
 Veselá, and Michael Weigl)
- Lukas K. Pokorny* 509  
 Annotated Legal Documents on Islam in Europe: Austria (Richard  
 Potz)
- Gabriella Voss* 515  
 Das Leben deuten. Eine praktisch-theologische Studie zu Freier  
 Ritualbegleitung (Teresa Schweighofer)
- Hans Gerald Hödl* 521  
 DDDDr. Johannes Ude (1874–1965). Pazifist – Lebensreformer –  
 Priesterpolitiker. Anstoß damals wie heute? (Michaela Sohn-  
 Kronthaler and Leopold Neuhold)

- Eva Holder* 527  
Die Evangelikale Bewegung in Österreich. Grundzüge ihrer historischen und theologischen Entwicklung (1945–1998) (Frank Hinkelmann)
- Manfred Hutter* 537  
Die Geschichte der österreichischen Bahá'í-Gemeinde (Second Edition) (Alex A. Käfer)
- Yuval Katz-Wilfing* 555  
Die vierte Gemeinde. Die Geschichte der Wiener Juden von 1945 bis heute (Evelyn Adunka)
- Julian Strube* 561  
Doing mandir, doing kōvil. Eine empirische Rekonstruktion hinduistischer Tempelpraktiken in der Schweiz und in Österreich (Katharina Limacher)
- Gabriella Voss* 567  
Islamistische Radikalisierung. Biografische Verläufe im Kontext der religiösen Sozialisation und des radikalen Milieu (Ednan Aslan, Evrim Erşan Akkılıç, and Maximilian Hämmerle)
- Hans Gerald Hödl* 577  
Kirche, Religion und Politik in Österreich und in der Tschechoslowakei im 20. Jahrhundert (Miroslav Kunštát, Jaroslav Šebek, and Hildegard Schmoller)
- Dominic Zoehrer* 591  
Mächtig–Männlich–Mysteriös. Geheimbünde in Österreich (Heiner Boberski, Peter Gnaiger, Martin Haidinger, Thomas Schaller, and Robert Weichinger)
- Marta Domínguez Díaz* 601  
Muslim Women in Austria and Germany Doing and Undoing Gender: Making Gender Differences and Hierarchies Relevant or Irrelevant (Constanze Volkmann)

<i>Hans Gerald Hödl</i>	609
Postmoderne Freikirche in Österreich heute. Exemplarische wissenschaftliche Untersuchung (Hella Hagspiel-Keller)	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	615
Praxis für die Zukunft. Erfahrungen, Beispiele und Modelle kooperativen Religionsunterrichts (Mehmet Hilmi Tuna and Maria Juen)	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	621
Predigt, Beichte und Soldaten. Die Kapuzinermission im Salzburger Pongau 1613–1616 im Bericht von Johann Stainhauser (1570–1625) (Martin Scheutz)	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	627
Religion – die letzte Freiheit. Religionsausübung im Strafvollzug (Ursula Unterberger)	
<i>Franz Winter</i>	633
Sondermodell Österreich? Die islamische Glaubensgemeinschaft in Österreich (IGGiÖ) (Maja Sticker)	
<i>Lukas K. Pokorny</i>	637
Unser Mittelalter! Die erste jüdische Gemeinde in Wien (Astrid Peterle, Adina Seeger, Domagoj Akrap, and Daniella Spera)	
<i>Robert Wurzrainer</i>	643
Wenn Bildung mehr sein muss. Der Beitrag muslimischer Jugendorganisationen zur Bildungsarbeit (Kevser Muratovic)	
Contributors	653



# **“To Preserve the Teachings in their Original Simplicity and Purity”: An Annotated Translation of the Correspondence between Anton Kropatsch and A. A. G. Bennett, 1955–1956**

*Lukas K. Pokorny with Hubert Weitensfelder*

## **1. Introduction**

This is an annotated translation of a first part of the correspondence between Anton Kropatsch (1897–1971) and Adrienne Audrey G. Bennett (1892–1972),<sup>1</sup> covering the time period from May 25, 1955, to December 15, 1956.<sup>2</sup> Although both are largely forgotten today, in the 1950s Kropatsch and Bennett were well-known protagonists in the Anglo- and Austro-Buddhist landscape, respectively. In fact, it was thanks to Bennett that Kropatsch became the internationally most visible Austro-Buddhist from the late 1950s to the early 1960s, that is, the period where some of his works were published in Bennett’s translation in *The Maha Bodhi*.

Little is known of Bennett. She was born on March 23, 1892.<sup>3</sup> Hence, at the beginning of the correspondence she was fifty-two years old, based in London, married to Harold Bennett and mother of Yvonne Bennett, a ballet

---

1 The original letters are stored in the Vienna archives of the *Österreichische Buddhistische Religionsgesellschaft* (Austrian Buddhist Religious Society).

2 The whole correspondence according to the materials extant lasted from May 25, 1955, to November 25, 1967, when it stopped abruptly with Bennett no longer responding to Kropatsch’s letters (which are not extant).

3 I wish to thank Joseph Chadwin for securing information on Bennett’s life dates from the Civil Registration Index of Births, Marriages and Deaths for England and Wales at the London Metropolitan Archives.

dancer. According to her biographical note in *The Maha Bodhi*,<sup>4</sup> she had studied “Mathematics and Physics. Later changed to Painting, exhibiting frequently in London. Lived for 14 years in India and China.” During the Second World War, she “engaged in linguistic work; then on a history of the Development of Religious Thought” (Bennett 1954a: 215). From 1949 to 1952, she was the Librarian of the Buddhist Society, London, and from 1951 to 1952 editor of the Society’s journal *The Middle Way*.<sup>5</sup> Bennett was eventually ousted by the Society’s founder-cum-president Christmas Humphreys (1901–1983), as Sangharakshita reports: “Her association with the *Middle Way* – and the Buddhist Society – had not ended happily. Her efforts to upgrade the magazine intellectually had been frustrated by Christmas Humphreys’ determination to keep it popular. According to Jack Austin,<sup>6</sup> at that time a regular correspondent, there had been a stormy Council meeting at which Humphreys spoke to her so brutally that she left the room in tears” (Sangharakshita 2003: 44).<sup>7</sup> Sangharakshita (or Dennis Philip Edward Lingwood, 1925–2018), the later founder (1967) of the Friends of the Western Buddhist Order (renamed in 2010 to Triratna Buddhist Community), was made editorial board member of *The Maha Bodhi* in January 1954, yet effectively serving as the chief editor for ten years until July 1964. As he recalls, “The *Middle Way*’s loss had been the *Maha Bodhi*’s gain” (ibid.) inasmuch as he appointed Bennett to serve as Editorial Representative in Europe in 1955. From June 1956, Bennett formally acted as Editorial Representative in Europe and the Americas. Besides her own articles and book reviews, she solicited and translated works from French and German (Sangharakshita 2013: 66–67). It was in the former function that she approached Kropatsch, starting the decade-long correspondence. Sangharakshita would meet her for the first time in 1964, after having exchanged hundreds of letters over the years. He later reminisced (2003: 44): “On visiting her at her flat in Holland Park [in London], shortly after my return to England, I found a haggard-faced woman of sixty or thereabouts,

---

4 Launched in May 1892, *The Maha Bodhi* was the monthly of the Maha Bodhi Society founded by the Sri Lankan Anagārika Dharmapāla (Don David Hēvāvīrtarne; 1864–1933). For many decades, including the 1950s and 1960s when the correspondence between Kropatsch and Bennett took place, the journal was the most seminal international Buddhist journal.

5 The journal of the Buddhist Society, London was launched in October 1925 as *Buddhist Lodge Monthly Bulletin*. It was renamed to *Buddhism in England* in March 1926 and again to *The Middle Way* in 1945. On the Society’s history up to the late 1950s, see Oliver 1979: 49–56.

6 Austin (1917–1993) was an English Buddhist who later founded the Shin Buddhist Association of Great Britain.

7 In contrast, Humphreys stated plainly that Bennett “resigned over a matter of policy in the summer of 1952” (Humphreys 1956: 108).

wearing heavy make-up and with henna-dyed hair, who was bursting with nervous energy that evidently needed an outlet.” Bennett died in the summer of 1972 in Southend-on-Sea. She is known to parts of today’s Buddhist Studies community largely for her *Long Discourses of the Buddha (Digha-Nikaya I–XVI): Translation from the Pali with an Introduction* (Bennett 1964).

Anton Kropatsch was one of the chief figures of early post-World War II Austro-Buddhism. Although he was not a board member of the *Buddhistische Gesellschaft Wien* (Buddhist Society of Vienna), he regularly gave lectures and was overall held in high esteem by many members to whom he appeared somewhat like a patriarchal figure.<sup>8</sup> He was born in Vienna on November 27, 1897, to an Austrian father, a garden administrator, and a German mother, formerly a teacher at a Höhere Töchterchule in Frankfurt am Main. Later he studied medicine at the University of Vienna obtaining his doctorate in 1923. He went on to become an assistant doctor at Wilhelminenspital and specialised in dermatology. There he was appointed head of the lupus department in 1939, also serving as representative of the medical staff (1939–1943). Ultimately, in 1943, being a member of the NSDAP, he assumed the position of hospital director (Tragl 2007: 433, 461). Additionally, he was put in charge of lupus care for the whole of Austria. After the War, he was dismissed on grounds of his proximity to National Socialism. Kropatsch encountered Buddhism through the writings of Paul Dahlke<sup>9</sup> (1865–1928) and Karl Eugen

---

8 At the time of the correspondence covered in this article, the board of the Buddhist Society of Vienna—as per the election held on February 25, 1955—consisted of Fritz Hungerleider (President), Helmut Klar (Vice-President), Franz Zouzelka (Secretary), Johann Stepanovsky (Vice-Secretary), Angela Zouzelka (Treasurer), and Anna Zouzelka (Vice-Treasurer); and as per the election held on September 17, 1956: Hungerleider (President), Stepanovsky (Vice-President), Irma Baumann (Secretary), Lisbeth Darnhofer (Vice-Secretary), Angela Zouzelka (Treasurer), and Anna Zouzelka (Vice-Treasurer). Klar was elected Honorary President in the 1956 General Assembly. Notably, four out of the six board members were female.

9 Born in Osterode (East Prussia), Dahlke studied medicine in Berlin and subsequently ran a homeopathic clinic. In the 1890s, he became interested in Buddhism through reading Arthur Schopenhauer (1788–1860). While in Sri Lanka in 1900, he encountered lived Buddhism and came into contact with a number of learned monks, from that time on resolving to be a Buddhist. Three years later, he embarked on his vast publishing activities on Buddhism with *Aufsätze zum Verständnis des Buddhismus* (Essays for the Understanding of Buddhism) in two volumes. His copious oeuvre comprises twenty-four books, nearly 200 journal articles, 110 book reviews, twenty poems, and a number of translations. To facilitate the study of Buddhism in Europe, he attempted to found a lay monastery on the island of Sylt, but eventually abandoned this plan. Instead, between 1923 and 1926, he had built the Buddhistisches Haus in Berlin-Frohnau, the first Buddhist centre of its kind in Central Europe, where he also took residence. Fellow residents (among others, monks from Sri Lanka) had to observe specific rules of conduct. In many of his writings, Dahlke rationally

Neumann<sup>10</sup> (1865–1915) shortly after World War I. The former he met in Berlin and became his lifelong intellectual disciple. Following the Anschluss, he travelled several times to Berlin where he met other Dahlke disciples, especially Kurt Fischer (1892–1942) and his wife.<sup>11</sup> His dismissal eventually gave him the necessary time to embark on writing and lecturing (among others, at the Wiener Volkshochschule Margarten).<sup>12</sup> Additionally, in 1948, Kropatsch established a small circle of fellow Theravāda Buddhists who met regularly in his flat in the second district's Thugutstraße 4/14. His writings formed the nucleus of and were in turn continuously shaped by the group's discussions. A book manuscript (which however was never put into print as

---

examined Buddhism from the point of view of natural sciences. He also translated texts from Pāli and was active as a homeopathic writer. Kropatsch and Helmut Klar considered themselves disciples of Dahlke. A Buddhist critic of Dahlke was Seidenstücker's friend Georg Grimm, who represented a more emotional view of Buddhism. He also had followers in Austria, such as Rudolf Karl Fugger (1904–1986) and Josef Peer (1902–1991). For more information on Dahlke, see Baumann 1997. On Grimm, see Hecker 1996a: 40–61.

10 Born in Vienna, Neumann was the son of the tenor and opera impresario Angelo Neumann (1838–1910), who had converted from Judaism, and Pauline Aurelie (née Mihalovits; d. 1924), who came from a noble Hungarian family. Like many others, Neumann encountered Buddhism through the writings of Schopenhauer. In 1888, he married Kamilla (née Nordmann). He studied Indology in Berlin and received his Ph.D. from the University of Leipzig in 1891. In 1894, he journeyed to Sri Lanka where he encountered Buddhist life in practice. Neumann was the first to offer a German translation of the *Majjhimanikāya* (see note 95) in three volumes (1896–1902; see Neumann 1922a–c). In 1906, he lost all his money due to a bank collapse and had to interrupt his work until 1910. He lived a very secluded life. His best friend was the Italian geologist and Buddhist Giuseppe de Lorenzo (1871–1957). Only after Neumann's death did his work receive greater attention. Whereas his translations were heavily criticised by fellow Indologists, they were enthusiastically received by many poets, writers, and the later German-speaking Buddhist community. His *Die Reden Gotamo Buddhos* became core reading of the nascent Austro-Buddhist community. Surprisingly, his grave at the Wiener Zentralfriedhof fell into oblivion. Only forty years after his passing was it rediscovered by Fritz Hungerleider (see note 89). See Hecker 1986 for an extensive biographical treatment of Neumann.

11 See note 44.

12 Lectures held there included a series of lectures in 1952–1953 entitled “Die Lehre des Buddha” (The Teachings of Buddha) on “Buddha und der Buddhismus” (Buddha and Buddhism), “Die Wahrheit vom Leiden” (The Truth of Suffering), and “Die Wahrheit vom Weg der Leidensvernichtung” (The Truth of the Way of the Extinction of Suffering). The latter subject spanned altogether four lectures on ethics, salvation, rebirth, and *nibbāna*. In 1954–1955 he gave a talk on “Weltwissen und Weltweisheit in Europa und Asien. Durch Besinnung zur Erlösung (Buddha)” (World Knowledge and World Wisdom in Europe and Asia: Through Reflection to Salvation [Buddha]). See Österreichisches Volkshochschularchiv.

a whole and is not extant save for the preface<sup>13</sup> and the table of contents)<sup>14</sup> was finalised in 1953.<sup>15</sup> Ultimately, the Kropatsch circle merged with another group around Johann Stepanovsky<sup>16</sup> (1912–1977) and Helmut Klar<sup>17</sup> (1914–2007) forming the Buddhist Society of Vienna (Hecker 1996b: 163–165; Kropatsch 1953d: 1–3). Two heart attacks that Kropatsch suffered in November 1954 had him reduce his activities in the following years. He passed away in Vienna on March 22, 1971. In Kropatsch's obituary (Klar 1972), his friend of nearly twenty-five years, Helmut Klar, wrote:

He was particularly concerned to make it clear that the Teachings of the Buddha do not at all not contradict modern natural science and that they also have many parallels with the new philosophy. He compared Buddhist cosmology

---

13 The Preface of the book manuscript gives a good outline of Kropatsch's overall Buddhist project. For the original text and a translation, see Appendix II.

14 For the table of contents, see Appendix I.

15 Chapter Nine of the manuscript was published as an independent book in late 1957, with the title *Die letzte Freiheit des Menschen (Buddhas Lehre vom Nicht-Selbst)* (The Ultimate Freedom of Man [Buddha's Doctrine of Non-Self]) (Kropatsch 1957a). His second book, *Wiedergeburt und Erlösung in der Lehre des Buddha* (Rebirth and Salvation in the Teachings of Buddha) (Kropatsch 1963), was based on portions of Chapter Three of the manuscript. Moreover, several chapters were published independently.

16 An early-retired post office clerk and Dahlke connoisseur who turned to Buddhism around 1943 (see Klar 1978).

17 Born into a Protestant family in Goldberg, Silesia, Klar came to Buddhism in 1932 through Paul Dahlke's *Buddha. Auswahl aus dem Pāli-Kanon* (Buddha: Selection from the Pāli Canon; 1920). Soon afterwards, he made contact with practitioners in Wrocław (German: Breslau) and with the *Buddhistisches Haus* in Berlin-Frohnau. There he commenced his Pāli studies. From 1934, Klar studied medicine in Berlin and Vienna. At the beginning of World War II he was drafted into the German Wehrmacht and completed his doctorate in Berlin in 1943. The year before, he married Ernestine (née Konwitzka), a Catholic native of Klosterneuburg near Vienna, with whom he had two sons. In 1947, he returned from Soviet captivity and obtained an Austrian passport a year later. Living for a while at the outskirts of Vienna, Klar participated in efforts to establish a permanent Buddhist organisation alongside Johann Stepanovsky, whom he befriended in 1943 while serving in Albania, and Franz Opřchal (1900–1955) (see note 73). Thus he also met Kropatsch. In 1949, he moved with his family to Iran, where he worked as a doctor. He represented Austrian Buddhists at conferences of the World Fellowship of Buddhists in Tōkyō (1952) as well as Rangoon and Mandalay (1954). On his return journey to Europe in 1955–1956, he visited India and Sri Lanka. Klar settled in Heidelberg and worked for the pharmaceutical company Boehringer Mannheim, becoming a specialist in colour psychology. He retired in 1976. As a Buddhist, Klar was very well connected internationally. Although at home in Theravāda, he also had sympathies vis-à-vis other Buddhist traditions. In his later years, he and his wife developed a pronounced interest in Thailand. For detailed information on Klar, see Baumann 1995.

with the findings of Bavink<sup>18</sup> and Eddington.<sup>19</sup> In this way, he also facilitated the understanding of the Teachings for those who are too attached to the natural sciences. Kropatsch knew how to use the research results of C. G. Jung as an introduction to the anattâ doctrine and thus made connections from modern psychology to the timeless Teachings of the Buddha. However, despite all his knowledge of modern natural sciences and philosophical literature, he always drew on the oldest Pâli texts, which served him as the basis and starting point for his exposition of the Teachings. With spiritual freshness, Anton Kropatsch, who met his contemporaries with constant kindness, was a tireless herald of the Buddha's word. In his modest way, he became a role model for many – without knowing it. He was averse to showmanship and all outward appearances. He always had the core problem in mind: the realisation of the Dhamma here and now.<sup>20</sup>

The correspondence of Kropatsch and Bennett does not only familiarise us somewhat with their immediate lifeworlds, however limited this information may be. More so, it allows for interesting insights into the intellectual

---

18 The German natural philosopher and eugenicist Bernhard Bavink (1879–1947). Kropatsch referenced several of his writings in his books: *Ergebnisse und Probleme der Naturwissenschaften. Eine Einführung in die heutige Naturphilosophie* (Results and Problems of the Natural Science: An Introduction to Contemporary Natural Philosophy; 1914), *Die Hauptfragen der heutigen Naturphilosophie* (The Main Questions of Contemporary Natural Philosophy; 1928), and *Das Weltbild der heutigen Naturwissenschaft und seine Beziehungen zur Philosophie und Religion* (The World View of Today's Natural Science and Its Relations to Philosophy and Religion; 1947).

19 The English astrophysicist Arthur Stanley Eddington (1882–1944). Kropatsch referenced his *Das Weltbild der Physik und ein Versuch seiner philosophischen Deutung* (The World View of Physics and an Attempt at Its Philosophical Interpretation; 1931, the German edition of his 1928 volume *The Nature of the Physical World*) and *Philosophie der Naturwissenschaft* (1939, the German edition of his *The Philosophy of Physical Science*).

20 “Ein besonderes Anliegen war es ihm, klarzustellen, daß die Lehre des Buddha in keinerlei Widerspruch zur modernen Naturwissenschaft steht und außerdem viele Parallelen zur neuen Philosophie aufweist. Die buddhistische Kosmologie vergleiche [*sic*] er mit den Erkenntnissen eines Bavink und Eddington. So erleichterte er auch denjenigen das Verständnis der Lehre, die den Naturwissenschaften allzusehr verhaftet sind. Kropatsch verstand es, die Forschungsergebnisse von C.G. Jung als Einführung in die Anattâ-Lehre heranzuziehen und knüpfte so Verbindungen von der modernen Psychologie zur zeitlosen Lehre des Buddha. Bei aller Kenntnis der modernen Naturwissenschaften und der philosophischen Literatur orientierte er sich aber stets an den ältesten Pâli-Texten, die ihm als Grundlage und Ausgangspunkt für seine Lehrdarlegung dienten. Bei geistiger Frische war Anton Kropatsch, der seinen Mitmenschen mit stets gleichbleibender Güte begegnete, ein unermüdlicher Kunder des Buddha-Wortes. In seiner bescheidenen Art wurde er vielen zum Vorbild – ohne es zu wissen. Effekthascherei und alle Äußerlichkeiten waren ihm abhold. Er hatte immer das Kernproblem vor Augen: Die Verwirklichung des Dhamma hier und jetzt.”

mindset of two Euro-Buddhists, who were at the time relatively well-known to their peers in the United Kingdom and Austria, respectively—but also, to some extent, beyond thanks to their *Maha Bodhi* contributions. Kropatsch and Bennett are in fact representative of how many western (armchair) Buddhists approached Buddhism in the first half of the twentieth century. “Their Buddhism” was largely an intellectual enterprise in which they engaged almost exclusively with the Theravāda writings. Kropatsch and Bennett espoused intellectual elitism and cultural chauvinism, for their mission was to trace and convey the pristine nature of the Buddha’s teachings, which “would have dwindled into obscurity, if not into actual disgrace” if it were not predominantly for “the work of the Germans and British during the last century” as Bennett proudly averred (April 13, 1956). “Some of these S.E. Asians are awful people. [...] They are just unreliable” (Bennett to Kropatsch on July 6, 1956), harsh words indeed that are also, albeit less stridently, echoed by Kropatsch. “All the greater must be our efforts in Europe to preserve the teachings in their original simplicity and purity” (Kropatsch to Bennett on April 24, 1956), Kropatsch concludes.

The correspondence also sheds light on their engagement with the available sources and scholarship of the time. Lastly, for the scholar of Buddhism in Austria this is an intriguing document, for Kropatsch has been a figure that has not only faded away from the Austro-Buddhist consciousness but appeared hitherto merely a short reference in the scholarship.

## 2. Letters<sup>21</sup>

### 2.1. 1955

#### 2.1.1. Bennett to Kropatsch (May 25, 1955)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
25th May 1955

Dr. A. Kropatsch  
Thugutstr. 4  
Vienna II

---

<sup>21</sup> I would like to thank Patricia Sophie Mayer, who helped me in transcribing the letters.

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

I have just received a letter from Dr. Klar in which he states that he has written to you to the effect that any articles you may like to contribute to Maha Bodhi Journal should be sent direct to me. I shall be very pleased to receive them in due course.

With regard to “Der Durst und die Frage der Willensfreiheit” and “Buddha und der Kriegsminister”, the scripts of both are quite safe.<sup>22</sup> The former is already translated and I was proposing to send it to Calcutta for the July issue. The latter I intended to keep until I have finished a long Seidenstuecker work as it was the shortest of the three Dr. Klar sent me.<sup>23</sup> There would be a delay of about six months. Under the circumstances, and now that you have your own Journal in Vienna, would you rather I returned the Kriegsminister work and saved you space for a longer article?<sup>24</sup> It is exactly as you like; I can quite

---

22 The former (i.e., section 1 in chapter 2 of his unpublished book manuscript) was published as “‘Thirst’ and the Question of Free Will” in the 1955 August issue of *The Maha Bodhi* (see Kropatsch 1955d) in Bennett’s translation; the latter—section 10 of the first chapter in his book manuscript—was never to be published.

23 Born in Gerbstedt, Karl Bernhard Seidenstücker (1876–1936) was the son of a Protestant pastor. He studied medicine, Indology, and Religious Studies in Göttingen, Leipzig, and Halle. He formally turned to Buddhism in 1902. Under the pseudonym “Bruno Freydank,” he published critical essays on Christianity. In 1903, Seidenstücker was one of the founders of the *Buddhistische Missionsverein für Deutschland* (Buddhist Missionary Association for Germany) in Leipzig. There he established a Maha Bodhi centre in 1907 and, in 1911, the German branch of the British Maha Bodhi Society. He also (co-)edited several short-lived Buddhist journals and published several other works. In 1913, he received a Ph.D. at Leipzig University on the *Khuddaka Nikāya*’s *Udāna*. In 1921, together with the Bavarian lawyer Georg Grimm (1868–1945), he founded the *Buddhistische Gemeinde für Deutschland* (Buddhist Community for Germany) in Munich. Besides Karl Eugen Neumann, he was the only German-speaking Indologist at the time who was also a Buddhist. Yet, from the mid-1920s, he turned to Catholicism. For more information on Seidenstücker, see Steinke 1989.

24 The journal mentioned by Bennett is the *Zeitschrift der buddhistischen Gesellschaft Wien* (Journal of the Vienna Buddhist Society), launched in January 1955 and run for seven issues until April 1957. Hungerleider reportedly discontinued the journal because of financial challenges. In the preface (Zouzelka 1955b: 2–3), Franz Zouzelka provides the journal’s mission statement: “The ‘Buddhist Society’ in Vienna is the only one of its kind currently existing in Austria, and all Buddhist schools are recognised in it. If we now start to publish our own journal, we must remain aware of the fact that it is the only Buddhist journal published in Austria and must not from the outset commit ourselves to a certain tradition, as this would entail that we deny our help to some individuals who are Buddhists and who are striving towards the goal assigned by Buddha. [...] On the other hand, it goes without saying that in our journal, the tradition that is most widely represented in our Society will primarily get the chance to speak, namely Theravāda. Apart from our own essays, we also want to publish contributions from other communities, and we are particularly keen to publish essays by members of Buddhist orders, in order to maintain a connection, at least



well keep it and send it to Calcutta towards the end of the year if you prefer. At the same time, “Die Mutationen der modernen Biologie und die Wiedergeburt des Buddhismus” was so very outstanding and has been so very well received that you might decide to withdraw the shorter work and send a more distinctive one.<sup>25</sup>

With best wishes

Yours sincerely

A. A. G. Bennett

(Editorial Representative in Europe of Maha Bodhi Journal)

## 2.1.2. Kropatsch to Bennett (June 1, 1955)

### *Translation*

---

in this way, with the order founded by Buddha, the Sangha. In addition, the Journal will regularly include the programme of our Society, and we will also always publish interesting announcements. Let us hope that this journal, although small in scope, will contribute to the further spread of the Dhamma at home, for the salvation of many and for the blessing of many” (Die ‘Buddhistische Gesellschaft’ in Wien ist die einzige dieser Art, die gegenwärtig in Österreich besteht, und es werden in ihr alle buddhistischen Schulen anerkannt. Wenn wir nun daran gehen, eine eigene Zeitschrift herauszugeben, so müssen wir uns dessen bewusst bleiben, dass es eben die einzige buddhistische Zeitschrift ist, die in Österreich erscheint und dürfen uns nicht von vornherein auf eine bestimmte Richtung festlegen, würden wir doch dadurch somanchem [*sic*], der Buddhist ist und dem von Buddha zugewiesenen Ziel zustrebt, unsere Hilfe versagen. [...] Es ist aber andererseits auch selbstverständlich, dass in unserer Zeitschrift in erster Linie diejenige Richtung zu Worte kommt, die in unserer Gesellschaft am meisten vertreten wird, nämlich Theravāda. Ausser eigenen Aufsätzen wollen wir auch Beiträge anderer Gemeinden veröffentlichen und besonders gerne werden wir Abhandlungen buddhistischer Ordensmitglieder bringen, um so wenigstens auf diesem Wege eine Verbindung zu dem von Buddha gegründeten Orden, dem Sangha, aufrechtzuhalten. Ausserdem wird in der Zeitschrift regelmässig das Programm unserer Gesellschaft erscheinen, wie wir auch interessante Mitteilungen immer veröffentlichen werden. Wollen wir nun hoffen, dass diese Zeitschrift, wenn auch klein im Umfang in der Ausführung, doch dazu beiträgt, den Dhamma weiter in unserer Heimat zu verbreiten, vielen zum Heil und vielen zum Segen). Signifying his status as a well-respected connoisseur of Theravāda within the Vienna community, the twelve-page journal issue also features a four-page essay by Kropatsch on the “Tenets of Buddhism” (Kropatsch 1955b).

<sup>25</sup> Bennett’s translation of the text with the title “The Mutations of Modern Biology and the ‘Rebirth’ of Buddhism” was published in the 1955 January issue of *The Maha Bodhi* (see Kropatsch 1955c). The article was taken from Kropatsch’s book manuscript (see below) where it appeared as the sixth of ten sections in the third chapter.

Vienna, 1 June 1955

To Mrs A. A. G. Bennett  
 9. Norland Square Mansions  
 Holland Park, London W.II

Dear Madam!<sup>26</sup>

I received your letter of 25 May, for which I cordially thank you, as well as for the issue of the *Maha Bodhi Journal* in which my work on Mutations appeared and which arrived via Berlin. I was very pleased that you liked my little work and considered it worthy of such an excellent translation and publication. This work, as well as the one on Free Will that Dr. Klar sent you, are individual chapters from a larger work that I have entitled “*Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas*,”<sup>27</sup> in which I tried to give a systematic structure of the teaching adding my own reflections to the main points of the teaching. Last year I completed a likewise extensive commentary on the first discourse of *Digha-Nikaya*,<sup>28</sup> on the Discourse on the “*Prachtnetz*,”<sup>29</sup> trying to show that in this Discourse we possess a treasure trove regarding the most diverse connections of Buddhism to modern philosophical, religious, and scientific questions of the Occident. From this work I intend—if it suits you—to select a chapter dealing with the body-soul problem in Buddhism and modern psychology and to send it to you in a form suitable for publication.

In the midst of another work, I was struck by two severe heart thromboses in November last year and have been physically and mentally unable to work until now. I am only now slowly beginning to recover and hope to be soon capable of working at the typewriter again. Yet, I will probably have to give up my medical profession, as I do not feel able to cope with the severe challenges my profession presents to my overall fitness.

I have written considerably about Buddhism in the last ten years. It would of course be nice if one or another of my works could be published, be it in

---

<sup>26</sup> Literally, “My Gracious Lady.”

<sup>27</sup> Reflections on the Buddha’s Discourses.

<sup>28</sup> The *Dīghanikāya* (Collection of Long Discourses) is the first of five collections contained in the *Suttapiṭaka* of the *Tiṇṇakāya* or Pāli Canon.

<sup>29</sup> By *Prachtnetz* (Net of Splendour) Kropatsch refers to the *Brahmajālasutta* (Discourse on Brahmā’s Net), the first *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*. He draws on Paul Dahlke’s *Buddha. Auswahl aus dem Palikanon* (Buddha: Selections from the Pali Canon; 1921). See Dahlke 1921: 242–317. This “extensive commentary,” whose draft version Kropatsch completed in 1953 comprising some 550 pages, has never been published in its entirety—only parts of it have. Kropatsch contacted various publishers, and also sent the manuscript twice to Ñāṇaponika Mahāthera (see note 188).

German or in English translation, but my attempts so far in Austria and Germany have been without success. Perhaps you, dear Madam, could give me some advice. I would be happy to send you a summary of some of my works for your orientation. Provided it seems suitable to you, you can at some point publish the chapter on Buddha's conversation with the Minister of War. I leave this entirely to your decision.

I ask you to inform me whether you wish to receive the work on the body-soul problem and remain with my best regards and wishes for your well-being.

Your devoted Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Vienna, II Thugutstrasse 4/14

PS: When publishing my essays, please always put "Vienna" after my name.

*Original*

Wien, 1. Juni 1955

Frau A.A.G. Bennett  
9. Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich erhielt Ihr Schreiben vom 25.5, für das ich Ihnen herzlich danke, wie auch für die Nummer der Maha Bodhi Zeitschrift, in welcher meine Arbeit über Mutationen erschienen ist und die via Berlin in meine Hände kam. Ich freute mich sehr darüber, dass meine kleine Arbeit Ihnen gefallen hat und Sie diese einer so ausgezeichneten Uebersetzung und der Publikation für wert erachtet haben. Diese Arbeit wie auch jene über die Willensfreiheit, die Ihnen Dr. Klar übermittelt hat, sind einzelne Kapitel aus einem grösseren Werk, das ich "Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas" genannt habe, in welchem ich einen systematischen Aufbau der Lehre zu geben versuchte und den Hauptpunkten der Lehre eigene Betrachtungen anschloss. Im vergangenen Jahr habe ich ein ebenfalls umfangreicheres Kommentarwerk zur ersten Rede des Digha-Nikaya, zur Rede vom "Prachtnetz" fertig gestellt und zu zeigen versucht, dass wir in dieser Rede eine Fundgrube für die mannigfachsten Beziehungen des Buddhismus zur modernen philosophischen, religiösen und wissenschaftlichen Fragen des Abendlandes besitzen. Aus diesem Werke gedenke ich, wenn es Ihnen passt, ein Kapitel, welches das Leib-Seele-Problem im Buddhismus und in der modernen Psychologie behandelt, auszuwählen und Ihnen in einer zur Veröffentlichung geeigneten Form zu schicken.

Mitten in einer weiteren Arbeit wurde ich im November vorigen Jahres von zwei schweren Herzthrombosen heimgesucht und bin bis jetzt physisch und psychisch arbeitsunfähig gewesen. Erst jetzt beginne ich mich langsam zu erholen und hoffe bald auch wieder an der Schreibmaschine arbeiten zu können. Meinen ärztlichen Beruf werde ich aber wahrscheinlich aufgeben müssen, da ich mich den schweren Anforderungen, die derselbe an meine Leistungsfähigkeit stellt, nicht gewachsen fühle.

Ich habe in den letzten 10 Jahren sehr viel über Buddhismus geschrieben. Es wäre natürlich schön, wenn das eine oder andere Werk, sei es in deutscher Sprache oder in englischer Uebersetzung erscheinen könnte, doch waren meine bisherigen Versuche in Oesterreich und Deutschland ohne Erfolg. Vielleicht können Sie, verehrte gnädige Frau, mir einen Rat geben, ich bin gerne bereit, Ihnen zur Orientierung die Inhaltsangabe des einen oder anderen Werkes zu senden. Das Kapitel über das Gespräch Buddhas mit dem Kriegsmünister können Sie, wenn es Ihnen geeignet erscheint, gelegentlich veröffentlichen, ich überlasse das vollkommen Ihrer Entscheidung.

Ich bitte Sie um Nachricht, ob Sie die Zusendung der Arbeit über das Leib-Seele-Problem wünschen und verbleibe mit den besten Grüßen und Wünschen für Ihr Wohlergehen

Ihr ergebener Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

N.S. Bei Veröffentlichungen bitte ich hinter meinem Namen immer 'Wien' zu setzen.

### 2.1.3. Bennett to Kropatsch (June 8, 1955)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
8th June 1955

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Wien II  
Thugutstrasse 4/14

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your kind letter of 1st June. I am so sorry to learn that you have been so ill and I do hope that you will take care of yourself. Don't try to begin doing things too soon! (How often must you have said that to your patients!)

About the commentary to the Brahmajala Sutta. I should be delighted to have as much of it as you care to send me and this particular moment is most opportune. Since last July I have had, running in serial form (in Maha Bodhi Journal), excerpts from the first sixteen Suttas of the Digha Nikaya.<sup>30</sup> These have been arranged so that the actual Teaching is in direct translation and the narration in short paraphrase. In a short foreword I said that the framework of the Buddha's teaching was contained in these suttas and that it was progressively arranged therein; I suggested that this was the reason that these particular suttas were placed first in the recitations and in the compilation of the Dhamma. I proposed to give a summing up at the end of the 15th Sutta,<sup>31</sup> the 16th being the Maha Parinibbana – the natural ending – and also largely retrospective.<sup>32</sup> So far we have reached the Kassapa Sutta,<sup>33</sup> No. 8, in the Feb, or March issue. In accordance with the general reception I had thought of publishing the whole in the *Wisdom of the East* series,<sup>34</sup> small volumes which cost only a few shillings and which are confined entirely to translations of Oriental classics and the works of Oriental philosophers of world-rank, but it is first necessary that the excerpts should appear in Maha Bodhi in order to establish that the translations are satisfactory. If some of your commentary could come into MB, and if the two works fit as they should, I don't see why both should not go on together to a joint publication.<sup>35</sup>

With regard to publishing in general, I think our difficulties are probably the same as yours. There are not enough Buddhists to provide a buying public, and non-Buddhists are only attracted if a volume provides an accompanying interest, as, for example, modern scientific research or comparative religion. The first is much too difficult as it means breaking down two technical languages, but the second is a more likely proposition in that there is a certain

---

30 See Bennett 1954b–e and Bennett 1955a and 1955b for the texts published at the time of the letter. Her translations draw on the Pāli text presented in Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1949. The remaining portions of her selected translations of the *Dīghanikāya* are Bennett 1955c–e and 1956c–f.

31 So she did in Bennett 1956d.

32 The sixteenth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya* is the *Mahāparinibbānasuttanta* (Discourse on the Great Parinibbāna). See Bennett 1956e and 1956f.

33 She refers to the eighth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*, the *Kassapasīhanādasutta* (Discourse on the Lion's Roar of Kassapa). Notably, she effectively omitted a translation of the *sutta*. In Bennett 1955a she deals with the seventh *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*, the *Jāliyasutta* (Discourse on Jāliya), whereas in Bennett 1955b she continues with the ninth *sutta*, the *Poṭṭhapādasutta* (Discourse on Poṭṭhapāda).

34 A seminal series launched in 1904 by Orient Press in London and subsequently operated by John Murray. Ultimately, Bennett published her translation in 1964 in India (see Bennett 1964).

35 This never transpired.

interest already existing. From what I have seen of Buddhist Societies in general, though they do an excellent work they will never by themselves [*sic*] bring Buddhism before the general public. Someone has to educate the public taste for literature and that takes time. On the other hand, from experience of the Libraries I should say that the case is by no means hopeless, unless, of course, one tries to “plant” Buddhism with an ill-considered hand. If, at your leisure, you could let me have a sketch of the contents of others of your works, I should be very pleased to make any suggestions I could concerning them. In the meantime I will keep the Kriegsminister until I hear from you about the Brahmajāla commentary. Please do not hurry; there is plenty of time and you do not want to make yourself ill again.

With best wishes  
Yours sincerely  
A. A. G. Bennett

PS: I will see that “Wien” is put after your name in all publications of your texts.<sup>36</sup>

#### 2.1.4. Bennett to Kropatsch (July 9, 1955)<sup>37</sup>

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
9th July 1955

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your very kind and interesting letter of 30th June. The Brahmajāla Commentary seems a wonderful piece of work and I suggest the following concerning it. Give a translation – not necessarily full-length, in view of the tedious interpolations on the Minor Moralities, but a very substantial portion – of the Sutta, and (perhaps) add a few paragraphs showing its importance to the Buddhist Teachings and Buddhist Philosophy. This would extend the prospective circle of readers to educated non-Buddhists and would give the immediate aspect of a comparison, or link-up, of Indian and modern Western philosophy. I think that with such a mode of presentation many first-class publishers would be definitely interested. I will send you my excerpts of the Dīgha as soon as I can assemble the carbon copies and available printed issues, the early ones probably at the end of this week, but the B-

---

<sup>36</sup> Handwritten addition.

<sup>37</sup> Kropatsch's letter to Bennett from June 30, 1955, is not extant.

J. section is here purposely cut to a minimum because much of it – notably the states of Arūpa Consciousnesses<sup>38</sup> – was already known to the Brahmins who had even thought to have attained Enlightenment thereby. I drew attention to these temporary omissions, stating that the matters would be dealt with later in the translations where they were treated in detail, e. g. in the Mahāpadāna and Mahā-Nidāna Suttas (nos. I4 & I5).<sup>39</sup> In the projected volume these passages would have to go back into the B.-J., but that is only a matter of rearrangement. It would also be advisable to emphasise – as I have done in my summing-up of the first I6 Suttas – the value of the B.-J. as an exposition of Indian thought in the 6th century B.C. and one's reasons for taking the Sutta as the basis of comparison for Eastern and Western thought. That puts the whole matter on a universal rather than on what – to the general public – might seem to be a sectarian basis. Incidentally, the more I read for Comparative Religion – and I have done a good deal the last few months – the more I feel convinced that the above is the only way to draw the high-level thought to the Teachings of the Buddha. And of what value are the vague ruminations of the mob if the higher levels of thought are not in advance to lead them?

When you have had time to look through the Excerpts, if you like the translations and if you think anything of the above suggestions, I should like very much to see your whole script. I could then present it suitable publishers, with necessary additions of the Sutta as detailed and approved by you, with a specimen translation of a chapter.

There is also the matter of the other Discourses you have taken for commentary – whether they include any more of the First Sixteen of the Dīgha or whether it would be necessary to make more translations. Incidentally, much of the Foreword to my series would be cut out as it is suitable only for the MBJ issues; for example, it would be unwise to say anything about building up the whole Buddhist Teachings as from the Sixteen in question if we were meaning to make use of others. In any case, the present aim would be to present a comparison of Western and Indian thought. But such things can be adjusted later; the first thing would be to get a fuller translation of the B.J. text, emphasising such parts as I.28-34 and perhaps adding a note to show that the sutta in the form in which it has come down to us is obviously incomplete – reason: that the titles suggested by the Buddha (III. 74) indicates a content not obvious from the former Pāli text. A thought on the B.J. Sūtra of

---

38 Here Bennett refers to the notion of *arūpāvacarajhāna*, that is, four states of immaterial meditative absorption.

39 The *Mahāpadānasutta* (Discourse on the Great Legend) is the fourteenth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*, followed by the *Mahānidānasutta* (Great Discourse on Causation).

the Mahāyāna – I will send you the typescript of this also – might not come amiss.

Thank you also very much for Das Leib-Seele Problem in der modernen Psychologie und im Buddhismus which I look forward to translating with much pleasure.<sup>40</sup> Der “Durst” und die Frage der Willensfreiheit has gone into the July issue and we should get the copies here about the end of August.

I am so glad you are a little better in health but I realise all it must have meant to you to give up your professional work. “When one door shuts another door always opens”, but it seems so often that the only interesting door is the one that has just shut. Still, things do work out in a most amazing way – up till just before the war we were always travelling about, had two years in India and twelve in China besides holidays in Canada, trips to Venezuela and Portugal, and I could not imagine myself settling down in England. I think the thought of going up to the City every day troubled my husband a lot – but now the life does not seem so circumscribed as the old one.<sup>41</sup> The money question is distressing – or could be if one let it – if only for the reason of the ever-increasing cost of living, but, as with so many other matters, that which appeared to be a prop turns out to be a broken reed while the support comes to be something one had never dreamt of. At least that it [*sic*] how it has often seemed to us.

With every best wishes to you and – if I may send them – to Mrs Kropatsch<sup>42</sup>

Yours sincerely

A. A. G. Bennett

### 2.1.5. Bennett to Kropatsch (July 15, 1955)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
15th July 1955

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Herewith copies of the translations of the excerpts from the Brahma-Jāla and Sāmañña-Phala Suttas.<sup>43</sup> Please do not trouble to return them.

---

40 The English translation entitled “The Body-Soul Problem in Modern Psychology and in Buddhism” was published in the 1956 May issue of *The Maha Bodhi* (see Kropatsch 1956). The German text was probably based on the sub-chapter “Die menschliche ‘Persönlichkeit’ und das Leib-Seele-Problem” (Human ‘Personality’ and the Body-Soul Problem) in his unpublished book manuscript *Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas*.

41 Harold Bennett, who died on cancer in the 1960s.

42 That is, Kropatsch’s wife Marit.

43 Bennett’s translation of portions of the *Sāmaññaphalasutta* (Discourse on the Fruits of Mendicancy), the second *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*, are found in Bennett 1954c. Her



I am so sorry I have not had time to type them afresh for you, but the plea is always the same: lack of man-hours!

I hope your health continues to improve.

Yours sincerely

A. A. G. Bennett

## 2.1.6. Kropatsch to Bennett (July 27, 1955)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

Vienna, 27 July 1955

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your kind letter of 9 July and for sending me the translations and commentaries of the first two speeches of Digha-Nikaya, which I read with great interest and which I consider excellent. Yet, frankly speaking, being influenced by P. Dahlke and K. E. Neumann, I am more inclined towards a translation of the texts that is as unabridged as possible. Even though I may call myself a disciple of Dahlke, whose *Buddhistisches Haus* in Berlin-Frohnau I have visited several times and with whose student Fischer<sup>44</sup> I have had a lively exchange of ideas in person and through letters, I also appreciate the aesthetic subtleties of Neumann's translations, whose translation of Buddha's discourses has been compared with Luther's translation of the Bible. Dahlke's and Neumann's translations appeared to me to be so excellent that I refrained from any translation attempts myself and only

---

translational attempt of parts of the *Brahmajālasutta*, the first *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*, are contained in Bennett 1954b.

44 Born and bred in Berlin, Kurt Fischer turned to Buddhism in 1918 through a book by Paul Dahlke. He retired as a civil servant in 1924 because of a lung condition. In the same year, he married the payroll clerk Elisabeth Knoll (1894–1994) and moved with her to the Buddhist centre established by Dahlke in Berlin-Frohnau. He occasionally worked as an alternative practitioner. After disputes with Dahlke's sister Bertha (1866–1947), the couple moved together with Lavinia, Countess of Monts (1879–1947), into a timber cottage not far from the *Buddhistisches Haus*. Fischer published the journal "Buddhistisches Leben und Denken" (Buddhist Life and Thought), in which he also published many of his own articles and book reviews. In 1942, he received the news that he would have to discontinue the journal due to a lack of paper. He passed away in Berlin shortly thereafter. Subsequently, the Gestapo arranged for the existing copies of the journal to be destroyed. See Hecker 1996a: 30–40.

occasionally used the translations by Franke,<sup>45</sup> Geiger,<sup>46</sup> Oldenberg,<sup>47</sup> or Seidenstücker<sup>48</sup> in my work on Buddhism. Because Buddha's Discourses were frequently read aloud in the circle of my Buddhist friends in Vienna, they retained for me the character of the spoken rather than the written word, and I learned that it is indeed the repetitions that are suitable for conveying the teaching to the listener's ear as emphatically as possible and thus anchoring it in the memory. Incidentally, there is a passage in the preface to Neumann's translation of the *Mittlere Sammlung*<sup>49</sup> that is worth reading on the beauty and value of these repetitions.<sup>50</sup> This is certainly not to say that certain contractions of the texts should not be attempted, but they must be done very carefully and kept within the limits where the spoken word can have the right effect.

Thus, in my opinion, the frame narrative to the Discourse of the "Reward of Atonement"<sup>51</sup> gives such a clear picture of the mindset of both the Buddha's monks and his aristocratic followers that it seems to me almost more effective for the listener than the conversation itself. This may sound paradoxical, but I am sure you understand what I mean. However, for the mere reading of the Discourses other laws apply and your method of rendering is probably the best.

---

45 Rudolf Otto Franke (1862–1928) was a German Indologist. Kropatsch refers to Franke's *Dīghanikāya. Das Buch der langen Texte des buddhistischen Kanons* (Dīghanikāya: The Book of the Long Texts of the Buddhist Canon; 1913).

46 Wilhelm Ludwig Geiger (1856–1943) was a German Orientalist, well-known to the Buddhist community, among others, for his *Dīpavaṃsa und Mahāvaṃsa und die geschichtliche Überlieferung in Ceylon* (Dīpavaṃsa and Mahāvaṃsa and the Historical Transmission in Ceylon; 1905) and his two-volume *Samyutta-Nikāya. Die in Gruppen geordnete Sammlung aus dem Pāli-Kanon der Buddhisten* (Samyutta-Nikāya: The Collection from the Pāli Canon of the Buddhists, Arranged in Groups; 1925 and 1930).

47 Kropatsch refers to the eminent German Indologist Hermann Oldenberg (1854–1920), whose *Buddha. Sein Leben, seine Lehre, seine Gemeinde* (Buddha: His Life, His Teaching, His Community; 1881) was a seminal work in the early-day Buddhist Studies scholarship. Here, Kropatsch alludes to Oldenberg's posthumously published *Reden des Buddha. Lehre/Verse/Erzählungen* (Discourses of the Buddha: Teaching/Verse/Stories; 1922).

48 He refers to Seidenstücker's *Pāli-Buddhismus in Übersetzungen. Texte aus dem buddhistischen Pāli-Kanon und dem Kammavācam* (Pāli Buddhism in Translations: Texts from the Buddhist Pāli Canon and the Kammavācam; 1911).

49 See Neumann 1922a–c.

50 See R. E. 1922: xvi–xviii.

51 Again following Dahlke's translation (Dahlke 1921: 517–574), "Discourse of the 'Reward of Atonement'" (*Rede vom "Lohn der Büsserschaft"*) refers to the *Sāmaññaphalasutta*.

May I interject a small philological question? In the Discourse of the “Prachtnetz,” when describing the views of the Eternalists, you translate: “Then my consciousness died down, arising again in such-and-such a place,”<sup>52</sup> while Dahlke translates this passage: “Having disappeared from here, I emerged there,”<sup>53</sup> without mentioning a “consciousness.” Neumann’s translation also agrees with that of Dahlke in meaning.<sup>54</sup> Which translation comes closest to a literal translation of the Pali text? You will understand my interest when you see from my “Betrachtungen zum Brahmajala Sutta” that the problem raised here has particularly preoccupied me. In the end, I followed Dahlke’s interpretation, but I must confess that it does not satisfy me completely.

After you have expressed your kind consent, I have taken the liberty of attaching a copy of my work “Das Prachtnetz. Betrachtungen zu einer Rede Buddhas.”<sup>55</sup> I have based these reflections, which only refer to a part of the Discourse, on Dahlke’s translation. The introductory sentences (the first one and a half pages) highlight the significance of the Discourse for occidental philosophy and seem to correspond roughly to what you suggested as an Introduction. Regarding content, my reflections would make for a supplement to your commentary since they deal with that part of the Discourse which you have only briefly summarised. Provided you really take the trouble to read my work, which I cannot say whether it is worth reading, you will see what my intention was: a critical examination of various religious, philosophical, and scientific problems that still move us in the occident today, even if they were not raised for the first time in our time but had their precursors already in the time of Buddha, and their confrontation with the three basic ideas of Buddhism: *anatta*, rebirth, *nibbana*.<sup>56</sup> These three major themes of Buddhist philosophy, in my opinion, obtain a much sharper profile when held against the multi-coloured background of the other views. If you want to show my work to a publisher, you are, of course, completely free to do so, and I would be much obliged, as well as for the translation of a chapter that seems suitable to you. If, however, you do not consider the work suitable for publication – let alone because of its length – I would ask you for your frank assessment while returning it to me at your convenience.

My health status is essentially unaltered. I suffer from the summer heat and stuffy air and welcome every cool day. Sadly, I have no way of getting outdoors as I live on the top floor of an apartment building without a lift and

---

52 See Bennett 1954b: 252.

53 See Dahlke 1921: 258.

54 See Neumann 1922a: 48 (“dort verschieden trat ich anderswo wieder ins Dasein”).

55 This work is not extant. Only portions of it have been published.

56 No-self or *anattā* (Pāli; Sanskrit: *anātman*), *saṃsāra* (cycle of rebirth), and *nibbāna* (Pāli; Sanskrit: *nirvāṇa*).

cannot possibly manage the stairs. This isolation hits my wife and me all the harder because, until my sudden illness, which overtook me out of perfect health, we had made many beautiful tours and hikes together. The three weeks of summer holidays, which we almost always spent in the Alpine mountains, were the great celebration of the year. However, we are glad that by now I have overcome the worst and am out of immediate danger.

Once again, many and heartfelt thanks for your letters and mailings, and best wishes to you and your husband for your well-being and holidays. My wife and I send you, dear madam, our best regards, I remain respectfully

Your devoted A. Kropatsch

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

Wien, 27. 7. 55

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen herzlich für Ihren freundlichen Brief vom 9.7., sowie für die Uebersendung der Uebersetzungen und Kommentare der beiden ersten Reden des Digha-Nikaya, die ich mit grossem Interesse las und die ich für ausgezeichnet halte. Doch bin ich – wenn ich offen sprechen darf –, von P. Dahlke und K. E. Neumann beeinflusst, mehr auf eine möglichst ungekürzte Wiedergabe der Texte eingestellt. Wenn ich mich auch als Schüler Dahlkes bezeichnen darf, dessen buddhistisches Haus in Berlin-Frohnau ich mehrmals besucht habe und mit dessen Schüler Fischer ich in regem persönlichen und brieflichen Gedankenaustausch stand, so weiss ich doch auch die ästhetischen Feinheiten der Neumann'schen Uebertragungen zu würdigen, dessen Uebersetzung der Reden Buddhas man mit der Uebersetzung der Bibel durch Luther verglichen hat. Dahlke's und Neumann's Uebertragungen nun erschienen mir als so ausgezeichnet, dass ich von allen eigenen Uebersetzungsversuchen Abstand nahm und auch nur gelegentlich die Uebertragungen von Franke, Geiger, Oldenberg oder Seidenstücker bei meinen Arbeiten über Buddhismus heranzog. Dadurch, dass im Kreise meiner buddhistischen Freunde in Wien Reden Buddhas sehr oft vorgelesen wurden, haben sie für mich den Charakter des gesprochenen und nicht des geschriebenen Wortes beibehalten und ich habe es gelernt, dass gerade die Wiederholungen dazu geeignet sind, die Lehre dem Ohr des Hörers möglichst eindringlich einzuprägen und so im Gedächtnis zu verankern. Ueber die Schönheit und den Wert dieser Wiederholungen steht übrigens eine lesenswerte Stelle im Vorwort zu Neumann's Uebersetzung der "Mittleren Sammlung". Das soll sicher

nicht sagen, dass nicht gewisse Zusammenziehungen der Texte versucht werden sollen, doch müssen diese sehr vorsichtig angewandt werden und jene Grenze einhalten, in welcher das gesprochene Wort die richtige Wirkung entfalten kann.

So gibt meiner Meinung nach die Rahmenerzählung zur Rede vom “Lohn der Büsserschaft” ein so klares Bild von der Geisteshaltung sowohl der Mönche Buddhas als auch seiner adeligen Anhänger, dass sie mir für den Hörer fast wirkungsvoller erscheint als das Gespräch selbst. Das mag paradox klingen, aber Sie verstehen sicher, wie ich es meine. Für die blosser Lektüre der Reden allerdings gelten andere Gesetze und da dürfte Ihre Art der Uebertragung wohl die beste sein.

Darf ich eine kleine philologische Frage einschalten? Sie uebersetzten in der Rede vom “Prachtnetz” bei Schilderung der Ansichten der Ewigkeitsbekenner: “Then my consciousness died down, arising again in such-and-such a place”, während Dahlke diese Stelle uebersetzt: “Von da entschwunden tauchte ich dort auf”, ohne eines “Bewusstseins” Erwähnung zu tun; auch die Uebertragung Neumann’s stimmt sinngemäss mit der Dahlkes überein. Welche Uebersetzung nun kommt einer möglichst wörtlichen Uebertragung des Pali-Textes am nächsten? Sie werden mein Interesse verstehen, wenn Sie aus meinen “Betrachtungen zum Brahmajala Sutta” sehen werden, dass mich das hiermit aufgeworfene Problem besonders beschäftigt hat. Ich habe mich schliesslich der Auslegung Dahlkes angeschlossen, doch muss ich gestehen, dass mich diese nicht vollkommen befriedigt.

Ich habe mir erlaubt, nachdem Sie Ihre freundliche Zustimmung ausgesprochen haben, mit gleicher Post eine Durchschrift meiner Arbeit “Das Prachtnetz. Betrachtungen zu einer Rede Buddhas” zu übersenden. Ich habe diese Betrachtungen, die sich nur auf einen Teil der Rede beziehen, die Uebersetzung Dahlkes zugrunde gelegt. Die einleitenden Sätze (die ersten einund einhalb Seiten) heben die Bedeutung der Rede für die abendländische Philosophie hervor und dürften ungefähr dem entsprechen, was Sie als Einführung angeregt haben. Inhaltlich würden meine Betrachtungen eine Ergänzung Ihres Kommentars abgeben, da sie jenen Teil der Rede behandeln, der von Ihnen nur kurz inhaltlich zusammengefasst wurde. Wenn Sie sich wirklich die Mühe nehmen sollten, meine Arbeit zu lesen, von der ich nicht sagen kann, ob sie der Lektüre wert ist, so werden Sie sehen, welche Absicht ich mit ihr verfolgte: Eine kritische Auseinandersetzung mit verschiedenen religiösen, philosophischen und wissenschaftlichen Problemen, die uns im Abendland auch heute noch bewegen, selbst wenn sie nicht in unserer Zeit zum erstenmal aufgeworfen wurden, sondern ihre Vorläufer schon zur Zeit Buddhas hatten, und ihre Konfrontierung mit den drei Grundgedanken des Buddhismus, Anatta, Wiedergeburt, Nibbana. Diese drei Hauptthemen der buddhistischen

Philosophie erhalten meiner Meinung nach ein viel schärferes Profil, wenn sie gegen den vielfarbigen Hintergrund der übrigen Ansichten gehalten werden. Wenn Sie meine Arbeit einem Verleger zeigen wollen, so haben Sie natürlich vollkommen freie Hand und ich wäre Ihnen sehr dankbar dafür, wie auch für die Uebersetzung eines Ihnen geeignet erscheinenden Kapitels. Sollten Sie die Arbeit jedoch – schon wegen ihres Umfanges – nicht für eine Veröffentlichung für geeignet halten, so bitte ich Sie um Ihr offenes Urteil und die gelegentliche Rücksendung.

Mein Gesundheitszustand ist im Wesentlichen unverändert; ich habe unter der sommerlichen Hitze und Schwüle zu leiden und begrüße jeden kühlen Tag. Leider habe ich keine Möglichkeit ins Freie zu kommen, da ich in dem oberen Stockwerk eines Zinshauses ohne Lift wohne und die Stiegen unmöglich bewältigen kann. Meine Frau und mich trifft dieses Abgeschlossenensein umso härter, als wir bis zu meiner plötzlichen Erkrankung, die mich aus völliger Gesundheit ereilte, viele schöne Touren und Wanderungen zusammen gemacht haben; die drei Wochen des Sommerurlaubes, die wir fast immer im Hochgebirge verbrachten, waren das grosse Fest des Jahres. Aber wir sind froh, dass [*sic*] es jetzt soweit ist, dass ich wenigstens aus dem Aergsten und einer unmittelbaren Gefahr heraus bin.

Haben Sie nochmals vielen und herzlichen Dank für Ihre Briefe und Sendungen und nehmen Sie und Ihr Herr Gemahl die besten Wünsche für Ihr Wohlergehen und Ihre Ferien. Meine Frau und ich senden Ihnen, geehrte gnädige Frau, die besten Grüsse, mit denen ich verbleibe

Ihr ergebener A. Kropatsch

### 2.1.7. Bennett to Kropatsch (August 3, 1955)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
3rd August 1955

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Wien, II  
Thugutstr. 4/14

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of the 27th and for your script which was delivered the following day.

I understand very well that if you are accustomed to hearing and reading the Discourses at full length and in a particular translation that no other rendering could mean the same to you as regards the spirit of the work, further that

excerpts could only be tedious. Clearly, too, the excerpts could not be brought together with your commentary. I feel rather bad that I suggested this, but my first impression on learning that you had written a commentary on the Brahma Jāla was that something of the text would have to be put forward. There are probably less than a hundred people in this country who have any idea what the Brahma Jāla is; certainly the publishers would not and I cannot imagine that they would not immediately ask for the original sutta. However, as you say your commentary is self-explanatory and already equipped with the equivalent of an introduction that is another matter altogether. We need not therefore consider anything of the nature of including the sutta.

With regard to the translation of the chapter for Maha Bohdi, I was intending to begin working on it in about a month's time. I have been busy all the summer with the compiling of a list of Reference Books for the London Libraries, the list pertaining to books on Comparative Religion and the Non-Christian Religions. I had nearly finished this – as you may imagine it has taken a considerable amount of reading – when I was asked to read a paper in the same connection in November. That seemed simple enough, but now I have a request to prepare my script so as to go forward for publication. Under the circumstances it seems advisable to go on with this script while I have the whole matter in my mind. Hence the delay in starting on the translation. In the meantime work for MBJ and other writing is just piling up!

I had it in mind to suggest that you send me the script of Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas since two chapters have already been translated of that work and, with those as specimens, the whole could proceed immediately to a publisher. You may not care to send me this as you have just sent the Prachtnetz, but of that I have yet to make a translation of at least [*sic*] one chapter before I can go with it to a publishing house. Apart from avoiding delay, it is a great thing to be able to say that two chapters have already been published as articles in an Indian Journal – the second will be in print by now – whereas in the case of the Prachtnetz I could only say that you intend the translation of one chapter for publication in the Indian press. Still, it is just as you like. Please do note that I am not suggesting that one work may be better than the other in whatever aspect; it is merely that even a specialist reader has to bear in mind the chances of ready sales, and if he is assured that some of the text has already been “saleable”, or as far as he is concerned “sold”, he is the more ready to advise acceptance of the whole.

“Von da entschwinden tauchte ich dort auf” I will embark on on [*sic*] a separate sheet as there is a good deal involved.<sup>57</sup> Having got over the most severe part of the illness, you do not want to exert yourself in this intense heat. The

---

57 The separate sheet is not extant.

nights here cool off a little, but in a city the buildings seem to hold the sultriness; it has been like that with us since the beginning of July. On Sunday my husband and I started early for the country and when we arrived at the hotel of our choice we lay in deck chairs in the very charming garden. But all to no purpose! He said he felt chilly after lunch we drove on again in the sun! I thought of the *Tevijja Sutta*:<sup>58</sup> “Where do long and short, pleasant and unpleasant, etc., cease?”

With very many thanks for your kind wishes and best greetings to you both

Yours sincerely Adrienne Bennett

I see I have left out the middle of that last paragraph! What I meant to say – if it hadn’t been for the heat – was: Take a rest before proceeding to the separate sheet!

#### 2.1.8. Bennett to Kropatsch (September 6, 1955)<sup>59</sup>

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
6th September 1955

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of 14th August which arrived while I was away.

First, about your scripts. I thought, if you approve the idea, of writing to Allen & Unwin, a firm of London publishers the head of which, Sir Stanley Unwin,<sup>60</sup> is the doyen of the profession. They have just published a volume by Prof. Murti of the University of Banares dealing with the *Mādhyamika* Philosophy of Buddhism and with much Sanskrit annotation.<sup>61</sup> They therefore consider your type of work; further it is an experienced and reliable firm. I could offer them a translation of your Foreword and the two specimen chapters – or excerpts – already translated and ask if they would consider the German script. They might, of course, turn down the proposition immediately;

---

58 The *Tevijjasutta* (Discourse on the Threefold Knowledge) is the thirteenth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya* (see Bennett 1955e). Bennett actually quotes from the *Kevattasutta* (Discourse on Kevatta), the eleventh *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya* (see Bennett 1955c: 289).

59 Kropatsch’s letter to Bennett from August 14, 1955, is not extant.

60 Unwin (1884–1968) was the founder of Allen & Unwin.

61 Bennett refers to the Indian scholar of Buddhism Tirupattur Ramaseshayyer Venkatachala Murti (1902–1986) and his *The Central Philosophy of Buddhism: A Study of the Mādhyamika System* (Murti 1955).



on the other hand they might call for the full script and give it to a “German” reader. They would then, probably, make suggestions about the translating [sic]; certainly they would have a list of people who undertake such work. What happens after that is anybody’s guess, at the moment, but at least we should get some idea of the possibilities of publication. An ordinary publishing firm is no use as it would want an English translation before considering the matter at all. Besides Allen & Unwin there are three other firms one might try, but they would probably all draw on the same set of translators, and the publication of the Murti book is, from our point of view, a recommendation. Please let me know what you think; if you decide that I should try, could you let me know a few details about yourself – I mean Ph.D. or medical doctor, Univ. of Vienna, or such like, – something to impress on the firm that it is dealing with a scholar of note.

I studied with much interest pp. 170–178 of the *Prachtnetz* but am not sure as yet if I have got the exact meaning. It seems to me that „hinleitendes Bewusstsein“ might indicate something of the pilot-engine action, whereas the Abhidhamma version gives the Bhavaṅga, Cuti and Paṭisandhi consciousnesses as resultants.<sup>62</sup> I don’t think that is very satisfactory either, but the obvious difficulty lies in trying to reconcile an explanation with the anattā doctrine, and therein, I believe, lies the fault. Study of the ātman<sup>63</sup> of the Upaniṣads is given by notable Indian writers as being presented in two ways, one the Absolute Brahman, and the other with the personified

Brahman who comes up as Viṣṇu, Śiva and Brahmā, the last being in fact merely Prajāpati.<sup>64</sup> With the Absolute Brahman, or Absolute Reality, I don’t think the Buddha had any quarrel – in fact the Pali Canon all goes to “seeing yathā-bhutaṃ”,<sup>65</sup> or according to absolute reality (There is also the formal insistence on “sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā”<sup>66</sup> – having thoroughly known and realized in his own experience.);<sup>67</sup> it is with the personified Brahman, and therefore with the devolution of the ātman into jīva,<sup>68</sup> that the Buddha differed and on the subject of which he gave so many discourses (e.g. Dīgha

---

62 The notion of *bhavaṅga-citta* refers to one’s “life-continuum consciousness,” whose beginning is the “rebirth-linking consciousness” (*paṭisandhi-citta*), while its end is the “death consciousness” (*cuti-citta*).

63 Pāli: *atta* or “self.”

64 Prajāpati is a Vedic deity later to be equated with the cosmogonic deity Brahmā, who builds an ontological triad (*trimūrti*) together with the deities Viṣṇu and Śiva.

65 Meaning “seeing things as they are.”

66 A phrase from the *Ariyapariyesanāsutta* (Discourse on the Noble Quest), the twenty-sixth *sutta* of the *Majjhimanikāya*.

67 A handwritten addition by Bennett.

68 Jīva refers to the individual self or sentient essence.

Nikāya, XIII. Tevijja Sutta). In these we always have “union with Brahma”, never with “Brahman”.

According to Hiriyanṇa,<sup>69</sup> if the Absolute Brahman is personified, it is inevitable that the conception of ātman should become identical, or practically so, with that of jīva, and it is jīva (usually translated by the Indian writers themselves as “soul”) which has all the appurtenances of khandhas<sup>70</sup> and the like. That is my present opinion, at least. (It is notable that Radhakrishnan,<sup>71</sup> Hiriyanṇa, and many others of the top-grade of Indian thought – I think Das Gupta<sup>72</sup> amongst them – differ appreciably in their estimate of ātman; the lesser writers often give quite conflicting accounts, partly because they have to condense their material, and partly because they think if they employ Christian terminology their readers will know what is meant – which of course makes the whole thing confusion.)

I was very distressed to hear of the death of Dr. Oprchal and am expressing my profound sympathy with the Vienna Buddhist Society.<sup>73</sup> You, too, will have lost a dear friend. I think I first saw his name in the Wesak issue of the Vienna Journal;<sup>74</sup> I wondered at the time why a new President’s name was being put forward, or rather, had been put forward, assuming that Dr. Oprchal had at some time been President since he was the Founder.

It would be marvelous to come to Vienna and see you and Mrs Kropatsch – perhaps some day we shall manage it!<sup>75</sup> At present my husband’s difficulty is in leaving the Office at all, much less planning dates in advance. The day before we left for Bournemouth he thought he would have to cancel the trip

69 Bennett refers to the Indian scholar of Sanskrit Mysore Hiriyanṇa (1871–1950).

70 The aggregates of being (Sanskrit: *skandha*).

71 Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan (1888–1975) was an eminent Hindu philosopher and served as the second President (p. 1962–1967) of India.

72 Surendranath Dasgupta (1887–1952) was a famed Indian scholar of Sanskrit and Indian philosophy.

73 Little is known about Franz Oprchal (1900–1955). Apparently, he had acquired a doctorate and worked as an import-export merchant. He lived together with his Jewish wife in Vienna’s first district on Börseplatz. Oprchal was reportedly concerned with Christian ideas as well as occultism, Theosophy, and specifically Mahāyāna Buddhism. Around 1947, he participated in the establishment of the Vienna Buddhist Society for which he served as founding president. In 1954, he passed on the leadership to Fritz Hungerleider and passed away the following year. Shortly before, he was elected Honorary President of the Society.

74 See Buddhistische Gesellschaft Wien 1955: 2. In an attached Wesak special issue, Kropatsch is featured with an article entitled “Betrachtungen zur ‘Erleuchtung Buddhas’” (Reflections on ‘Buddha’s Enlightenment’) (Kropatsch 1955a), which is an abridged version of an article published in *Indische Welt, Buddhistische Monatshefte*, the journal of the German Maha Bodhi branch (see Kropatsch 1953a). Helmut Klar might have sent both issues to Bennett (see Bennett’s letter to Kropatsch from May 25, 1955).

75 Bennett and Kropatsch would never meet in person.

because of some important cables that had just arrived, but fortunately he managed to get away. The funniest thing was that we both took heaps of papers etc., meaning to type out our view on various questions and answer a few long-outstanding letters; but two days after our arrival, when we thought we could summon up the energy to do something, we found we had not brought the machine with us. We borrowed the one belonging to the hotel but it was a dreadful old thing, and of course they kept wanting it back for their own affairs. Finally, we took the most important things to the town and had them typed out there; we ourselves gave up the struggle and went out in the car!

Very best wishes to you both

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

Dr. Anton Kropatsch

Wien II.

Thugutstrasse 4/14

#### 2.1.9. Bennett to Kropatsch (October 6, 1955)<sup>76</sup>

9, Norland Square Mansions

Holland Park, London W.II

6th October 1955

Dr. Anton Kropatsch

Wien II, Thugutstrasse 4/14

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of the 14th September. It was waiting for me on our return from the final trip of the season which, this time, was cold and wet. However, our daughter,<sup>77</sup> who is a ballet dancer, was performing for the Welsh Opera which was giving a season in Bournemouth [*sic*], so we spent a good deal of time in the theatre.

I delayed in replying to you because I hoped to receive the August issue of the Maha Bodhi Journal before doing so. The July number came very late – I only got it last Saturday – and Bhikshu Sangharakshita<sup>78</sup> had written to tell

---

<sup>76</sup> Kropatsch's letter to Bennett from September 14, 1955, is not extant.

<sup>77</sup> Yvonne Bennett.

<sup>78</sup> On Sangharakshita, see the Introduction.

me your article would most likely appear in that.<sup>79</sup> As soon as it comes I will tackle Allen & Unwin and will let you know when I receive their verdict. Thank you very much for giving me the details about yourself.

My husband and I were both very interested to read about Freud.<sup>80</sup> I feel sure, now, that it was a very good thing we did not take the typewriter – this last time we did not even try!

I see in the papers that you have been having cooler weather in Vienna and I expect you are glad. It is lovely here now.

With best wishes from us both to you and Mrs Kropatsch – perhaps I should say “salaams” since I came to know you through matters Indian. I like “Salaam!” as a form of greeting; it sound dignified.

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

#### 2.1.10. Bennett to Kropatsch (November 7, 1955)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
7th November 1955

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
4/14 Thugutstrasse  
Vienna II

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

I am so sorry for the delay in sending your author's copy of the August issue of Maha Bodhi Journal. A packet arrived for me from Calcutta about a fortnight ago bearing the notice “7 copies”; it contained only one. I waited a few days to see if the remaining six would turn up, but when by last Friday they had still not put in an appearance I wrote round to London contributors to see if any one of them could spare a copy. Mr. G. F. Allen<sup>81</sup> rang me up this afternoon to say he had sent you his, and apologised that it was not in as fresh condition as could be desired as he had already lent it to two or three people

---

<sup>79</sup> Kropatsch's “‘Thirst’ and the Question of Free Will” was indeed published in the August issue (see Kropatsch 1955d).

<sup>80</sup> Sigmund Freud (1856–1939). Kropatsch was familiar with some of Freud's writings. For example, he referenced Freud's *Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die Psychoanalyse* (Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis; 1916/17) in both of his books.

<sup>81</sup> A fellow English translator, George Francis Allen was ordained as Y Siri Nyana in the Theravāda tradition. He is known for his 1959 book *The Buddha's Philosophy: Selections from the Pāli Canon and an Introductory Essay* (Allen 1959).

to read your article. It will be at least a month before I can get the missing six replaced from Calcutta, but as soon as I do I will send you a clean official copy. In the meantime I thought you would be wondering what had happened.

Best wishes and many apologies

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.1.11. Kropatsch to Bennett (November 11, 1955)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

11.XI.1955

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your two letters of 6 October and 7 November and for the August issue of the *Maha Bodhi Journal* which arrived today. I am very sorry that you took such trouble in order to send me this issue as swiftly as possible. Your translation, like that of my first work, is quite excellent. Your holiday, about which you wrote me in your first letter, is also in the distant past by now and you must already be in the middle of your work again. I am much better now so that I can work intellectually for several hours a day without getting too fatigued. Sadly, almost any physical effort and especially walking around or leaving the flat is still completely out of the question and I am now putting myself off until spring. Recently, I have immersed myself in a number of Discourses, the main subject of which is the *anatta* problem. It is interesting to trace how the views of modern philosophy – I only remind you of Bertrand Russell<sup>82</sup> – come extraordinarily close to the *anatta* doctrine. In his “History of Western Philosophy,”<sup>83</sup> for example, I found deliberations about the “I,” which corresponded almost verbatim with Nagaseno’s answer to Milindo in the well-known comparison with the chariot (in the “Questions of Milindo”).<sup>84</sup> When Bertrand Russell states: “Mr Schmidt is a collective name for a number of events; if we assume something beyond that, we designate with it something completely unknowable, which therefore cannot

---

<sup>82</sup> The famous English logician and philosopher Bertrand Russell (1872–1970).

<sup>83</sup> Published in 1945, *A History of Western Philosophy* is one of Russell’s most seminal publications.

<sup>84</sup> Kropatsch refers to the *Milindapañha* (Questions of Milinda), a text composed around the beginning of the common era. It depicts a dialogue on Buddhist doctrine between the King of Bactria Menander I (Pāli: Milinda) and the *arahant* Nāgasena. For the comparison, see Nyāṇatiloka 1919: 43–47.

serve to express what we know,”<sup>85</sup> I opine that the same thought is expressed here that Nagaseno clothes in the words: “Thus, depending on the five *Greifegruppen* [i.e., *khandhas* or aggregates of being], the name, the designation, the term, the vernacular expression, and the word ‘Nagaseno’ arise.”<sup>86</sup> In the supreme sense, an entity is not to be found there.”

On a superficial reading, more often than not, the statements in the Discourses are almost incomprehensible and only the exact elaboration of the problem shows their correctness. Thus, to give just one example, one Discourse refers to people who believe that the “self” of man reveals itself in sensation. Yet, more recent psychological considerations have led to the view that “self-consciousness,” which has hitherto been held primarily responsible for the emergence of the notion of “I,” only develops on the basis of an *Innesein* (Rothacker)<sup>87</sup> and a *Körpergefühl* (Rensch),<sup>88</sup> that is, that the emotive sensation forms the preliminary stage of the I-consciousness. Thus, many of the views that can be found in the Discourses, find scientific confirmation only today.

The new president of the Vienna Buddhist Society, Fritz Hungerleider,<sup>89</sup> is a young merchant who lived in China during the War and now manages the

---

85 In the original: “The same holds of Mr. Smith; it is a collective name for a number of occurrences. If we take it as anything more, it denotes something completely unknowable, and therefore not needed for the expression of what we know” (Russell 1946: 224–225).

86 See Nyāṇatiloka 1919: 47.

87 Erich Rothacker (1888–1965) was a German philosopher specialising in philosophical anthropology. Kropatsch draws on Rothacker’s *Die Schichten der Persönlichkeit* (The Layers of Personality; 1938)—which he also references in both of his books—where the latter develops the notion of *Innesein* (immediate awareness) qua egoless preliminary stage of consciousness.

88 Bernhard Rensch (1900–1990) was a German evolutionary biologist. Kropatsch draws on his *Neuere Probleme der Abstammungslehre* (Recent Problems of Descent Theory; 1954 [1947]).

89 Born in Vienna, Hungerleider (1920–1998) was the son of a Jewish merchant while his mother was Catholic. Soon after graduating from high school in 1938, he had to flee the country and migrated to Shànghǎi, where his parents joined him later. There he married Ingeborg (née Mannheimer; b. 1926). Hungerleider’s turn to Buddhism was sparked by reading Schopenhauer’s *Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung* (The World as Will and Representation; 1819). In 1947, he returned to Vienna with his wife and mother—his father had died in emigration—and became a merchant himself. Initially, he studied Theravāda Buddhism, among others, under the influence of Kropatsch but soon expanded his interest to other traditions of Buddhism. In 1954, he took over the leadership of the Viennese Buddhist Society from Franz Oprchal, who was already gravely ill at the time and was appointed its president the following year. In 1961, he retired and travelled to Japan with his wife for several months to study Zen at Kyōto-based Daitokuji, the head temple of the important Rinzai Zen branch of the same name. After his return, he conducted the very first

Society's affairs with commendable zeal and concern for the teachings. Proof of this may be that he has succeeded in locating the hitherto forgotten grave of the great German translator of Buddha's Discourses, K. E. Neumann, whose translations have contributed extraordinarily to the spread of the teachings in the German-speaking world, in Vienna's Zentralfriedhof. Strangely enough, this occurred on the fortieth anniversary of his death, the day of which was previously unknown to us all. The grave was completely neglected and no longer had a gravestone, so it seems like a miracle that the municipality of Vienna is taking it into its care, erecting a memorial stone or something similar. To my delight, the young president has become very attached to me, discussing all the events of the Society with me, also sometimes using my works and comments on the texts for ceremonies and lectures at the Society, so that although personally distant, I can nevertheless participate in the events. This too is a great pleasure for me, all the more so because I know almost all the members well and hold them in high esteem. So I get what is best possible out of my life and am content and, if not exactly happy, I am by no means unhappy. Also my wife has herself accustomed with admirable self-denial to our changed life situation and is a good and faithful comrade to me. Please accept from her and me many kind regards and good wishes for you and your honoured husband.

Your devoted

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

11.XI.1955

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen herzlich für Ihre beiden Briefe vom 6.X. und 7.XI. und für die Augustnummer der Maha-Bodhi-Zeitschrift, die heute kam. Es tut mir

---

intensive meditation retreat in the German-speaking world in Roseburg near Hamburg in 1962. Hungerleider served as president until 1976 and thus left his mark on Austrian Buddhism at that time. During his Buddhist career he reportedly gave over a thousand lectures. His books include *Gespräch eines Buddhisten mit einem Christen. Zur Frage der Toleranz* (Conversation of a Buddhist with a Christian: On the Question of Tolerance; 1969), *Das Zen-Seminar. Ein Leitfaden für Übende und Lehrer* (The Zen Seminar: A Manual for Practitioners and Teachers; 1976), *Mein Weg zur Mystik. Eine religiöse Autobiographie* (My Path to Mysticism: A Religious Autobiography; 1988), and *Mystik, Tao und Zen. Lichtspur zum Urgrund des Seins* (Mysticism, Tao, and Zen: Light Trace to the Source of Being; 1992).

sehr leid, dass Sie sich solche Mühe machten, um mir diese Nummer ehebaldigst zukommen zu lassen. Ihre Uebersetzung ist, so wie die meiner ersten Arbeit, ganz ausgezeichnet. Ihr Urlaub, von dem Sie mir in Ihrem ersten Briefe schrieben, liegt nun auch schon in ferner Vergangenheit und Sie stecken wohl schon wieder mitten in Ihrer Arbeit.

Mir geht es jetzt schon deutlich besser und ich kann mehrere Stunden im Tage geistig arbeiten, ohne zu sehr zu ermüden; leider ist fast jede körperliche Anstrengung und vor allem das Herumgehen oder das Verlassen der Wohnung noch immer völlig ausgeschlossen und ich vertröste mich jetzt auf das Frühjahr. Ich habe mich in der letzten Zeit in eine Anzahl von Reden vertieft, die vor allem das Anatta-Problem zum Gegenstand haben. Interessant ist es zu verfolgen, wie die Anschauungen der modernen Philosophie – ich erinnere nur an Bertrand Russell – der Anatta-Lehre ausserordentlich nahe kommen. So fand ich in seiner “History of western Philosophy” Ausführungen über das “Ich”, welche mit der Antwort Nagasenos an Milindo im bekannten Vergleich mit dem Wagen (in den “Fragen des Milindo”) fast wörtlich übereinstimmen. Wenn Bertrand Russell sagt: “Herr Schmidt ist ein Kollektivname für eine Anzahl von Ereignissen; wenn wir etwas darüber hinaus annehmen, so bezeichnen wir damit etwas völlig Unerkennbares, das daher auch nicht dazu dienen kann, um das auszudrücken, was wir kennen”, so ist meiner Meinung nach hiermit der gleiche Gedanke ausgedrückt, den Nagaseno in die Worte kleidet: “So entsteht in Abhängigkeit von den fünf Greifegruppen der Name, die Bezeichnung, der Begriff, die landläufige Ausdrucksweise und das Wort “Nagaseno”. Im höchsten Sinn ist da eine Wesenheit nicht vorzufinden”. Sehr oft sind bei oberflächlicher Lektüre Ausführungen in den Reden fast unverständlich und erst die genaue Durchdenkung des Problems zeigt ihre Richtigkeit. So wird, um nur ein Beispiel anzuführen, in einer Rede von Menschen gesprochen, welche glauben, dass in der Empfindung sich das “Selbst” des Menschen offenbare. Nun haben neuere psychologische Ueberlegungen zu der Ansicht geführt, dass das “Selbstbewusstsein”, das bisher für die Entstehung der Ich-Vorstellung hauptsächlich verantwortlich gemacht wurde, erst auf dem Boden eines “Inneseins” (Rothacker) und “Körpergefühls” (Rensch) zur Entwicklung kommt, also die gefühlsbetonte Empfindung das Vorstadium des Ich-Bewusstseins bilde. So erfahren viele Ansichten, die in den Reden zu finden sind, erst heute ihre wissenschaftliche Bestätigung.

Der neue Präsident der Wiener buddh. Gesellschaft, Fritz Hungerleider, ist ein junger Kaufmann, der während des Krieges in China lebte und nun mit anerkennenswertem Eifer und Bemühen um die Lehre die Geschäfte der Gesel [sic] führt. Beweis dafür mag sein, dass es ihm gelungen ist das bisher verschollene Grab des grossen deutschen Uebersetzers der Reden Buddhas



K. E. Neumann, dessen Uebertragungen im deutschen Sprachbereich ausserordentlich viel zur Verbreitung der Lehre beigetragen haben, auf dem Wiener Zentralfriedhof ausfindig zu machen; merkwürdigerweise auf den Tag an seinem 40. Todestag, der uns allen unbekannt war. Das Grab war vollkommen verwahrlost und hatte nicht einmal mehr einen Grabstein, so dass es wie ein Wunder anmutet, dass es die Gemeinde Wien in ihre Obhut nimmt und einen Gedenkstein oder etwas Aehnliches errichtet. Der junge Präsident hat sich zu meiner Freude sehr an mich angeschlossen und *[sic]* bespricht alle Veranstaltungen der Gesellschaft mit mir, benutzt auch bisweilen meine Arbeiten und Kommentare zu den Texten für Feierstunden und Vorträge in der Gesellschaft, sodass ich, obwohl persönlich ferne, doch an den Veranstaltungen mitwirken kann. Auch das ist für mich eine grosse Freude, umso mehr, da ich die Mitglieder fast alle gut kenne und sehr schätze.

So hole ich aus meinem Leben das Bestmögliche heraus und bin zufrieden und, wenn auch nicht gerade glücklich, so doch auf keinen Fall unglücklich. Auch meine Frau hat sich in unsere veränderte Lebenslage mit bewundernswerter Selbstverleugnung gefunden und ist mir ein guter und treuer Kamerad. Nehmen Sie von ihr und mir für Sie und Ihren verehrten Herrn Gemahl viele freundliche Grüsse und gute Wünsche.

Ihr ergebener

## 2.2. 1956

### 2.2.1. Bennett to Kropatsch (January 6, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
6th January 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of 11th November. I am so sorry to have been so long in replying but I had no sooner cleared up from the lecture, returned exhibits to lenders, and so on, and made up the arrears of the Maha Bodhi work, than a letter arrived to say that they wanted the Wesak material in Calcutta by 1st March. Having circulated this information to prospective contributors, I embarked immediately on your Leib-Seels *[sic]* Problem and have just completed the rough draft. I wanted this particularly for Wesak and, as the August issues with 'Thirst' and the Question of Freewill have still not come, I will send the former to Allen & Unwin as a specimen chapter – or part of chapter – together with your synopsis of the containing work. I will

also send you a copy of the translation for your approval; previously I have not been able to do this because at the time the earlier translations were made I had no idea where you were, though I supposed that at some time you had been in Vienna.

The need for genuinely scientific consideration of the leading Buddhist Teachings has always seemed to me to be imperative, and of the Anatta problem most of all. I still maintain that, as the Buddhist Suttas dealing with Union with Brahma speak of Brahma as a god and a creator, the Upanisadic Absolute and the atman are not involved. The Brhadāranyaka Upaniṣad,<sup>90</sup> which according to the French critics is one of the only two U's – the other being the Chandogya<sup>91</sup> – that were pre-Buddhist, contains definite statements that one associates with Buddhist teachings even to the aim being the cessation of suffering. The statements are often surrounded by a mass of other matter and are in no way systematised, but one cannot help feeling that there is a link yet to be discovered. Then, in the Digha, and elsewhere, are the Buddha's words that it is not till one has passed beyond the six fields, āyatana<sup>92</sup> – that one comes to know what lies beyond – and the description of the states of mind of the bhikkhu<sup>93</sup> who is trying to attain to cessation of consciousness. The latter shows the bhikkhu to possess a will and a directive potential right up to the stage when consciousness is so slight that it “cannot be said whether it exists or not.” Finally he says: “Perception and mind are a hindrance to me; let me be without them. — Surely I should not perceive, should not manipulate perception.” (Potthapada Sutta. Digha Nikaya IX. 17).<sup>94</sup> “manipulate” here is “abhisamkhareyyan” (conditional mood), and has the significance of “allowing perception to develop with all its concomitant factors”. Dr. Neumann translated the first thirteen suttas of the Digha; I would like very much to know what he said. Translations of the Digha I–XV are rare; everyone does the Majjhima,<sup>95</sup> yet the former contain the big philosophic, full-length treatises, of which the Potthapada is one of the most outstanding. The Rhys-Davids<sup>96</sup> translation we have on sale here is obviously inadequate,<sup>97</sup> but then R-D knew [sic] nothing of the Buddhist [sic] philosophies or, it would seem,

---

90 The Brhadāranyaka Upaniṣad.

91 The Chandogya Upaniṣad.

92 Bennett refers to *āyatana*s, the twelve “sense-fields” which engender consciousness.

93 Pāli (Sanskrit: bhikṣu), an ordained monk.

94 See Bennett 1955b: 125.

95 The *Majjhimanikāya* (Collection of Middle[-length] Discourses) is the second of five collections contained in the *Suttapiṭaka* of the *Tiṭṭhaka* or Pāli Canon.

96 Thomas William Rhys Davids (1843–1922) was a famed English scholar of Pāli and the founder of the Pāli Text Society.

97 Bennett refers to Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1949.

of any other philosophies. That, of course, could not be helped, because the texts were not available and he naturally worked first on the suttas. I think it is this that has given rise to so many futile dissertations on Buddhism; people took any texts they felt they could understand – and the essentially philosophic suttas would not be amongst those – so that unless a writer had a natural and profound philosophic background of his own the result could only be inadequate. Returning to the point I started to make in connection with the two quotations, obviously the “self” as lying in perception is ruled out. Presumably the “Körpergefühl” (Rensch) will also have ceased, or lapsed, in the case of the said bhikkhu; is not the “Innesein” (Rothacker) this thing that is still in the bhikkhu, perhaps all that is left of him as far as one can say in so many words, and that says: “Let me be without them (perception and mind)”?

I realise that one has to distinguish between the “self” as composed of the five khandhas and the “self” which I take to be the atman – namely, that which is left when one is stripped of the khandhas and which could conceivably be reduced to the mere coming back to the main stram [*sic*] of life with no subsequent differentiation from it. I don’t think, myself, that there is any such reduction. I much prefer the Mahayana idea – and I believe it is the genuine Theravada idea as well – of the purification of the Ideation-Store, to achieve which every faculty of man must be cultivated up to perfection – that our present level of intelligence stands to the highest rather as the cleverness and busy-ness of the ants stand to us. Far from attempting to destroy consciousness, I would use it in the best interests of the intellect if only, as Radhakrishnan says, to supply the target at which to aim. The rest is probably like the case of painters and musicians; they only begin to turn out work worth attention when they have mastered technique sufficiently to put it behind them – at intervals, at least.

I am so glad to hear about your new President and to know, both for you and for the sake of the Society, that he keeps in constant contact with you. It must be a great joy and support to you all. Perhaps there could be no more fitting moment than this, as well as for the finding of Dr. Neumann’s grave, than this time of approach to the Jayanti celebrations – whether 1956 is historically the exact 2500th anniversary or not.<sup>98</sup> After all that you must, all of you, have suffered during recent decades, in a sense you are now all brought together with the memory of a great Buddhist scholar revived as extra inspiration. May he be well and happy wherever he is!

---

<sup>98</sup> *Jayantī* usually indicates the birthday of a deity, Buddha Jayanti therefore being Buddha’s Birthday celebrated as Wesak (Pāli: Vesākha). According to the Theravāda tradition, Wesak encompasses not only Gautama’s birth but also his enlightenment and passing. Here Bennett alludes to the latter, as the year 544/3 BCE is traditionally (i.e., within Theravāda) held to be the year of Buddha’s passage into *nibbāna*.

Please give Mrs Kropatsch my very best wishes for the New Year; tell her that this is not just a formal greeting. I often think of her because I know very well how I felt three years ago when my husband had a sudden operation. That meant only weeks of stress; your wife's effort is much more sustained. My very best wishes to you also!

Yours sincerely  
Adrienne Bennett

### 2.2.2. Bennett to Kropatsch (January 19, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
19th January 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Herewith the translation of the Leib-Seele Problem.<sup>99</sup> Please mark the copy wherever you like; I shall have to re-type some of the sheets in any case. I shall not be posting to Calcutta until the middle of February – 20th – so please do not hurry unduly. I am not happy about “inhaltlichen Bestimmtheit”; it seemed to me that the translation should have been to the effect that the driving forces need a directing with regard to distribution of activities as amongst the organs etc, to be involved, but, sticking to a dictionary meaning, one cannot arrive at that. The expression\* comes twice on page 6 of the German text (foolscap) and on page 7 line 9 and page 8 line 4. of the English.

With best wishes  
Yours sincerely  
Adrienne Bennett

\* “—— sie (die Triebe und Bedürfnisse) bedürfen einer inhaltlichen Bestimmtheit, die sie erst durch die Rindenprozesse erhalten.”

### 2.2.3. Kropatsch to Bennett (January 29, 1956)

#### *Translation*

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Vienna II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

29 January 1956

---

<sup>99</sup> The draft translation is not extant.

Dear Madam!

I take the liberty of suggesting some changes to the text of your translation, which are enclosed. If you agree to these changes, I would ask you to replace the words in brackets [] in your translation with the words I have indicated with the same number in this letter. As a matter of course, please do so only as far as English usage permits, which again only you can judge. I am aware that it must have been very difficult to translate the German text, which is not an easy one, and I am not at all sure if I have always been right with my suggestions. The quotations from J. B. Rhine (“Die Reichweite des menschlichen Geistes”)<sup>100</sup> and from E. S. Russell (“Lenkende Kräfte des Organischen”)<sup>101</sup> are taken from German translations of the two original works whose exact English title I can no longer remember. Wouldn’t we need to take the quotations of the two authors in our English translation verbatim from the original works written in English, which unfortunately are not available to me?

I ask you not to be angry with me about the work I am causing you and remain respectfully with the best regards

Your devoted

A. Kropatsch

1 respectively the search for<sup>102</sup>

2 investigation nowadays

3 regenerate

4 pathologie

5 not nama exists for itself and is reborn for itself and in the same way rupa

6 present

7 neither .... nor

8 of a relation of causality

9 is generated

10 the effort to bring to the foreground the dynamic of the physical as well as of the psychical processes

11 whirling

12 requirements, that of the crust transmits the methods

13 direction to be followed

---

100 Joseph Banks Rhine (1895–1980) was a US-American botanist and a key figure in the foundation of parapsychology. His *Die Reichweite des menschlichen Geistes* (1950) is the German translation of the 1947 volume *The Reach of the Mind*.

101 Edward Stuart Russell (1887–1954) was a Scottish biologist. His *Lenkende Kräfte des Organischen* (1945) is the German translation of *The Directiveness of Organic Activities* (1945). Kropatsch referenced the work in his first book (Kropatsch 1957a).

102 The following list of suggestions is given here in the original.

14 purport  
 15 which could clear the way for a better understanding of the mind-body-  
 relationship  
 16 ganglia of the brain-crust  
 17 purport, being interlaced with the brain-crust-ganglia by means of the “ex-  
 citement-constellations” like an “entangled warp” or an “ensnarled web”  
 18 the material body and his  
 19 turning away from “ignorance”, which must definitely be supposed,  
 wherewith the life-processes are held in operation, for “ignorance” being re-  
 placed by “knowledge” in the Buddhist sense  
 20 life-processes in their character of suffering, transitoriness and absence of  
 an unchanging self  
 21 “forms”  
 22 the meaning of the foundation of all  
 23 forces (der englische Titel des Werkes müsste nachgesehen werden)<sup>103</sup>  
 24 so to speak the foundation from which all the conscious life of the “soul”  
 proceeds  
 25 more or less perfect  
 26 Psychoanalysis (“Tiefenpsychologie”)<sup>104</sup>  
 27 “Wirklich ist, was wirkt” (als Wortspiel vielleicht besser deutsch belas-  
 sen)<sup>105</sup>  
 28 “steering forces (siehe 23)  
 29 “psychokinesis”, usually called “Telekinesis”  
 30 under the specified conditions”, given by the directed attempts, “precisely  
 31 supersensual perception (müsste eventuell bei Rhine nachgesehen wer-  
 den)<sup>106</sup>  
 32 non-physic  
 33 transition-point  
 34 conscious knowledge  
 35 formations  
 36 to body-essence, the feeling to feeling-essence, the perception to percep-  
 tion-essence, the consciousness to consciousness-essence. They form the for-  
 mations  
 37 formations  
 38 directed

---

103 “The English title of the work would have to be looked up.” That is, Russell’s *The Directiveness of Organic Activities*.

104 “Depth psychology.”

105 “As a pun, perhaps better left in German.” Literally, “real is what works,” that is, “real is that which has some effect.”

106 “Might have to be checked in Rhine.”

- 39 any form  
 40 directioness  
 41 may that be a life here or a life to come, the earthly life or eternity  
 42 the “sankharas” arise in the “chain of dependent-simultaneous origination”  
 (“Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens” tr. according to Dahlke)<sup>107</sup>  
 dependent on “ignorance” and simultaneously  
 43 “steering forces (siehe 23)”<sup>108</sup>

### *Original*

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
 Wien II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

29.I.1956

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich erlaube mir beiliegend einige Aenderungen des Textes Ihrer Uebersetzung vorzuschlagen. Wenn Sie mit diesen Aenderungen einverstanden sind, so bitte ich, an Stelle der mit [] eingeklammerten Worte Ihrer Uebersetzung die in diesem Briefe von mir derselben Zahl bezeichneten Worte einzusetzen; selbstverständlich nur, soweit es der englische Sprachgebrauch erlaubt, was wieder nur Sie beurteilen können. Ich bin mir dessen bewusst, dass es sehr schwierig gewesen sein muss, den nicht leichten deutschen Text zu übersetzen und bin auch gar nicht sicher, mit meinen Vorschlägen immer das Richtige getroffen zu haben. Die Zitate von J. B. Rhine (“Die Reichweite des menschlichen Geistes”) und von E. S. Russell (“Lenkende Kräfte des Organischen”) entstammen deutschen Uebersetzungen der beiden Originalwerke, deren genauer englischer Titel mir nicht mehr erinnerlich ist. Müssten die Zitate der beiden Autoren in unserer englischen Uebersetzung nicht wörtlich den in englischer Sprache verfassten Originalarbeiten, die mir leider nicht zur Verfügung stehen, entnommen werden?

Ich bitte Sie, nicht böse zu sein über die Arbeit, die ich Ihnen verursache und verbleibe mit den besten Grüßen

Ihr ergebener

A. Kropatsch

- 1 respectively the search for  
 2 investigation nowadays  
 3 regenerate  
 4 pathologie

---

<sup>107</sup> See Dahlke 1921: 893.

<sup>108</sup> “See 23.”

5 not nāma exists for itself and is reborn for itself and in the same way rūpa  
 6 present  
 7 neither .... nor  
 8 of a relation of causality  
 9 is generated  
 10 the effort to bring to the foreground the dynamic of the physical as well as  
 of the psychical processes  
 11 whirling  
 12 requirements, that of the crust transmits the methods  
 13 direction to be followed  
 14 purport  
 15 which could clear the way for a better understanding of the mind-body-  
 relationship  
 16 ganglia of the brain-crust  
 17 purport, being interlaced with the brain-crust-ganglia by means of the “ex-  
 citement-constellations” like an “entangled warp” or an “ensnarled web”  
 18 the material body and his  
 19 turning away from “ignorance”, which must definitely be supposed,  
 wherewith the life-processes are held in operation, for “ignorance” being re-  
 placed by “knowledge” in the Buddhist sense  
 20 life-processes in their character of suffering, transitoriness and absence of  
 an unchanging self  
 21 “forms”  
 22 the meaning of the foundation of all  
 23 forces (der englische Titel des Werkes müsste nachgesehen werden)  
 24 so to speak the foundation from which all the conscious life of the “soul”  
 proceeds  
 25 more or less perfect  
 26 Psychoanalysis (“Tiefenpsychologie”)  
 27 “Wirklich ist, was wirkt” (als Wortspiel vielleicht besser deutsch belassen)  
 28 “steering forces (siehe 23)  
 29 “psychokinesis”, usually called “Telekinesis”  
 30 under the specified conditions”, given by the directed attempts, “precisely  
 31 supersensual perception (müsste eventuell bei Rhine nachgesehen wer-  
 den)  
 32 non-physic  
 33 transition-point  
 34 conscious knowledge  
 35 formations



36 to body-essence, the feeling to feeling-essence, the perception to perception-essence, the consciousness to consciousness-essence. They form the formations  
 37 formations  
 38 directed  
 39 any form  
 40 directionness  
 41 may that be a life here or a life to come, the earthly life or eternity  
 42 the “sankharas” arise in the “chain of dependent-simultaneous origination”  
 (“Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens” tr. according to Dahlke) dependent on “ignorance” and simultaneously  
 43 “steering forces (siehe 23)

#### 2.2.4. Bennett to Kropatsch (February 4, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
 Holland Park, London W.II  
 4th February 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of the 27<sup>th</sup> [*sic*] January and for the enclosed Betrachtungen zu Potthapada;<sup>109</sup> I have put this by for the moment so that I can study it at leisure after I have posted the Wesak mail to Calcutta. I assure you that that is something of a business, not necessarily the articles but all kinds of stray pieces of information and the like! I hope you were not alarmed when I wrote of sending Allen & Unwin the synopsis of Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas with the Leib-Seels [*sic*] Problem; I had the former on my list to translate at the time that I was thinking on sending up the two previous translations; afterwards I realised that I should have to change that to the synopsis of Prachtnetz.

Thank you also very much for the script of the Leib-Seels [*sic*] Problem translation. I ought to have put it away for a few days and to have come [*sic*] back to a reconsideration of it – there was a good deal I could have put right myself – but time was running short and I did not know, once I left it, when I should be able to return to it. I found it very much more difficult to follow the trend of the argument than I had done in the two previous translations, and, as I am not familiar with the works from which you quoted, could not get any help in

---

109 Published in the 1960 May issue of *The Maha Bodi* as “Reflections on the Potthapada Sutta” (Kropatsch 1960).

the general build-up from them. Still, I think it is satisfactory now. I have used all your suggestions, for which I was very grateful, except the following.

- I. beziehungsweise. “Respectively” is only possible if more than one item is referred to. “Namely” would have been possible but I wanted to stick to something of the sense of Beziehung; “with reference to” made a clumsy sentence so I put “as regards”
32. “Regenerate” is used in the sense of “re-generate” but has always a spiritual connotation. I therefore left in “generate”.
- II. “whirling” is better than “eddyding” but “constant alternation or interplay” would have been better in English. I left “whirling” in order to keep as near the German as possible; the meaning is quite clear and the figure of speech is preserved.
14. The English dictionaries give “purpose” and “purport” as synonyms. I tried “purport” first myself but altered it to “purpose” as having too much of a suggestion of “result”. I have now restored “purport”.
17. I had to cut the “entangled warp” and “snarled web” because both sound overdone in English; they are not, either of them, expressions natural to the tongue.
26. I changed “Parapsychology” to “Psychoanalysis” in this instance though the Ref. Library Dictionary gave the former. (Incidentally, Psychoanalysis has a bad reputation here, the psychoanalysts apparently consisting of people who are themselves “batty” – otherwise “crazy”. Many amusing war-stories about them! But to be serious again:
35. This comes out to “form the formations” which is not possible. I have put: constitute the formations.
41. I cannot trace any mention of simultaneity in connection with the Paticcasamuppada.<sup>110</sup> Takakusu,<sup>111</sup> Nyanatiloka,<sup>112</sup> Kashyap<sup>113</sup> etc. all state “(Chain of) Dependent Origination”. \*

---

110 Pāli: *paṭṭicasamuppāda* (Sanskrit: *pratītyasamutpāda*), that is, the doctrine of “dependent origination.”

111 Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次郎 (1866–1945), a Japanese scholar of Buddhism, known to English readers in particular for his translation of the *Guān wúliàngshòu fōjīng* 觀無量壽佛經 in the Sacred Books of the East series (1894) and the posthumous *The Essentials of Buddhist Philosophy* (1947).

112 Nānātiloka Mahāthera (Anton Walther Florus Gueth; 1878–1957), a pioneering German Theravāda monk and prolific writer-cum-translator. For extensive information on Nānātiloka, see Hecker 1995.

113 Jagdish Kashyap (1908–1976), and Indian monk scholar, translator of Pāli, and affiliate of the Maha Bodhi Society. He was one of the teachers of Sangharakshita. He published a multi-volume English translation of the *Paṭṭhāna*, that is, the sixth of the seven books of the *Abhidhammapiṭaka*, dealing mainly with the doctrine of *paṭṭicasamuppāda*.

I was so sorry to have given you so much labour, especially when your working-time had been cut down to two hours a day. I do hope you are making progress again now.

Very best wishes

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

PS: The English titles of the works, as well as the actual quotes can be verified later. They are well right in their present form for MBJ.<sup>114</sup>

- \* Takakusu: Causal Relation . Causal origination – Chain of Causation<sup>115</sup>  
 Nyanatiloka: Dependent Origination<sup>116</sup>  
 Buddhādāna:<sup>117</sup> Causal genesis. Dependent Origination

#### 2.2.5. Kropatsch to Bennett (February 15, 1956)

##### *Translation*

Vienna, 15.II.1956

II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

Dear Madam!

Thank you for your letter of 4 February. Allow me to make a few brief remarks on this, not in order to initiate a new change to the manuscript or to have the last word, but because I think it might be of interest to you.

ad 1 “Beziehungsweise”<sup>118</sup> does not have the meaning of “In Beziehung auf,”<sup>119</sup> but is most likely an intensified “Oder auch.” Here it also separates two views from each other, namely, the one that the whole soul is immortal from the one according to which only a part of the soul is immortal, as Plato, for example, assumed.

ad 17 The expression “knäuelartig verflochten, klumpenartig verfilzt” (however – and this was a mistake – I contracted it to “knäuelartig verfilzt”) comes

---

114 This and the passage below are handwritten additions by Bennett.

115 See Takakusu 1947.

116 See Nanatiloka Mahathera 1927.

117 Probably a mistyping. These two translations are also given, for example, in Rhys Davids and Stede’s *The Pali Text Society’s Pali-English Dictionary* of 1923 (Rhys Davids and Stede 1923b: 16).

118 “Respectively.”

119 “In relation to.”

from a German translation of the fifteenth Discourse of the Digha-Nikaya<sup>120</sup> by Dahlke.<sup>121</sup> In order to render this expression, which is also unusual in German, as correctly as possible in English, I used the English translation of this Discourse by Henry Clarke Warren<sup>122</sup> in “Buddhism in translations” (Vol III of the Harvard Oriental Series, ed. Cambridge Mass 1906).<sup>123</sup>

ad 26 “Psychoanalysis” and “psychoanalyst” are not controversial here as they seem to be for you in England. We speak calmly of the psychoanalysts Freud, Adler,<sup>124</sup> or Jung.<sup>125</sup> The teachings of the latter are also often called “depth psychology,” yet this term is not in general use. However, “psychoanalysis” or “depth psychology” as the doctrine of unconscious processes in the human psyche is strictly separated in German scholarly usage from “parapsychology” as the scientific explanation of phenomena usually called “occult,” such as telepathy, clairvoyance, telekinesis, materialisations, etc. Hence, Rhine’s experiments are parapsychological investigations, Jung’s findings belong, at least for us, to “psychoanalysis” or “depth psychology.” ad 41 I am sorry that you did not follow my intention here. I am of course aware that generally the term “chain of dependent origination” is used. But my expression “chain of dependent-simultaneous origination” was intended as the best possible literal translation of Dahlke’s term “Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens.” Dahlke wanted to express that the individual links of this chain are not only strung together as cause and effect as in a “causal chain,” but that a living growth process is present here, in that one link of the chain emerges from the other, while being already contained in it, just as the plant grows from the germ, while also already being contained in it. I fear that the whole sentence will not be quite comprehensible now.

But now let’s put an end to the “body-soul problem.”

If I have understood you correctly, you do not want to hand over the table of contents and the preface of my “Betrachtungen zu d. Reden B.” together with the two articles already published in the Maha Bodhi Journal to Allen & Unwin, but rather my summary and introduction of the “Prachtnetz” together with the “Leib-Seele-Problem.” I am very much in agreement with this, above all because you already have the whole manuscript of the “Prachtnetz” in your hands and I may ask you to send it to the publisher if he should be interested in seeing it. Otherwise, I would first have to send the somewhat

---

120 That is, the *Mahānidānasutta*.

121 See Dahlke 1921: 710.

122 Warren (1854–1899) was a US-American scholar of Pāli and Sanskrit.

123 See Warren 1906: 203. The first edition was published in 1896.

124 Alfred Adler (1870–1937), the Austrian founder of individual psychology.

125 Carl Gustav Jung (1875–1961). Kropatsch richly referenced Jung in both of his books.

more extensive manuscript of the “Betrachtungen z.d.R.B.” to London, which would involve rather high postage expenses.

I am feeling better in the cold high-pressure weather and hope that both will continue, although I am aware that the first part of this wish is quite selfish.

My wife sends her warmest greetings and joins me in my compliments.

Your devoted

AK

### *Original*

Wien, 15.II.1956

II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen für Ihr Schreiben vom 4.II. Gestatten Sie, dass ich dazu noch einige kurze Bemerkungen mache, nicht um eine neuerliche Aenderung des Manuskriptes zu veranlassen oder um das letzte Wort zu haben, sondern weil ich glaube, dass es Sie interessieren könnte.

ad 1 “Beziehungsweise” hat nicht die Bedeutung von “In Beziehung auf”, sondern ist am ehesten ein verstärktes “Oder auch”. Hier trennt es auch zwei Ansichten voneinander, nämlich diejenige, dass die ganze Seele unsterblich sei, von jener, nach welcher nur einem Teil der Seele Unsterblichkeit zukomme, wie dies z.B. Plato angenommen hat.

ad 17 Der Ausdruck “knäuelartig verflochten, klumpenartig verfilzt” (von mir allerdings – und das war ein Fehler zu “knäuelartig verfilzt” zusammengezogen) entstammt einer deutschen Uebersetzung der 15. Rede des Digha-Nikaya durch Dahlke. Um diesen auch im Deutschen ungewöhnlichen Ausdruck möglichst richtig englisch wiederzugeben, verwendete ich die englische Uebersetzung dieser Rede von Henry Clarke Warren in “Buddhism in translations” (Vol III der Harvard Oriental Series, edit. Cambridge Mass 1906)

ad 26 “Psychoanalyse” und “Psychoanalytiker” haben bei uns nicht jenen üblen Klang, den sie bei Ihnen in England zu haben scheinen. Wir sprechen ruhig von den Psychoanalytikern Freud, Adler oder Jung. Die Lehre des letzteren wird gerne auch “Tiefenpsychologie” genannt, doch ist dieser Ausdruck nicht allgemein gebräuchlich. Von der “Psychoanalyse” oder “Tiefenpsychologie” als der Lehre von den unbewussten Vorgängen in der menschlichen Psyche wird jedoch im deutschen wissenschaftlichen Sprachgebrauch streng getrennt die “Parapsychologie” als die wissenschaftliche Erklärung der gewöhnlich als “okkult” bezeichneten Erscheinungen, wie z.B. Telepathie, Hellsehen (clair-voyance), Telekinese, Materialisationen etc. Also sind die

Versuche Rhine's parapsychologische Untersuchungen, Jung's Erkenntnisse gehören zumindest für uns, der "Psychoanalyse" oder "Tiefenpsychologie" an.

ad 41 Dass Sie hier meiner Intention nicht gefolgt sind, tut mir leid. Es ist mir natürlich bekannt, dass allgemein von "chain of dependent origination" gesprochen wird. Doch mein Ausdruck "chain of dependent-simultaneous origination" war als möglichst wortgetreue Uebersetzung der Dahlke'schen Bezeichnung "Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens" gedacht. Dahlke wollte damit zum Ausdruck bringen, dass die einzelnen Glieder dieser Kette nicht nur wie in einer "Kausalkette" als Ursache und Wirkung aneinander gereiht sind, sondern dass hier ein lebendiger Wachstumsvorgang vorliegt, indem ein Glied der Reihe aus dem anderen hervorgeht, in ihm aber bereits mit enthalten ist, so wie die Pflanze aus dem Keim erwächst, in ihm aber auch bereits enthalten ist. Ich fürchte, dass jetzt der ganze Satz nicht recht verständlich sein wird.

Doch nun Schluss mit dem "Leib-Seele-Problem".

Wenn Ich [*sic*] Sie recht verstanden habe, wollen Sie nun doch nicht die Inhaltsangabe und das Vorwort meiner "Betrachtungen zu d. Reden B." zusammen mit den beiden bereits in der Maha bodhi Ztschr. erschienen Artikeln an Allen & Unwin übergeben, sondern meine Inhaltsangabe und Einleitung des "Prachtnetzes" zusammen mit dem "Leib-Seele-Problem". Ich bin damit sehr einverstanden, vor allem weil Sie bereits das ganze Manuskript des "Prachtnetzes" in Händen haben und ich Sie gegebenenfalls bitten darf, dieses dem Verlag zu übermitteln, wenn er an einer Einsichtnahme ein Interesse haben sollte. Anderenfalls müsste ich erst das etwas umfangreichere Manuskript der "Betrachtungen z.d.R.B." nach London schicken, was mit ziemlich hohen Portospesen verbunden ist.

Mir geht es bei dem kalten Hochdruckwetter besser und ich hoffe, dass beides anhalten wird, obwohl [*sic*] ich mir bewusst bin, dass der erste Teil dieses Wunsches recht egoistisch ist. Meine Frau grüsst herzlich und schliesst sich meinen freundlichen Empfehlungen an.

Ihr ergebener  
AK

## 2.2.6. Bennett to Kropatsch (February 29, 1956)

I am so sorry the August numbers have still not arrived from Calcutta. I am posting with this letter a copy of the December issue with Mr. Zouzelka's<sup>126</sup> account of the finding of Dr. Neumann's grave;<sup>127</sup> I take it that MBJ will send the usual copy to your Buddhist Society, but I thought perhaps a second would not come amiss!

---

126 Franz Zouzelka (1923–1965), a trained engineer, lost his leg to a hand grenade a few weeks before the end of World War II. In the army hospital, he read the book *Amida Buddha unsere Zuflucht* (Amida Buddha: Our Refuge; 1910) by the German Protestant theologian Hans Haas (1868–1934). He also might have been inspired in the military hospital by a book of the German-American Buddhist Paul Carus (1852–1919). After the war he became a core member of the Vienna-based Buddhist circle. In November 1954, Zouzelka attended a lecture in Vienna held by Ōtani Kōshō (1911–2002), the twenty-third abbot of Nishi Honganji, which allegedly greatly inspired him. Subsequently, Zouzelka became the first Austrian Shin Buddhist receiving membership status of the Nishi Honganji in Kyōto. His path was later resumed by another pioneer of Austro-Buddhism, Friedrich Fenzl (1932–2014), in Salzburg. Zouzelka was also the administrator of the lending library of the Vienna Buddhist Society. Professionally, he worked as a constructor in the Floridsdorf locomotive factory. His wife Angela (1923–1997) was a midwife and, like his mother Anna (d. 1969), interested in Buddhism. He eventually fell ill with a brain tumour and committed suicide in 1965.

127 See Zouzelka 1955a (most likely translated from the German by Bennett): “Translation into German of large parts of the Pali Canon, according to Theravadin tradition the Discourses of the Buddha, were made for the first time by Dr. K. E. Neumann. He was a Buddhist and, by his commentary and translation, beautiful both as regards interpretation of the inner meaning and choice of words, he succeeded in bringing the good things of Buddhist thought to the German-speaking countries. It was known in the Buddhist Society [of Vienna] that K. E. Neumann had worked in Vienna and had died there, but it was only after prolonged investigations that it became possible to locate the site of the grave. On 18th October 1955 the efforts of our President, Fritz Hungerleider, reached a positive conclusion. We learnt that Neumann had died in Vienna on 18th October 1915 and that he was buried in the Vienna Central Cemetery. So, precisely on the 40th anniversary of the day of his death, it first became possible for Herr Hungerleider to visit his grave. Further, we came to know that the rights of the grave, which was entirely uncared-for, had already lapsed. That is to say, the Cemetery Authorities had, until now, the right to allot the site anew. This immediate danger was removed by the Buddhist Society's petitioning the Bureau of Culture (Kultursamt [*sic*]) of the City of Vienna to assume charge of the grave, bring it into worthy condition and maintain it. Pending the granting of this request, the site cannot be disposed of. Should the authorities not comply with our request, the Buddhist Society will purchase and care for the grave. On 1st November 1955, the Vienna Buddhists visited the cemetery. In the name of the Society, our President laid a wreath on Neumann's grave and read from his translation of the Dhammapada. With a short address from Prof. O. S. Matura [i.e., Ottokar “Siddharta” Matura (1905–1972)], who described in moving words how in his earlier years Neumann's translations had led him to Buddhism, the simple celebration at the Vienna Cemetery was brought to a dignified conclusion.”

9, Northland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
29th February 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter of the 14th [sic].

I wrote at once to Calcutta asking them to change “chain of dependent origination” to “chain of dependent-simultaneous origination”, and also to alter “as regards” for “beziehungsweise” to “or”. If the corrections are not made in MBJ at least they can be put in in [sic] the retyping of the various sheets for Allen & Unwin. I will look again into the matter of “knäuslartig [sic] verfilzt”. Psycho-analysis is deprecated in these parts only because of the extraordinary people connected with it, but that is nothing to do with a scientific treatise on the subject. I ought not to have introduced the point, but, as you said I had three people inside me. I will venture to add there is a fourth which in serious moments bobs up in unseemly light-hearted fashion. He/she/it is: “The ? rose and twitched his mantle blue; To-morrow to fresh woods and pastures new”.<sup>128</sup> I have long forgotten what “?” is and avoid looking it up, in case it is not the joyful thing I feel it to be! Many apologies!

I send herewith a translation of the conspectus of the Prachtnetz. It will want looking into because I cannot find the English equivalents of some of the details, such as: Prästabilien Harmonie (Leibniz)<sup>129</sup> (Page 3). The Arupa<sup>130</sup> states on page 6 of the German text, page 7 English, come out quite well, but the Jhanic states, page 7 German, page 8 English, are not so satisfactory. I have put “Jhāna”<sup>131</sup> for “Versenkung” because the former English terms “Trance, ecstasy, rapture” are misleading and have been abandoned here for some time. Far from suggesting a state of extreme concentration they suggest definite lack of control. Nowadays people use the Pali terms and put the nearest English equivalents in brackets; in the case of the Jhanic states, for the five psychic factors<sup>132</sup> concerned these are:

---

128 Bennett quotes the last two lines in John Milton’s (1608–1674) poem *Lycidas* (1637): “At last he rose, and twitch’d his mantle blue: To-morrow to fresh woods, and pastures new.”

129 Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz (1646–1716), the great German philosopher and polymath.

130 See note 38.

131 Pāli (Sanskrit: *dhyāna*); “meditative absorption.”

132 Bennett alludes to *jhānaṅga* (Sanskrit: *dhyānāṅga*), the five constituents of *jhāna* or meditative absorption.



- Vitakka<sup>133</sup> – initial applicatoon [*sic*] of the mind to the object.  
 Vicāra<sup>134</sup> – sustained application of the mind to the object  
 Pīti<sup>135</sup> – a thrill of pleasant sensation regarding the prospective realisation of the immediate goal, as for example a thirsty traveller experiences when he thinks of the water he will drink on arrival at his destination.

- Sukha<sup>136</sup> – ease  
 Ekaggatā<sup>137</sup> – one-pointedness of mind.

In the 2nd Jhāna vitakka is excluded, in the 3rd, vicāra, in the 4th pīti, and in the 5th sukha is substituted by upekkhā<sup>138</sup> (equanimity, or indifference). All these stages move forward if vitakka and vicāra, in view of their close proximity, are taken as one factor. This is all according to Abhidhamma where the Arūpa states are all 5th Jhāna [*sic*], but B-J Sutta<sup>139</sup> condenses the matter and names Arūpa states first without connecting them to 5th Jhāna. None of the foregoing matters to us in the present translation except in so far as one has to produce some English terms; I have taken the nearest to your German, but later on it might come to seem advisable that Pali terms should be introduced, in brackets of course. I can't guage [*sic*] this because my study in the realms of philosophy came in the order: Hindu, Greek, Buddhist, with the modern scientific stuff always going on at the same time; but I have no knowledge whatever of Western philosophy so that Descartes,<sup>140</sup> Leibniz and such like convey very little to me. One does not see back to the basis from which they argued.<sup>141</sup>

Thank you very much for sending me the observations on the Potthapada Sutta. If I may say so, it seemed to me the very best you have written, but that is not a fair verdict because it is exactly what I think and feel myself. I liked particularly: "Buddha zeigt --- dass, so wie alles in seiner Lehre, --- keine mystischen Ekstasen oder Erhebungen der Seele in überirdische Bereiche sind, sondern ganz natürliche psychische Vorgänge, die jeder Mensch bei hiezu [*sic*] geeingneten [*sic*] Anlagen und nach Einhalten eines bestimmten Uebungsganges [*sic*] für sich erleben kann." And on throughout the page,

---

133 Pāli (Sanskrit: *vitarka*); "applied attention" or "applied thought."

134 "sustained attention" or "sustained thought."

135 Pāli (Sanskrit: *prīti*); "physical rapture" or "physical joy."

136 "mental bliss" or "mental ease."

137 Pāli (Sanskrit: *ekāgratā*); "one-pointedness."

138 Pāli (Sanskrit: *upekṣā*); "equanimity."

139 That is, the *Brahmajālasutta*.

140 The French polymath René Descartes (1596–1650).

141 A handwritten addition by Bennett.

again particularly: “Gibt es für Buddha aber kein Selbst, so können die Wahrnehmungen, ----- nicht als Funktionen eines Selbst aufgefasst werden, sie sind nichts anderes als Lebenserscheinungen --- ” I thought the climax concerning Anatta beautiful. How long have I tried to “hammer” in a dozen articles: “Yo so [*sic*] āvuso bhikkhu evaṃ jānāti evaṃ passati, kallaṃ nu kho tass’ etaṃ vacanāya ‘taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīraṃ’ ti vā ‘aññaṃ jīvaṃ aññaṃ sarīraṃ’ ti vā ti?” (Mahāli S. I6).<sup>142</sup> Would a bhikkhu, knowing thus and seeing thus, consider suitable – “kalla” being clever, healthy or suitable – the theme (talk): is the jīva the same thing as the body, or is the jīva one thing and the body another? The exact theme is not so important, of course, as the recognition that problems arise by reason of misconception of the nature of a situation, or even by assuming that there is a “situation”; when the misconceptions are corrected the problems are not so much solved as that they cease to exist. I often wish a better word could be found for “kalla” – I think “intelligent” is the best so far but it is not a strict translation. I would like to keep your Potthapada. if I may, and put it into MBJ later on.

Please don’t worry about sending back the Inhaltsangabe [i.e., table of contents] as I will let you have the translation of the Foreword in a few days’ time and you can return both together. Also Allen & Unwin may as well have a few days to get over the cold weather! The thermometer here was not nearly as low as with you, but we did get 160 hours of frost, most of it heavy, and we just haven’t the clothes or the heating to cope with extremes. You are absolutely the only person I have heard who does not “go off the deep end” when one mentions the cold spell – except perhaps my husband who is prejudiced particularly against damp! Why hell is always taken to be hot I can’t imagine [*sic*]; this last month has been agony to most people. I wonder how your wife got on? It is good that you like the cold, anyway; that would have been a relief for her.

With many grateful thanks for the kind thought and good wishes of Mrs Kropatsch and yourself, and always best wishes to you from both of us

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

---

<sup>142</sup> Bennett quotes a Pāli passage from the last portion of the *Mahālisutta* (Discourse to Mahāli), the sixth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*. For her contemporaneous partial translation of this *sutta*, see Bennett 1954e. This refrain, she translates as “Would a bhikkhu, knowing thus and seeing thus, consider suitable the theme; ‘Is the jīva the same as the body, or is the jīva one thing and the body another?’” (Bennett 1954e: 486). For the Pāli, see Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1890: 157.

P.S. I see I still have not stated in so many words that I am proposing to send the List of Contents and Foreword (Transl=) of Prachtnetz to Allen + Unwin.<sup>143</sup>

I am taking pages one and the top of two from the main script of Prachtnetz from the Vorwort. The typescript entitled 'Vorwort', which you sent me on 14/8/55, concern. Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas.<sup>144</sup>

## 2.2.7. Kropatsch to Bennett (March 10, 1956)

### *Translation*

Dr. Anton Kropatsch

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

10 March 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you for sending me the two manuscripts and the December issue of the Maha Bodhi Journal. But in medias res! What would you say to the title "The Splendid Net" instead of "The supreme Net"? I believe that the word "Pracht" [i.e., splendour] would be a better rendering, and that the various philosophical views are meant to entice and invite one to linger through their "schillernde Pracht" [i.e., iridescent splendour]. But if your translation seems better to you, I have no objection. I have already made most of the small changes in the text by pencil, but I would ask you to peruse and check them again before the final transcription. I have highlighted only four points:<sup>145</sup>

- 1 "Prästabilierte Harmonie" [i.e., pre-established harmony] (Leibniz)
- 2 "Clarification of the Existence" ("Existenzerhellung" [i.e., existential illumination]) by "Jumping in the Transcendental" ("Sprung in die Transzendenz" [i.e., leap into transcendence]) (Jaspers)<sup>146</sup>
- 3 Analysis of the thought of imperturbability
- 4 "Deliverance by insight" and "Freedom in both ways"

---

143 This and the passage below are handwritten additions by Bennett.

144 See Appendix II.

145 The list is given in English in the original except for the three German terms in quotation marks.

146 The German philosopher and existentialist Karl Jaspers (1883–1969). Kropatsch referenced *Die geistige Situation der Zeit* (The Spiritual Situation of the Time; 1937, translated into English in 1957 as *Man in the Modern Age*) in his second book where he also quotes the leap into transcendence (*transzendenter Sprung*) (Kropatsch 1963: 163–164).

I don't know a suitable English translation for Leibniz's "Prästabilisierte Harmonie" either. One could most likely find it in Bertrand Russell's "History of Western Philosophy." As far as I remember, there Russell treats Leibniz in a separate chapter. Sadly, I do not have the book and cannot go and check in the Vienna National Library. Alternatively, we will simply stick to the original German designation, as with the Pali word "Jhana." For individual terms that are difficult to render, I suggest that we add the original German designation in brackets to the English text, like I have inserted it. Well, this would be all and I now kindly ask you to forward the table of contents and the preface, the translation of which I like very much, together with the "Leib-Seele-Problem" to the publisher. Many thanks in advance.

A few days ago, Dr Klar returned to Europe from Isfahan to take up a position as a medical consultant with a pharmaceutical company in Heidelberg. Passing through Vienna, he visited me and told me a lot about Ceylon and Burma and the Buddhist life in these countries. "All that glitters is not gold either" with the occasional exception of the pagodas. He was very impressed by Dudanduwa<sup>147</sup> and the English and German monks living there. Unfortunately, Nyanatiloka, whom he visited in Candy,<sup>148</sup> is severely ill and Klar could only speak to him very little. Like a legacy, his last words to Klar were: "The most important thing about Buddhism is the anatta problem." This is not new, but it cannot be said often enough, for on it really depends the correct understanding of the teaching. Whoever strays one step from the track in this respect inevitably goes astray. As Klar went on to report, four Sinhalese monks want to open the Buddhist mission in Germany this year in a vihara in Hamburg, and the necessary funds are already available to quite an extent. It would perhaps have been better if European monks had taken on this task, but these are apparently not interested in any missionary work. Especially one German monk in D. [i.e., Dudanduwa] strictly rejected a return to Germany for he wants to live only for his own perfectioning. Who could hold this against him. Dr Klar is a very dear person with whom I am on cordial terms despite his comparative young age. Even though he comes from Prussia, his heart is attached to Vienna (his wife is Viennese) and to his Viennese friends. I know only few people who take Buddhism as seriously as he does, and not only talk about it, but also strive to live it.

I am very pleased that you liked my reflection on the "Potthapada." It is of course available to you for translation and possible publication.

---

147 In 1911, Nāṇatiloka established a hermitage on Dodanduwa Island, later known as Island Hermitage, which became a rallying point for Western Buddhist monks.

148 In 1951, Nāṇatiloka relocated to Kandy, a city in central Sri Lanka, where he founded the Forest Hermitage.

Now, fortunately – sit venia verbo – it has become colder again. During the warm spell I was not feeling very well and for a few days I had to expiate quite unpleasantly for somewhat overstepping my limits in walking training (climbing only seven stairs). Sadly, you never know beforehand where the limit is, only afterwards you are at the end of your tether. When I recall that just a few days before my illness I was walking uphill and downhill for a whole day without any effort at all in the Wienerwald, which is a hilly forest area in the immediate vicinity of Vienna – you can see from this how beautiful it is here – I almost cannot believe that there have ever been such “paradisically beautiful” days in my life. Dear Madam, make the most of your days and enjoy the beauty of nature whenever you can. There your fourth soul, which, frankly, I have not fully grasped based on your poetic description, will also find tranquility and peace and at most make “leaps of joy.” Sadly, there is little chance that I will be able to leave the flat in the foreseeable future, except for another examination in a hospital. Perhaps a remedy can be found to get me “back on my feet.”

My wife extends her thanks for your kind greetings and returns them most cordially. I also send you, dear Madam, as well as your husband, my very best regards.

Your devoted  
AK

### *Original*

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

10.III.1956

Liebe, geehrte, gnädige Frau!

Vielen Dank für die Uebersendung der beiden Manuskripte und der Dezember-Nummer des Maha Bodhi Journals. Doch gleich in medias res! Was würden Sie zum Titel “The Splendid Net” statt “The supreme Net” sagen? Ich glaube, dass das Wort “Pracht” damit besser wiedergegeben wäre, und die verschiedenen philosophischen Anschauungen sollen ja durch ihre “schillernde Pracht” [*sic*] verlocken und zum Verweilen einladen. Doch wenn Ihnen Ihre Uebertragung besser erscheint, habe ich nichts dagegen.–Die meisten kleinen Umänderungen habe ich bereits im Text mit Bleistift vorgenommen, doch bitte ich, diese vor der endgültigen Niederschrift noch einmal durchzusehen und zu überprüfen. Nur 4 habe ich besonders herausgehoben: 1 “Prästabilisierte Harmonie” (Leibniz)

2 “Clarification of the Existence” (“Existenzerhellung”) by “Jumping in the Transcendental” (“Sprung in die Transzendenz”) (Jaspers)

3 Analysis of the thought of imperturbability

4 “Deliverance by insight” and “Freedom in both ways”

Für die “Prästabilisierte Harmonie” von Leibniz weiss ich auch keine passende englische Uebersetzung, man könnte sie höchstens in Bertrand Russell’s “History of western philosophie” [*sic*] finden; soviel ich mich erinnere behandelt dort Russell Leibniz in einem eigenen Kapitel. Doch besitze ich leider das Buch nicht und kann es auch nicht in der Wiener National Bibliothek [*sic*] einsehen.—Sonst bleiben wir ganz einfach bei der deutschen Originalbezeichnung, wie beim Pali-Wort “Jhana”. Für einzelne schwierig wiederzugebende Ausdrücke schlage ich vor, dem englischen Text die deutsche Originalbezeichnung in Klammern beizugeben, so wie ich sie eingefügt habe.—So, das wäre alles, und ich bitte Sie nun, das Inhaltsverzeichnis und das Vorwort, dessen Uebersetzung mir sehr gut gefällt, zusammen mit dem “Leib-Seele-Problem” an den Verlag weiterzuleiten. Vielen Dank im vorhinein [*sic*].

Vor einigen Tagen kehrte Dr. Klar aus Isfahan nach Europa zurück, um eine Stellung als ärztlicher Berater bei einer pharmazeutischen Firma in Heidelberg anzutreten. Auf der Durchfahrt besuchte er mich und erzählte viel von Ceylon und Burma und dem buddhistischen Leben in diesen Ländern. “Es ist auch nicht alles Gold, was glänzt” mit Ausnahme der Pagoden und auch diese nicht immer. Sehr beeindruckt war er von Dudanduwa und den dort lebenden englischen und deutschen Mönchen. Leider ist Nyanatiloka, den er in Candy besuchte, schwer krank und Klar konnte nur sehr wenig mit ihm sprechen. Wie ein Vermächtnis waren seine letzten Worte zu Klar: “Das Wichtigste am Buddhismus ist das Anatta-Problem”. Das ist zwar nicht neu, aber es kann nicht oft genug gesagt werden, denn an ihm hängt wirklich die richtige Auffassung der Lehre. Wer hier einen Schritt vom Wege abweicht, geht unweigerlich in die Irre.—Wie Klar weiter erzählte, wollen noch in diesem Jahr 4 sinhalaisische Mönche in einem Vihara in Hamburg die buddhistische Mission in Deutschland eröffnen, die nötigen Geldmittel stehen bereits in ziemlicher Höhe zur Verfügung. Besser wäre es vielleicht, wenn europäische Mönche diese Aufgabe übernommen hätten, aber diese wolte von einer Missionstätigkeit scheinbar nichts wissen, besonders ein deutscher Mönch in D. lehnte jede Rückkehr nach Deutschland ab und will nur seiner eigenen Vervollkommenung leben; es ist ihm nicht zu verargen.—Dr. Klar ist ein sehr lieber Mensch, mit dem ich mich trotz seiner vergleichswisen Jugend freundschaftlich verbunden fühle. Auch er hängt, trotzdem er aus Preussen stammt, mit seinem Herzen an Wien (seine Frau ist Wienerin) und an seinen Wiener Freunden. Ich kenne wenig Menschen, die es so ernst mit dem Buddhismus

nehmen wie er, und ihn nicht nur im Munde führen, sondern auch nach ihm zu leben trachten.

Dass Ihnen meine Betrachtung zum "Potthapada" gefallen hat, freut mich sehr, es steht Ihnen natürlich zur Uebersetzung und ev. Veröffentlichung zur Verfügung.

Nun ist es glücklicherweise-sit venia verbo-wieder kälter geworden, während des Warmlufteinbruches ging es mir nicht besonders gut und ich hatte eine kleine Limit-Ueberschreitung im Geh-Training (das Steigen von nur 7 Treppeinstufen) durch einige Tage recht unangenehm zu büßen; leider weiss man vorher nie, wo die Grenze ist, nur nachher ist man mit seinen Kräften am Ende. Wenn ich denke, dass ich noch einige Tage vor meiner Erkrankung im "Wiener Wald", einem hügeligen Waldgebiet in der unmittelbaren Umgebung Wiens-Sie sehen daraus, wie schön es bei uns ist-, einen ganzen Tag ohne jegliche Mühe bergauf und bergab gewandert bin, so kann ich es fast nicht glauben, dass es jemals so "paradiesisch-schöne" Tage in meinem Leben gegeben hat. Liebe gnädige Frau, nutzen Sie ihre Tage und genießen Sie, wann immer es nur geht, die Schönheit der Natur. Dort wird auch Ihre vierte Seele, die ich, offen gestanden, nach Ihrer poetischen Schilderung nicht vollkommen erfasst habe, Ruhe und Frieden finden und höchstens "Freudensprünge" machen.-Leider besteht wenig Aussicht, dass ich in absehbarer Zeit die Wohnung werde verlassen können, ausser zu einer neuerlichen Untersuchung in einem Spital. Vielleicht lässt sich doch ein Mittel finden, dass mich etwas "auf die Beine" bringt.

Meine Frau dankt Ihnen für die lieben Grüsse und erwidert diese auf das Herzlichste. Auch ich sende Ihnen, liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau, und Ihrem Herrn Gemahl recht schöne Grüsse.

Ihr ergebener  
AK

## 2.2.8. Bennett to Kropatsch (April 13, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
13th April 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

You will be pleased to hear that at last I have been able to send the scripts of the Conspectus, Foreword and Leib-Seels [*sic*] Problem to Allen & Unwin. I posted them yesterday afternoon. I waited to reply to your letter of 10th

March – for which many thanks – until I could say “I have posted to A.&U.” rather than “I am posting”. I changed to “The Splendid Net” and made the other four alterations as you said; “Prästabilisierte Harmonie” I left for the moment as I have been to snowed under with work to get up to the Ref. Library, and “Jhana” stands anyway.

I was very glad to hear that Dr. Klar had left Isfahan; it always seemed to me to be a precarious business out there. The account of the state of Buddhist affairs in S.E. Asia agreed with everything I have heard here from the people returning from the Congress etc. It seems that in Burma about 80% of the bhikkus have their reserved seats at cinemas etc. and that the viharas<sup>149</sup> – or the residential centres of some of them – blare all day with loud-speakers, all of which played at the same time that the broadcast of the Scripture-readings was coming through. On the other hand, 20% of the Sangha<sup>150</sup> there were really very fine men. Ceylon seems as bad – or worse. The Buddhist monks are reported as being responsible for the results of the recent election, the outgoing ministers having cut down on their privileges, but whether the resulting new government is an improvement or not is beside the point here since the Sangha should not occupy themselves with politics. Some of the returning Buddhists say the Sinhalese bhikkus are horribly ignorant, as a whole, and that the so-called “Meditation” centres in Burma are sheer frauds. I think myself that, without the work of the Germans and British during the last century – perhaps to some extent the French though theirs is largely confined to academics – Buddhism would have dwindled into obscurity, if not into actual disgrace. Do any of the Asiatics care for it except for garlands, pagodas and suchlike? I was sorry to hear Ven. Nyanatiloka was so ill – he has had a long, hard life – and I do agree entirely that “Das Wichtigste am Buddhismus ist das Anatta-Problem.”<sup>151</sup> Sometimes I think the classic Brahman “discovering of the Atman” is dealt with better than much of the Buddhist writings on atta, but even the best-known of the modern Indian writers – Radhakrishnan and Hiriyanna not excepted – are miles away from the real idea. Perhaps the Greeks were nearest – that truth is not inherited as a tradition but is available only by individual discovery. In that case no one can make a pronouncement concerning atman, or atta, which will hold as a definition to be universally accepted. Perhaps, also, a European who feels he has learnt something of it by living in the East, fears to lose it if he should return to the West; very likely he would lose it – I know the change, though it is very subtle, that comes in letters from European monks after they have been

---

149 Pāli/Sanskrit: *vihāra*; Buddhist “monastery.”

150 Pāli: *saṅgha* (Sanskrit: *saṃgha*); Buddhist “community.”

151 “The most important thing about Buddhism is the anatta problem.”



writing even two pages to another European; one just becomes aware that the person in question has dropped into the European train-tracks of thinking. How much more so if he comes back to live in a Western country? But does that matter? Is not the apparent freedom he may feel himself to have gained merely a faint lulling of his former way of thinking? Fundamentally he is not changed, in which case he could learn and practice his Buddhism as well here as elsewhere, always assuming he had a room of his own to which he could retire to work and think. U Thittila,<sup>152</sup> the Burmese bhikku who lived in England for about fifteen years, said that wearing the yellow robe did not of itself make any difference whatever; the wearer remained “himself”. On the other side, of course, Europeans still cling to the notion – though perhaps less so than a few years ago – that the Societies and Viharas etc. must have Eastern bhikkus or bhikshus to teach in them. It seems to me that it all depends on the men themselves, irrespective of colour or race. Certainly some of the Eastern bhikkus who come over are as full of ambition and pride as any Westerner could be, and if they are ohly [*sic*] going to preach a moral code they are better to stay in their own countries. What is needed is “those other things, subtle, duifficult [*sic*] to appreciate --- etc.” of which the Brahma-jāla Sutta speaks. Germans and British know the mentality of their own peoples and are the best to lead their own countrymen on. I am glad Hamburg Vihara sounds promising but I do hope you get a German staff for it.

I look for the weather every week in the Sunday Times, which gives accounts of all the Continental cities and resorts generally, and have seen that you had another cold spell followed again by a warm one. There are just no words to express how I feel about your both being unable to go out and about in the fresh air, and no doubt it is better not to try to say anything; all the same, alternating with feelings of recognition that so many awful things happen and have happened, I am convinced that what passes for life here is never more than a phase, or series of phases, which has nothing whatever to do with reality or one’s real habitat. That isn’t intended as merely a Buddhist sentiment; it is a thing I have always known even as a small child. I don’t believe that anything recognised here, scientific, medical or any other “facts” are final. Therefore when you say a means will occur by which you may be able to get on your feet again, whether or not as a doctor you consider such an event feasible, I maintain that there is a solution.

---

152 Ashin Thittila (1896–1997) was a Burmese monk scholar. He spent fourteen years in England from 1938 to 1952. Like Bennett he worked some time at the Library of the Buddhist Society.

Don't be surprised if some strange looking papers reach you from India. Last summer I had word from the British Editor of MBJ<sup>153</sup> that he was starting a small journal in Kalimpong<sup>154</sup> for the Nepalese.<sup>155</sup> He asked me to write a few things, the simplest possible, about 5-800 words each. I knew a little of the Nepalese from Darjeeling and the district tea gardens where we used to go years ago for week-ends sometimes; they were a very simple people, Mongolian, of course, happy and contented like all the hill people, with nothing of the Bengali subtlety about them. I sent a few pieces – fortunately there is that Dīgha sutta about a Nepali asking Ananda<sup>156</sup> what the Buddha taught<sup>157</sup> – and heard sometime later that they were just what was wanted. However, no copies of the paper reached me, though I heard from local people that it was in circulation. Then, about a month ago the Dec. number arrived. In it were the last two of my things – the others had already been used apparently – and a “grand” article from Dr. Roerich.<sup>158</sup> The third contribution was from another British Buddhist – a Soto Zen priest<sup>159</sup> – who told the readers that they were all of them Buddhas! Possibly the back page, by the Nepalese Editor – the British Ed. I knew was in Bombay – who held forth on the state of the surround of Buddha Gaya<sup>160</sup> etc., was the best of the lot as the English was too priceless. There was also a request, not for funds but for subscriptions to be taken out as gifts. So I took out another sub. and told the authorities to send a year's copies to you, thinking that you would be amused if nothing else. (Don't say I said that, of course!!) A few days later I had a note from

---

153 That is, Sangharakshita.

154 An Indian city in the state of West Bengal (nearby Darjeeling) where Sangharakshita lived from 1950 to 1964.

155 From July 1950 to February 1952, Sangharakshita edited *Stepping-Stones*, a “monthly journal of Himalayan religion, culture and education” (Kalyanaprabha 2013: 51), which also included a Nepali language section. However, this was several years before the apparent start of “a small journal in Kalimpong for the Nepalese” to which Bennett reportedly contributed. I could not trace this short-lived journal. Below Bennett mentions the publication of an article by Roerich (see note 158). Yet, Roerich's publishing collaboration with Sangharakshita as editor was limited to two articles in the latter's *Stepping-Stones*.

156 According to tradition, Ānanda was the Buddha's cousin and one of his chief disciples.

157 Bennett alludes to the *Subhasutta* (Discourse to Subha), the tenth *sutta* of the *Dīghanikāya*. For her partial contemporaneous translation of this sutta, see Bennett 1955c: 285–286.

158 The Russian Tibetologist George Nicolas de Roerich (1902–1960).

159 The Sōtō school is one of the two major traditions of Japanese Zen Buddhism.

160 The city of Bodhgayā, where—according to tradition—Gautama achieved Buddhahood.

the British Ed. to say the paper had amalgamated with another called Buddhist India,<sup>161</sup> so whether you will get the first paper or the second, or both, or neither, I just don't know. You don't need to acknowledge whatever arrives, not to the Indians at least, but I should be interested to hear if you do ever get anything. I haven't a foggy idea what Buddhist India is like.

With many thanks for your kind thoughts for us both and very best greeting to Mrs Kropatsch and yourself

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.2.9. Bennett to Kropatsch (April 20, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
20th April 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Just a short line to say that the morning's post brought me the following from Allen & Unwin: "Thank you for your letter and for the synopsis of Dr. Kropatsch's book *THE SPLENDID NET*. If you care to send it to us we will be very happy to give it our careful consideration, though we cannot, of course, promise that we shall be able to make an offer for its publication." – which is as much as we could hope for on the first round! The letter does not say specifically that they have received the translation of Leib-Seele Problem, but they must have since the Foreword, Synopsis and translation of excerpt all went together. The written signature is that of one of the Unwins – the initial I think is "S", which would mean Sir Stanley U.<sup>162</sup> himself, I suppose; the typed signature is that of the firm, of course.

So keep smiling, and don't exceed your "limit"!

Very best wishes to you both

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

---

<sup>161</sup> A journal by the same name was launched in 1927 by the Nepalese scholar of Buddhism Dharmaditya Dharmacharya (1902–1963) and the Indian scholar of Buddhism Benimadhab Barua (1888–1948). However, this journal was probably short-lived and is not the one mentioned by Bennett.

<sup>162</sup> See note 60.

## 2.2.10. Kropatsch to Bennett (April 24, 1956)

*Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

24 April 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your two kind letters of 13 and 20 April. I am presently wondering about which I am most pleased: the good reception of your letter and your translation by Allen & Unwin or the loving care that speaks from your lines. Yet, there is actually no doubt at all that it is the latter that I am most pleased about. When one is alone with one's thoughts for the greater part of the day, not distracted by professional work or unnecessary visits, one acquires a peculiar sensitivity for the words written by people one has never seen. The thoughts that are expressed in these words or lie unuttered between the lines suddenly present a clear and distinct picture of this person and all at once she has become a dear friend whom one no longer wants to miss. One does not know how it happened, but one is happy about it. That is how I feel about you and the good thoughts that reach my wife and me in your letters and for which we thank you very much. What you have written about the problem of "Buddhism in Ceylon and Burma" is interesting but also rather saddening. All the greater must be our efforts in Europe to preserve the teachings in their original simplicity and purity, and if Englishmen and Germans are working hand in hand here, that is for me a beautiful proof of the inner bond between these two so closely related peoples, for the further strengthening of a spiritual bond which even two terrible, fratricidal wars could not sever. Even if the European is not able to understand or experience the thoughts of the East in exactly the same way again – this impossibility exists not only between East and West, but also between the generations of parents and children and between people of the same age living door to door in the same house – if the West is compelled and also does well to translate the Indian or Chinese or Japanese conceptions of a philosophical or religious problem, such as the "atta," into his own language, he will not experience the same as the Easterner, but he will perhaps in his own way come to an experience which in its effects is close to or almost equal to those of the East. Thus the consequences of the Western anatta experience will differ only slightly from those of the Indian, and greed, hatred, and delusion will weaken or almost disappear in him as well. He too will perhaps experience that freedom from a self – the self-lessness – leads to selflessness in his actions, and in his

conception of Buddhism too, metta<sup>163</sup> will break forth like a blossom from the plant. You already know that with such considerations I do not want to smuggle some unrecognisable atta into the anatta teaching. Nothing is further from my mind, but I believe that we will come to a good understanding of the notion of anatta in other ways than the Southeast Asians. We just cannot deny and discard our science-based education, especially the natural sciences, but must use it to penetrate to the correct understanding of the teachings. Hence my efforts, as in the “Prachtnetz,” to connect Buddhism and modern science.

Dr Klar, the loyal and active Buddhist friend, has already made the acquaintance of a Dr Kopp<sup>164</sup> in Heidelberg, a former student of the late Indologist Walleser.<sup>165</sup> Dr Kopp wants to republish Walleser’s former Buddhist series “Materialien zur Kunde des Buddh. [sic]”<sup>166</sup> and has already made arrangements with a publisher who now wants to publish a larger section from my “Betrachtungen zu d. Reden B.”<sup>167</sup> as one of the first publications in this series. Only the day before yesterday a Viennese Buddhist who was with the two Gentlemen in Heidelberg brought me this news; and yesterday your letter arrived. It suffices for me if a large English publishing house shows interest and is prepared to publish a German work on B. This is another small step towards the spread of the teachings. And to make things complete, on Saturday – that is, three good days in a row – I received a letter from the Municipality of Vienna, in whose service I had been for almost 25 years and which had dismissed me from my post as head of lupus treatment and care in Austria after the Second World War, informing me that in view of the “undeniable merits” (it is good to hear such appreciative words again for the first time after eleven years) which I had acquired for the welfare of my patients during

---

163 Pāli: *mettā* (Sanskrit: *maitrī*), that is, “loving-kindness.”

164 Hermann Kopp (1902–1987) was a German Indologist and closest disciple of Walleser. He inherited the Walleser estate.

165 Max Walleser (1874–1954) was a German Indologist based at Heidelberg University. He was particularly known for his *Die buddhistische Philosophie in ihrer geschichtlichen Entwicklung. Erster Teil: Die philosophische Grundlage des älteren Buddhismus* (Buddhist Philosophy in Its Historical Development. Part One: The Philosophical Basis of Older Buddhism; 1904).

166 *Materialien zur Kunde des Buddhismus* (Materials for the Study of Buddhism), a book series edited by Walleser comprising twenty-one titles and running from 1923 to 1940. Kopp’s plan never transpired.

167 This plan in fact materialised in 1957 with the publication of Kropatsch 1957a at Avalun-Verlag in Büdingen-Gettenbach, which was a short-lived imprint of Heinrich Schwab Lebensweiser Verlag und Druckerei (then Lebensweiser-Verlag). To this day the publisher specialises on esoterica and Asian spirituality/religion. The book contains chapter nine of his manuscript *Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas*.

National Socialist times, they are now prepared to pay me a pension which they had previously withheld from me. Accordingly, I am now free of material worries and hope that this will have a favourable effect on my state of health, all the more so because I can now also take medical and rehabilitation measures that were previously impossible for me because I was not supported by any health insurance. So you see, not only misfortune – as has mostly been the case in my life so far – but also good fortune seldom comes alone. Please do not be angry with me for telling you all this, but I want to let you know not only about my sad experiences, but also about my golden hours.

The announced mail from Nepal has not yet arrived. Should it come, I will use it not for instruction but for amusement and diversion, as you recommended. Many thanks also for this mediation.

I had to include a small correction for the “Prachtnetz” in the enclosure. In Dahlke’s translation, which I used for my work, a not unimportant part of the Discourse had unfortunately not been replicated, probably due to an oversight on the part of the publisher. I saw [...].<sup>168</sup>

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

24. April 1956.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Haben Sie vielen Dank für Ihre beiden freundlichen Briefe vom 13. und 20.4. Ich überlege gerade, worüber ich mich sehr freue, über die gute Aufnahme Ihres Schreibes [*sic*] und Ihrer Uebersetzung durch Allen & Unwin oder über die liebevolle Fürsorge, die aus Ihren Zeilen spricht; doch da gibt es gar keinen Zweifel, es ist das letztere worüber ich mich ganz besonders freue. Wenn man so den größten Teil des Tages mit seinen Gedanken allein ist, nicht abgelenkt durch berufliche Arbeit oder unnötige Besuche, so bekommt man ein eigentümliches Fingerspitzengefühl für die Worte, die von Menschen geschrieben werden, die man nie gesehen hat. Die Gedanken, die in diesen Worten zum Ausdruck kommen oder unausgesprochen zwischen den Zeilen liegen, geben plötzlich ein klares und deutliches Bild dieses Menschen und auf einmal ist er einem ein lieber Freund geworden, den man nicht mehr missen will. Man weiss gar nicht, wie das so gekommen ist, aber man freut sich darüber und ist glücklich. So geht es mir mit Ihnen und den guten Gedanken, die in Ihren Briefen meine Frau und mich erreichen und für die wir Ihnen herzlich

---

168 The remaining text is not extant.

danken. Was Sie über das Problem “Buddhismus in Ceylon und Burma” geschrieben haben, ist zwar interessant aber auch recht betrüblich. Umso grösser muss unsere Anstrengung in Europa sein, die Lehre in ihrer ursprünglichen Einfachheit und Reinheit zu bewahren, und wenn hier Engländer und Deutsche Hand in Hand arbeiten, so ist das für mich ein schöner Beweis der inneren Verbundenheit dieser beiden so nahe verwandten Völker, zur weiteren Festigung eines geistigen Bandes, das selbst zwei schauerliche, brudermörderische Kriege nicht zerreißen konnten. Es ist wirklich genau so, wie Sie es sagten, ohne die englischen und deutschen Buddhisten und Buddhologen der letzten hundert Jahre wäre es um die Erhaltung der reinen Lehre schlecht bestellt gewesen. Wenn der Europäer auch nicht im Stande ist, die Gedanken des Ostens genau so wieder dieser zu verstehen oder zu erleben – diese Unmöglichkeit besteht nicht nur zwischen Ost und West, sondern auch zwischen den Generationen der Eltern und Kinder und zwischen den gleichaltrigen Menschen eines Hauses, die Tür an Tür wohnen-, wenn der Westen genötigt ist und auch gut daran tut, die indischen oder chinesischen oder japanischen Auffassungen eines philosophischen oder religiösen Problems, wie z.B. des “Atta”, in seine Sprache zu übersetzen, so wird er zwar nicht das Gleiche erleben wie der Ostländer, aber er wird vielleicht auf seine Art zu einem Erlebnis kommen, das in seinen Auswirkungen denen des Ostens nahe oder fast gleich kommt. So werden die Folgen des westlichen Anatta-Erlebnisses sich nur wenig von denen des Inders unterscheiden, auch bei ihm werden Gier, Hass und Wahn sich abschwächen oder fast schwinden, auch er wird es vielleicht erleben, dass die Freiheit von einem Selbst, die Selbstlosigkeit zur Selbstlosigkeit seines Handelns führt und auch in seiner Auffassung des Buddhismus wird die Metta wie eine Blüte aus der Pflanze hervorbrennen. Sie wissen schon, dass ich mit solchen Ueberlegungen nicht irgend ein unerkennbares Atta in die Anatta-Lehre einschmuggeln will, nichts liegt mir ferner, aber ich glaube, dass wir zu einem guten Verständnis des Anatta-Gedankens auf andere Weise wie die Südasiaten kommen werden. Wir können nun einmal unsere auf dem Boden der Wissenschaften und besonders der Naturwissenschaften gründende Bildung nicht verleugnen und ablegen, sondern müssen sie benutzen, um zur richtigen Erfassung der Lehre durchzudringen. Daher meine Bemühungen, wie auch im “Prachtnetz”, Buddhismus und moderne Wissenschaft miteinander in Beziehung zu setzen.

Dr. Klar, der treue und rührige buddhistische Freund, hat in Heidelberg bereits Bekanntschaft mit einem Herrn Dr. Kopp geschlossen, einem ehemaligen Schüler des verstorbenen Indologen Walleser; Dr. [sic] Kopp will die einstige buddh. Schriftenreihe Walleser’s “Materialien zur Kunde des Buddh.” neu herausbringen, hat mit einem Verlag bereits Abmachungen getroffen, der nun als eine der ersten Erscheinungen dieser Reihe einen grösseren Abschnitt

aus meinen “Betrachtungen zu d. Reden B.” veröffentlichen will. Erst vorgestern brachte mir ein Wiener Buddhist, der bei den beiden Herren in Heidelberg war, diese Nachricht; und gestern kam Ihr Brief. Mir genügt es schon, wenn ein grosser englischer Verlag Interesse zeigt und eine deutsche Arbeit über B. zu legen bereit ist, auch damit ist ein weiterer kleiner Schritt zur Verbreitung der Lehre getan. – Und um das Mass an erfreulichen Dingen voll zu machen, erhielt ich am Samstag – also drei gute Tage hintereinander – von der Gemeinde Wien, in deren Diensten ich durch fast 25 Jahre gestanden war und die mich nach dem 2. Weltkrieg von meinem Posten als Leiter der Lupusbehandlung und Fürsorge in Oesterreich entfernt hatte, die Verständigung, dass man nun bereits ist, mir in Anbetracht der “unbestreitbaren Verdienste” (es tut wohl solche anerkennenden Worte nach 11 Jahren zum erstenmal wieder zu hören), die ich mir auch während der nat. soz. Zeit um das Wohl meiner Patienten erworben habe, eine Pension zu zahlen, die man mir bisher vorenthalten hatte. Dadurch bin ich jetzt der materiellen Sorgen ledig und hoffe, dass sich dies günstig auf meinen Gesundheitszustand auswirken wird, umso mehr, weil ich nun auch medizinische und Erholungsmassnahmen ergreifen kann, die mir bisher, da ich von keiner Krankenkasse unterstützt werde, unmöglich waren. Also Sie sehen, nicht nur das Unglück – wie bisher zumeist in meinem Leben-, sondern auch das Glück kommt selten allein. Seien Sie mir nicht böse, dass ich Ihnen das alles berichte, aber ich will Sie nicht nur von meinen traurigen Erfahrungen, sondern auch von meinen glücklichen Stunden wissen lasse [*sic*]

Die angekündigte Post aus Nepal ist bisher noch nicht eingelangt, sollte sie noch kommen,, [*sic*] so werde ich sie nicht zur Belehrung, sondern zur Erheiterung und Zerstreuung verwenden, wie Sie empfohlen haben; vielen Dank auch für diese Vermittlung.

In der Beilage habe ich eine kleine Korrektur für das Prachtnetz” [*sic*] mit-schicken müssen. In der Uebersetzungen Dahlke’s, die ich für meine Arbeit benutzt habe, ist leider an einer Stelle ein nicht unwichtiger Teil der Rede, wohl aus Versehen des Verlages, nicht abgedruckt worden; ich ersah [...].

#### 2.2.11. Bennett to Kropatsch (May 7, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
7th May 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,



Not so good this time! On Friday morning – to-day being Monday – I received your script from Allen & Unwin's with a covering letter saying they regretted they did not “feel able to make an offer for its publication.” Seeing that they had only had the work some ten days I don't think they can possibly have had it read; their “German” reader probably had a look at it and decided he was not able to tackle it. There was certainly no time for him to have studied it and written the usual report for the publishers. I hope this is not so, of course, because it means finding a firm with a reader who can cope with it, but in any case I will try some other publishers and see what happens. I don't think I will bother you with the details of these – unless you want me to – because it must make an unnecessary worry for you; I don't believe the most hardened artist can send out work entirely indifferent as to results. After all, even the Buddha said he did not think he would propound his Teaching in case people did not accept it and “that would be wearisome” to him. So if you get a letter from with Österreich, as well as Austria, on the envelope, you will know I have something to report in the matter; otherwise it will only be an ordinary letter.

Thank you very much indeed for your letter of 20th [*sic*] April; it made me very happy because so often I have felt my letters were very meagre and that was not how I really thought at all. Now that I know you understand and “read between the lines” I am very much relieved. I saw in yesterday's Sunday Times that you were having warm spring weather and that everyone was sitting outside the *câfés* [*sic*] etc. but I knew that would not suit you quite so well. The garden bungalow is a difficult proposition; some years ago we spent two summers in such a place, but the sun on the roof made them frightfully hot during the day and they cooled off correspondingly at night. A first floor with a balcony, and a second floor above to prevent rapid rise and fall of temperature, seems to me to be a much better plan, if you can get such a place. This flat we have here looks out on one side to the Square garden, which is marvellous with horse-chestnuts and lilac and golden-chain, and on the other side to the gardens of houses of two roads running at right angles to the directions of our outlook. So we are not shut in in any way, but when we go down into the street the difference is horrid. In fact it is just like breathing in pea-soup. We often do for walks in the evening just because we think we ought to, but we nearly always come in saying: “I don't know why I keep on doing that: it is awful.” I do hope, though, that you will manage to get a pleasant change of abode because that would make such a tremendous difference, and now that the finances are easier you can begin to think about it – which removes the first limitation, at least. While I think of it, have you ever read

the Records or Life of Hiuen Tsang?<sup>169</sup> I got the latter out of Sch. of Oriental Studies Library a few weeks ago and was delighted with it. One knows of course that H.T.<sup>170</sup> made a marvellous pilgrimage from China to India and came back with lots of scripts to translate etc., but this is a travel book of the first order and gives detailed accounts of the state of Magadha<sup>171</sup> and of the other sacred places as they were in 630 C.E., as well as of dozens of centres in Turkestan and the trek over the Karakoram Pass. One story impressed me very much. It was about a famous abbot of Nalanda University who could explain a number of sutras and sastras<sup>172</sup> but was overtaken with a serious and very painful illness. Violent attacks of this came and left him suddenly and he wanted to die. He had a dream in which he saw three Bodhisattvas.<sup>173</sup> One said that the affliction was due to his karma, but that if he would take it quietly and patiently, labouring diligently in explaining the Sutras and Sastras, he would rid himself of the pain, but that if he loathed his body there would be no cessation to his sufferings. Another said: “You should rely on our words, and exhibit abroad the true law --- for the benefit of those who have not yet heard it. Your body will thus by degrees become easy and you will suffer no further pain. Do not overlook that there is a priest in the country of China who delights in examining the great Law and is desirous to study with you: you ought to instruct him carefully.”<sup>174</sup> This happened some three years before the arrival of Hiuen Tsang when the abbot was 70 years old. There is a very fine description also of the University. If you have not read the work and think you would like it, I will try to get you a copy. It may be only a secondhand one – depends on whether the book is out of print – but it is only a small volume.

The Times had last week two columns about Life in Austria at the Present-Day. There was a picture of a very fine fruit stall and I wondered if it was one at which Mrs Kropatsch bought things. The caption stated that though some shops were again delivering goods, for the most part people still had to carry their own things. I thought of your pension and hoped it would save her taking

---

169 Bennett refers to Samuel Beal's (1825–1889) translation entitled *The Life of Hiuen Tsiang*, originally published in 1888. Beal was a pioneering English scholar of Chinese Buddhism.

170 The Buddhist monk Xuánzàng 玄奘 (602–644) famous for his travelogue.

171 An ancient Indian kingdom (the southern part of present-day Bihar) and central place of the historical Buddha's activities.

172 Sanskrit: *śāstra* (literally, treatise), a key work contained in the Buddhist canon(s) penned by/attributed to Indian masters.

173 Sanskrit (Pāli: *bodhisatta*). Bodhisattva essentially refers to a highly cultivated Buddhist practitioner who defers his/her own Buddhahood for the sake of helping all sentient beings in their path to enlightenment.

174 See Beal 1911: 108.

food home herself – that is a very arduous business! Especially if you have any stairs to mount at the end of the day's hunting.

Why do you say I should not be angry that you tell me your misfortunes as well as your good fortunes? Friends [*sic*] are no use if one has to be continually sorting out what to say and weighing one's words when one says it. That is only for acquaintances.

The Times photo. [*sic*] made me think of another thing, though. A Fleet Street advertising agency got word, about a fortnight ago, of a possible demonstration by Irishmen outside the Tate Gallery. Apparently there is a Monet<sup>175</sup> or Renoir<sup>176</sup> – I forget which – which ought by rights to be in Dublin. Anyway, the Agency sent down a photographer but after a lengthy wait it seemed there was nothing doing, so he took a photo of the outside of the building, to avoid going home entirely empty-handed, and went back to his office. The negative was thrown aside until late in the afternoon a rumour spread that a picture was missing from the Tate, whereupon the Agency took another look at the negative and realised that it showed a man coming down the main steps carrying a picture – or something covered with sacking that might conceivably be one – and another man coming out of the swing doors at the entrance to the building. The rest is obvious, of course. The Agency phoned Scotland Yard who asked for the negative, identified the thief and his accomplice, and eventually the picture was handed back to the Tate with assurances from the Embassy concerned that they had had no connection with the affair at all. But the photographer had made his name! Such is the way to fame.

My husband asks me to thank Mrs Kropatsch and yourself very much for your kind thoughts and joins me in sending you both our very best wishes

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

PS. I will substitute the new page 205 in the former script before sending it out again.

## 2.2.12. Kropatsch to Bennett (May 29, 1956)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

29 May 1956

---

<sup>175</sup> The French impressionist painter Claude Monet (1840–1926).

<sup>176</sup> The French impressionist painter Pierre-Auguste Renoir (1841–1919).

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your kind letter of 7 May, with which you gave me great pleasure. You need not worry that the rejection of the Allen & Unwin manuscript caused me any trouble. Firstly, I expected it, and secondly, I have become completely insensitive to such small stings of fate. I only felt sorry for you, because I know how happy one is to send a joyful message to another and how disappointed and sad one is when one cannot do so. Please do not worry and trouble yourself too much about my work and do not use any cautions in your correspondence to spare me.

Now I am going to stay at a small convalescent home near Vienna in circa eight days, which my wife liked very much during a visit and where we should both be well accommodated. It is situated far away from car noise and dust in the countryside on the slope of the Kahlenberg in a valley that is famous for its historical and cultural past. The liberation army that lifted the Turkish siege of Vienna in 1683 gathered on the Kahlenberg, Beethoven<sup>177</sup> and Schubert<sup>178</sup> wandered along the streams and in the forests of the same mountain and received the inspiration for their symphonies and songs, and Nikolaus Lenau,<sup>179</sup> after Eduard Möricke<sup>180</sup> [*sic*] probably the greatest German lyricist, is buried in the idyllic cemetery of the small village of Weidling. Next to him rests the famous orientalist Hammer-Purgstall.<sup>181</sup> As you can see, I need have no fear there, for the great spirits of the past will look straight into my room and perhaps help me a little.

I was very pleased to receive your offer to send me Hiuen Tsang's travelogue, and I gratefully accept it, for if there is anything I have my heart set on, it is good books, and I am proud to have saved my library, which I have gathered piece by piece since my youth, often under many hardships, from the bombings – the large apartment building in which we live was hit three times by bombs – and from the looting hands of the gangs of thieves in 1945. It was fortunate that the liberation of Vienna took place in the spring, because in the winter my books would certainly have been used as heating material, while I was on duty at the hospital, had my wife with me and could not visit the flat, which was in the centre of the battle zone. Yes, dear Madam, we live here in Vienna on the edge of the desert, geographically and mentally, and must always reckon with a sandstorm burying us. From the watchman's room of our St. Stephen's Cathedral one can see with the naked eye into Hungary, that is, already into Asia. Only this is not the Asia of Buddhism and the Upanishads.

---

177 The famous German composer Ludwig van Beethoven (1770–1827).

178 The Austrian composer Franz Schubert (1797–1828).

179 The pen name of the Austrian poet Nikolaus Franz Niembsch (1802–1850).

180 The German poet Eduard Mörike (1804–1875).

181 The Austrian Orientalist Joseph von Hammer-Purgstall (1774–1856).

But frontier peoples are rarely understood by the saturated centres of culture that still defend them. They are often despised and humiliated. Kublai Khan<sup>182</sup> comes to mind. He had missionaries spread Buddhism among the savage frontier tribes because he was convinced that this was the only means to pacify and tame them. Perhaps a similar method could be recommended to the statesmen of the earth, who are always afraid of frontier peoples, and in this way combine the useful with the only thing that is wholesome. But to tell you, dear Madam, about frontier peoples would be “to send owls to Athens.” Wesak Day brought me much joy. The President of our Society, who gave the celebratory speech at the official ceremony, visited me to offer his congratulations and many friends sent greetings and flowers, so that my Buddha statue, tastefully made by an Austrian ceramic company, almost disappeared among the latter. In addition, the sun shone from a cloudless sky and the high-pressure weather relieved the discomfort caused by the previous weather-altering days. So a joyful day in every respect. The night was then unfortunately less pleasant.

Your account of the strange conjuncture of events outside the Tate Gallery is very interesting. I think any person could tell such stories if they paid more attention. I recall two particularly striking ones. Once I was already lying in bed in the evening reading an archaeological work. Then my wife came and asked me if I did not want to drink a glass of cognac before I went to sleep, which surprised me very much, because I never did that, and she had never asked me such a question. I answered in the negative, read on, only to read on the next page of the book, to my further astonishment, about an English archaeologist who led excavations in Nineveh, who was also a witty poet, and who told in a little poem printed at this point that he liked to have a glass of cognac before going to sleep. Thought transmission, which is a matter of course between my wife and me, is out of the question, since I had certainly not read the little poem at the time of my wife’s question. The second case is even more remarkable. Once in the evening I was writing one of my papers and was struggling with the biological problem of bringing the structure and function of the tissues into line. Since I was not making much progress, I turned up the radio, more or less thoughtlessly, and to my amazement I came into a biological lecture, in which the speaker addressed the same problem and said that the concepts of structure and function were united in the one concept of function. The probability of a coincidence could probably only be expressed here by a fraction with innumerable zeros in its denominator. I be-

---

182 Kublai Khan (1215–1294), the Emperor of the Mongol Empire (r. 1260–1294).

lieve that there really is a still unknown law here, which expresses the Buddhist view that the whole world is a network of effects, or, as Whitehead<sup>183</sup> says, a “network of events.” Everything is related to everything else, without us always needing to invoke the law of causality, the general validity of which microphysics already doubts.

Now, dear madam, I bid you farewell for today and send many greetings from my wife, who sadly, like most housewives in Vienna, has to carry all the shopping home herself and take care of the household alone.

Best regards and wishes to you and your spouse from your  
devoted

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

29. Mai 1956.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen sehr für Ihr liebes Schreiben vom 7.5., mit dem Sie mir eine grosse Freude machten. Sie brauchen sich keine Sorge zu machen, dass mir die Ablehnung des Manuskriptes von Allen & Unwin irgendwelchen Aerger bereitete. Denn erstens rechnete ich damit und dann bin ich gegen solche kleine Stiche des Schicksals vollkommen unempfindlich geworden. Leid taten nur Sie mir, denn ich weiss, wie sehr man sich freut, einem anderen eine freudige Botschaft zu übersenden und wie enttäuscht und traurig man ist, wenn man dies nicht tun kann. Machen Sie sich weiterhin nicht zuviel Sorgen und Mühen wegen meiner Arbeit und gebrauchen Sie im Briefwechsel keine Vorsichtsmassregeln, um mich zu schonen.

Nun werde ich in cca [*sic*] 8 Tagen ein kleines Erholungsheim in der Nähe Wiens aufsuchen, das meiner Frau bei einer Besichtigung sehr gut gefallen hat und in dem wir beide gut untergebracht sein dürften. Es liegt fernab von Autolärm und Staub mitten im Grünen am Abhang des Kahlenberges in einem Tal, das berühmt ist durch seine historische und kulturelle Vergangenheit. Auf dem Kahlenberg sammelte sich die Befreiungsarmee, die im Jahre 1683 die Türkenbelagerung Wien's [*sic*] aufhob, an den Bächen und in den Wäldern desselben Berges wanderten Beethoven und Schubert und empfangen die Inspirationen für ihre Symphonien und Lieder und auf dem idylli-

---

183 The English mathematician and philosopher Alfred North Whitehead (1861–1947). Kropatsch referenced Whitehead's *Essays in Science and Philosophy* (1948) in his second book (Kropatsch 1963).

schen Friedhof des kleinen Oertchens Weidling liegt Nikolaus Lenau begraben, nach Eduard Möricke [*sic*] wohl der grösste deutsche Lyriker; neben ihm ruht der berühmte Orientalist Hammer-Purgstall. Sie sehen, dort braucht mir nicht bange zu sein, denn die grossen Geister der Vergangenheit werden mir direkt ins Zimmer blicken und mir vielleicht ein wenig helfend zur Seite stehen.

Ihr Anerbieten, mir die Reisebeschreibung Hiuen Tsang's zu schicken, hat mich sehr gefreut und ich nehme es dankbar an; denn wenn ich an etwas mein Herz gehängt habe, so sind es gute Bücher und ich bin stolz darauf, meine Bibliothek, die ich mir seit meiner Jugend, oft unter manchen Entbehrungen, Stück für Stück zusammengetragen habe, aus den Bombenangriffen – das große Zinshaus, in dem wir wohnen, wurde dreimal von Bomben getroffen – und aus den plündernden Händen der Diebsbanden des Jahres 1945 gerettet zu haben. Ein Glück war es, dass die Befreiung Wiens im Frühjahr stattfand, denn im Winter wären meine Bücher bestimmt als Heizmaterial verwendet worden, während ich in meinem Spital Dienst machte, meine Frau bei mir hatte und die Wohnung, die im Zentrum des Kampfgebietes lag, nicht aufsuchen konnte. – Ja, liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau, wir leben hier in Wien am Rande der Wüste, geographisch und seelisch, und müssen immer damit rechnen, dass uns ein Sandsturm verschüttet. Von der Türmerstube unseres Stefansdomes [*sic*] kann man mir freiem Auge nach Ungarn, also bereits nach Asien hinein sehen, nur ist das nicht das Asien des Buddhismus und der Upanishaden. Doch Grenzvölker werden von den saturierten Zentren der Kultur, die sie noch verteidigen, selten verstanden, sie werden oft verachtet und gedemütigt. Da fällt mir Kublai Khan ein. Er liess den Buddhismus unter den wilden Grenzstämmen durch Missionäre verbreiten, weil er der Überzeugung war, dass dies das einzige Mittel sei, um sie zu pazifizieren und zu zähmen. Vielleicht könnte man den Staatsmännern der Erde, die sich doch immer vor Grenzvölkern fürchten, eine ähnliche Methode an Herz legen und auf diese Weise das Nützliche mit dem einzig Heilsamen verbinden. Doch Ihnen, liebe gnädige Frau, über Grenzvölker berichten, hiesse "Eulen nach Athen tragen". Der Vesak-Tag brachte mir viel Freude. Der Präsident unserer Gesellschaft, der bei der offiziellen Feier die Festrede hielt, besuchte mich, um mir seine Glückwünsche zu übermitteln und viele Freunde sandten Grüsse und Blumen, sodass meine Buddha-Statue, recht geschmackvoll von einer österr. Keramik-Firma hergestellt, unter letzteren fast verschwand. Dazu strahlte die Sonne von einem wolkenlosen Himmel und das Hochdruckwetter löste die Beschwerden, welche die vorausgegangenen wetterwendischen Tage mit sich gebracht hatten. Also ein freudiger Tag in jeder Hinsicht, die Nacht war dann leider weniger angenehm.

Ihr Bericht über das merkwürdige Zusammentreffen der Ereignisse vor der Tate Gallery ist sehr interessant, ich glaube, jeder Mensch könnte solche erzählen, wenn er mehr darauf achtete. Mir sind gerade zwei besonders markante in Erinnerung. Ich lag einmal abends schon im Bett und las in einem archäologischen Werk. Da kam meine Frau und fragte mich, ob ich nicht ein Gläschen Cognac vor dem Einschlafen trinken wolle, was mich sehr erstaunte, da ich dies niemals tat und sie auch niemals eine solche Frage an mich gestellt hatte. Ich verneinte, las weiter, um auf der nächsten Seite des Buches zu meinem neuerlichen Erstaunen von einem englischen Archäologen zu lesen, der Ausgrabungen in Ni nive [*sic*] leitete, ausserdem ein witziger Poet war und in einem kleinen Gedicht, das an dieser Stelle abgedruckt war, erzählte, dass er gerne vor dem Einschlafen ein Gläschen Cognac zu sich nehme. Gedankenübertragung, die zwischen meiner Frau und mir eine Selbstverständlichkeit ist, scheidet aus, da ich zum Zeitpunkt der Frage meiner Frau das Gedichtchen bestimmt noch nicht gelesen hatte. – Der zweite [*sic*] Fall ist noch merkwürdiger. Ich schrieb einmal abends an einer meiner Arbeiten und plagte mich mit dem biologischen Problem, Struktur und Funktion der Gewebe auf einen Nenner zu bringen. Da ich nicht recht weiter kam, drehte ich, mehr minder gedankenlos den Radio-Apparat auf, kam zu meiner Verwunderung in seinen biologischen Vortrag [*sic*] hinein, in welchem der Redner auf das gleiche Problem zu sprechen kam und meinte, dass die Begriffe Struktur und Funktion in dem einen Begriffe der Funktion vereinigt seien. Die Wahrscheinlichkeit eines Zufalles könnte hier wohl nur durch einen Bruch ausgedrückt werden, in dessen Nenner unzählige Nullen stehen. Ich glaube, hier liegt wirklich ein noch unbekanntes Gesetz vor, welches die buddhistische Auffassung, dass die ganze Welt ein Netzwerk von Wirkungen, oder, wie Whitehead sagt, ein “Netzwerk von Ereignissen” sei, zum Ausdruck bringt; alles steht mit allem in Beziehung, ohne dass wir immer das Kausalgesetz, dessen Allgemeingültigkeit die Mikrophysik ja bereits bezweifelt, bemühen müssen.

Nun sage ich Ihnen, liebe, gnädige Frau, für heute Adieu und schicke viele Grüsse von meiner Frau, die leider so wie die meisten Hausfrauen Wiens alle Einkäufe selbst nach Hause tragen und den Haushalt allein besorgen muss.

Ihnen und Ihrem Herrn Gemahl die besten Empfehlungen und Wünsche von Ihrem

ergeben



## 2.2.13. Kropatsch to Bennett (July 3, 1956)

*Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

3 July 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for sending me the Wesak issue of the Maha Bodhi Journal. I was particularly interested in your work, which I consider to be very good.<sup>184</sup> However, I do not know whether it will be understood and appreciated over there. Unfortunately, in my article, the Buddha quotation on the last page is reproduced in such a garbled way that it must be completely incomprehensible.<sup>185</sup> In terms of preciseness, people in Asia seem to be very generous. For example, in the index of the December 1955 issue, my name is given in a strangely lengthened form in the register of persons,<sup>186</sup> and my work on “Mutations etc.,” which appeared in the January issue, is not cited at all in the subject index.<sup>187</sup> Our president of the Buddhist Society, who will be starting his journey to Southeast Asia in a few days, has already had his experiences. He has still not received a visa to Burma, and of the many official Buddhist authorities and personalities in Siam, Burma, and Ceylon to whom he has turned for advice on his journey, none has given him an answer, although such an answer would have to be in Vienna by now, even if the mail delivery were to be done on foot. The only exception was Nyanaponika<sup>188</sup> who, as is well-known, comes from Königsberg. He made himself available for guided tours and talks for a week in Colombo. Have people in the classical countries of Buddhism already joined national politics to such an extent that European Buddhists are not even considered worthy of the most primitive courtesies?

Sadly, my condition deteriorated so rapidly by the day in the convalescent home I had mentioned to you in my last letter that I had to be transported back to my Vienna flat after a few days, where I am now slowly recovering. It is difficult to say whether it was the air or the noise in the house which was

---

184 Kropatsch refers to Bennett’s article “Value of the Buddhist Philosophies to Present-day Thought” (Bennett 1956g).

185 That is, Kropatsch’s “The Body-Soul Problem in Modern Psychology and in Buddhism” (Kropatsch 1956).

186 The name register gives his name as “Kropatsch, Dr. Anton Kropat.”

187 He refers to his “The Mutations of Modern Biology and the ‘Rebirth’ of Buddhism” (Kropatsch 1955c).

188 Nāṇaponika Mahāthera (Siegmond Feniger; 1901–1994), a famous German Theravāda monk and foremost disciple of Ñāṇatiloka Mahāthera (see Hecker 1996b: 60–92).

due to building work. I now have to take digitalis and try to rest my heart, whose activity had been in a state of perturbation, through a strict diet. Fortunately, I have been feeling a little better recently and I am now able to read something again and write a short letter like this one. The good spirits I called upon seem to have turned out to be evil demons.

Well, that's it for today. The letter has turned out harsh enough. I sincerely and wholeheartedly wish you and your husband a wonderful summer holiday and my wife and I send you our best regards. Please send me a card once you are in the beautiful countryside and give me a brief description of the place. I would be very pleased.

Your devoted

A Kropatsch

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

3. Juli 1956.

Sehr geehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen herzlich für die Uebersendung der Vesak-Nummer der Maha Bodhi-Zeitschrift. Besonders interessiert hat mich Ihre Arbeit, die ich für sehr gut halte, doch weiss ich nicht, ob man sie auch drüben verstehen und würdigen wird. In meinem Artikel ist leider das Buddha-Zitat auf der letzten Seite so verstümmelt wiedergegeben, dass es vollkommen unverständlich sein muss. Man ist in puncto Genauigkeit in Asien scheinbar sehr grosszügig; so ist im Index des Dezember-Heftes 1955 im Personenverzeichnis mein Name eigentümlich verlängert wiedergegeben und meine im Jänner-Heft erschienene Arbeit über "Mutationen etc." im Sachverzeichnis überhaupt nicht zitiert. Auch unser Präsident der buddh. Ges., der in wenigen Tagen seine Reise nach Südostasien antritt, hat bereits seine Erfahrungen gemacht. So bekam er das Visum nach Burma bis heute noch nicht, und von den vielen offiziellen buddh. Stellen und Persönlichkeiten in Siam, Burma und Ceylon, an die er sich um Ratschläge für seine Reise wandte, hat ihn keine einer Antwort gewürdigt, obwohl eine solche auch bei einer Briefbeförderung per pedes bereits in Wien sein müsste. Eine Ausnahme machte einzig und allein Nyana-ponika – der bekanntlich aus Königsberg stammt –, er stellte sich für Führungen und Gespräche für eine Woche in Kolombo zur Verfügung. Sollte man sich in den klassischen Ländern des Buddhismus der nationalen Politik bereits so weit angeschlossen haben, dass man europäische Buddhisten nicht einmal der primitivsten Höflichkeiten für würdig erachtet?

Mein Zustand hatte sich leider in dem Erholungsheim, von dem ich Ihnen in meinem letzten Briefe schrieb, so rapid von Tag zu Tag verschlechtert, dass ich mich nach wenigen Tagen in meine Wiener Wohnung zurücktransportieren lassen musste, wo ich mich jetzt langsam erhole. Ob es die Luft war oder der Lärm, der infolge Bauarbeiten in dem Hause herrschte, kann ich schwer sagen. Ich muss jetzt Digitalis nehmen und durch eine strenge Diät mein Herz, dessen Tätigkeit in Unruhe geraten war, zu entlasten suchen. Glücklicherweise geht es mir seit kurzem etwas besser und ich bin nun auch wieder imstande, etwas zu lesen und einen kurzen Brief, wie diesen, zu schreiben. Die guten Geister, die ich anrief, haben sich scheinbar als böse Dämonen erwiesen.

Doch nun Schluss für heute; der Brief ist herb genug ausgefallen. Ich wünsche Ihnen und Ihrem Herrn Gemahl aufrichtig und von ganzem Herzen einen schönen Sommerurlaub und grüsse Sie von meiner Frau und mir auf das Beste. Schicken Sie mir einmal eine Karte, wenn Sie in schöner Natur sind und schildern Sie mir kurz Ihre Umgebung. Es würde mich sehr freuen.

Ihr ergebener

A Kropatsch

#### 2.2.14. Bennett to Kropatsch (July 6, 1956)

I didn't suppose people would understand nothing I wrote in MBJ Wesak, but it was Jayanti and I wanted to write the best thing I could; so I decided the readers would have to but to live with it! Unfortunately I had to condense it a lot. Thank you for speaking so kindly of it.<sup>189</sup>

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park. London W.II  
6th July 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letters of 29th May and 2nd [*sic*] July. The latter has only just reached me and I hasten to answer it to the temporary exclusion of the first. I am so sorry to hear that the Convalescent Home was such a dismal failure. It sounded as if it ought to be good but no doubt the noise was very trying. I suppose one can never tell about these things but it must have been a great disappointment to you both. Still you are on the mend again, which is heartening.

---

189 A handwritten addition by Bennett on top of the letter.

I am so sorry the MJB Wesak issue was so badly turned out. They never pack well in Calcutta and my quota nearly always arrives bursting out of its wrapper. This time the post office must have engaged on a major salvage operation for the copies were tied so tightly with rope-like string that they were nearly cut in three. I flattened them out as well as I could between copies of the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* before posting to authors, but I was so disgusted with the whole affair that I did not try to read the issue at all. The photographic plates, which must have been quite difficult and expensive to get, were creased and bent, and the text impossible to read without continually smoothing out the sheets. I saw a bad mistake in Bhikshu Sangharakshita's article<sup>190</sup> and a slab missed out of one of my paragraphs but was too annoyed to study anything with care. I knew your name had been printed twice in the Index but supposed that the proof corrector was a babu<sup>191</sup> as I knew the Bhikshu was in Bombay about that time looking after the Jayanti film. He is the only one who ever really does anything with the Journal; the others tinker with it if they get the chance, but generally they are prevented!

I am not entirely surprised that your President has had no reply from the S.E. Asian Buddhist officials; I don't think they care a little bit about European Buddhists. In fact I am not sure that they are not nervous of them, unless the Asiatic Buddhist in question happens to have been educated in Europe. It is a most extraordinary situation – one supposes that a Buddhist of whatever nationality or colour would be kind and polite, but that just isn't so. Ven. Nyanaponika is quite different, of course, as he is German, but the question remains: Does such a man as Ven. N. get his politeness from being a Buddhist or from being a German? European, if you like. Some of these S.E. Asians are awful people. I am not sure if I told you before about a very advanced and scholarly Bhikku who used to shove letters under the blotting pad on his desk when he didn't know how to answer them. It was inevitable that they would be found, so what was the point? An ordinary European schoolboy would have more self-respect. All the same, if the President does happen to meet any of said officials when he gets out East, it is quite possible they will be charming to him. They are just unreliable.

Now, about why I did not answer your letter of 29th May sooner. Having got behindhand with my series of *Sanskrit Literature*<sup>192</sup> on account of a book review – in which I had particularly to watch my step as I have no opinion of the author and had to be fair – I got inveigled with the Chinese pilgrims about

---

190 Bennett refers to Sangharakshita's article "Where Buddhism Begins – And Why It Begins There" (Sangharakshita 1956).

191 A local native person.

192 See Bennett 1956a and 1956b.

whom I wrote you.<sup>193</sup> I came across a translation of the records of the first of them – Fa-hsien<sup>194</sup> left India for China via Chinese Turkestan and the Pamirs in 399 C.E., journey largely on foot – by a much better translator than Beal who did the Hiuen Tsang. Beal also did Fa-hsien<sup>195</sup> and it is poor stuff compared with Giles.<sup>196</sup> The French Rémusat<sup>197</sup> is not much better. What do you think of a person who translates – in reference to his friends having stayed behind or gone sick at places en route and his now feeling lonely – “Beholding only my own shadow” (Literal tr. of the Chinese) as “Gazing back into the past”?<sup>198</sup> Anyway, I tried to get you a copy of the Giles trn., having decided that Fa-hsien is easily the most readable and that his Travels should be looked at before the others, but was told the works are all almost unprocureable now. I propose to type Fa-hsien in a few weeks’ time and to send you a copy. But now I am with my mind in the East, and as my husband does not want to go away for a holiday – the weather has been vile and the flat is very uncomfortable – we shall go only for days out in the car. That venerable one is nearly 20 years old and a new edict has been issued that only cars less than 10 will be on the road – always excepting commercial vehicles! Still, we shall manage somehow, though I hope it will not come to abandoning the flat and living in the car! I don’t suppose I shall be able to send you attractive pictures illustrating our journeys, but what I will send you from the Times Book Club tomorrow is a book of a jaunt in the Himalayas – which is the sort of holiday I should like to take – by an Indian High Court Judge. I was going to send you a collection of accounts of the German expeditions to Nanga Parbat which I took out to compare the journeys of the Chinese pilgrims in that part of the world with modern climbing, but I found much of it is a tr, [*sic*] of Bauer’s<sup>199</sup>

---

193 See Bennett 1957b.

194 The Chinese Buddhist monk Fāxiān 法顯 (337–422) and his travelogue *Fúguó jì* 佛國記 (A Record of Buddhist Kingdoms).

195 Bennett refers to Samuel Beal’s *Fah-Hian and Sung-Yun, Buddhist Pilgrims, from China to India (400 A.D. and 518 A.D.)* (Beal 1869).

196 That is, *Record of the Buddhist Kingdoms* by the University of Cambridge-based professor of Chinese, the English Herbert Allen Giles (1845–1935) (Giles 1877).

197 Bennett refers to the famous French sinologist Jean-Pierre Abel-Rémusat (1788–1832) and his *Foë Kouë Ki ou Relation des royaumes bouddhiques* (Foë Kouë Ki or Record of the Buddhist Kingdoms) (Abel-Rémusat 1836).

198 See Giles 1877: 94–95 (especially note 8), where Giles argues against Beal for his translation of 顧影唯己 as “to think upon the past was all that was left him” (see Beal 1869: 151–152). Giles mentions that Beal’s translation was indeed based on Abel-Rémusat’s “unlucky version ‘en réfléchissant au passé’” (see Abel-Rémusat 1836: 333). Bennett draws on Giles’ note and gives Abel-Rémusat’s translation as “gazing back into the past.”

199 The German mountaineer Paul Bauer (1896–1990)

German account<sup>200</sup> and you may have seen that. If you haven't and would feel interested let me know and I will send you a copy – some of it, I think the 1937 expedition, is out of print in Germany. It is sad in parts, of course, because in one instance the climbers cut the lines of communication between their camps and then only one thing is likely to result. The Judge's is a pleasure trip – lovely illustrations – and often humorous [*sic*].

Now you will be getting tired. The other reason I have been so long writing is that I had to review a bibliography for the Library Association – very V.I.P. Dreadful job!

Very best wishes from us both to Mrs Kropatsch and to yourself, and most appreciative thanks for your kind thoughts of us,

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.2.15. Bennett to Kropatsch (July 9, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
9th July 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

I asked Times Book Club to post you a copy of *Himalayan Circuit*<sup>201</sup> on Saturday morning and hope it will reach you in a few days' time. I wonder how you will like the Judge!<sup>202</sup> I think he must be rather a nice person and I should like to meet him.

I can't think why MBJ mangled your quotation on the last page; one hears at times that the printers are often Indians who do not understand what they print, but evenso [*sic*] the proofs are corrected. I think the best "brick" they dropped was in the March issue: Dr. K.C. Gupta reviewing Indo-Chinese Relations is reported as saying: "The author's sense of modest humour is apparent from the concluding remarks over Kipling's cryptic enunciation about 'East is West and never the twain shall meet' " But nobody seems to mind!<sup>203</sup>

---

200 Bennett refers to Bauer's *Das Ringen um den Nanga Parbat 1856–1953* (The Struggle for Nanga Parbat 1856–1953) (Bauer 1955).

201 That is, *Himalayan Circuit: The Story of a Journey in the Inner Himalaya* by Gopal Das Khosla (1901–1996) (see Khosla 1956).

202 Khosla was a judge at the Punjab High Court in Lahore.

203 See Gupta 1956.

By the way, the Judge, I take it, is a native of the Punjab. What a difference it makes to a people whose climate provides a winter – or rather a “cold weather [*sic*]”.

Best wishes

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.2.16. Kropatsch to Bennett (July 20, 1956)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

20 July 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for the two letters of 6 and 9 July and for Khosla's book, with which you have given me great pleasure. I am already very eager to read it, which I want to begin as soon as I have finished the section on Plato that I am reading in Russell's "History of Western Philosophy." R.'s explanations are, to my mind, rather meagre compared to the works of Deussen<sup>204</sup> and especially the chapters on Plato in Theodor Gomperz's "Griechische Denker."<sup>205</sup> I had an amusing experience with the son of Gomperz,<sup>206</sup> who was professor of philosophy at the University of Vienna between 1920 and 1930. At the time, he gave lectures on Buddhism, but showed so little familiarity with the subject that he once passed off views that were falsely expressed by other sects about Buddhism as Buddha's teachings.<sup>207</sup> When, after the lecture, I pointed out this error to him privately and very politely and quoted passages from the Discourses I had remembered, he became very agitated, measured me from top to bottom, tore his fur hat from a hook on the

---

204 The German Indologist and philosopher Paul Deussen (1845–1919). Kropatsch alludes to the latter's multi-volume *Allgemeine Geschichte der Philosophie unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der Religionen* (A General History Philosophy with Special Reference to Religions; 1894–1917), whose volume on Greek philosophy Kropatsch referenced in his first book (Kropatsch 1957a: 85; see Deussen 1919: 97). In his second book, Kropatsch referenced Deussen's *Die Geheimlehre des Veda* (The Secret Teaching of the Veda; first edition 1897) (see Deussen 1907).

205 The Austrian classicist Theodor Gomperz (1832–1912) and his major work *Griechische Denker* (Greek Thinkers; 1896–1909), which was also translated into English (1901–1912) with several reprints thereafter.

206 The Austrian philosopher Henrich Gomperz (1873–1942).

207 For example, in the winter semester of 1924/25 he delivered a lecture on *Die Lehre des Buddha* (The Teachings of Buddha) at the Volksheim Ottakring. See Österreichisches Volkshochschularchiv.

wall and rushed out of the door with the enigmatic words: “I am not responsible for Buddhism after all.” For a long time, those were the last lectures on B. at the University of Vienna. Frauwallner,<sup>208</sup> whose “Geschichte der indischen Philosophie” is now appearing volume after volume,<sup>209</sup> has only recently returned to work at the Oriental Institute, after being sidelined for many years for political reasons and having to earn his living as a farm hand. To recover from Russell, I am also reading Aldous Huxley<sup>210</sup> (Those barren leaves),<sup>211</sup> whom I hold in high esteem, and a Swiss classic, probably unknown in England even by name, Jeremias Gotthelf,<sup>212</sup> who wrote his unsurpassed realistic descriptions of rural and small-town life in the Bernese countryside in the first half of the nineteenth century. I have now also completed the first half of my commentaries and reviews of Buddha’s Discourses (the one on “Potthapada” I once sent you), namely, on 75 discourses which deal with Buddha’s life, the outline of his teachings, and the three major problems of Buddhist philosophy (anatta, tanha,<sup>213</sup> nibbana). I do not know whether I will be able to complete the discussion of the remaining 75 discourses, which deal only with the path to salvation, but I would like to give the complete work to the Buddhist Society of Vienna.

Yesterday, again following the probability that a recurring event occurs again, two very beautiful events came together. First your book and then, as a gift from an old and faithful patient, a large parcel with the most charming alpine flowers, whose colourfulness and fragrance delighted me immensely, and, as a link between the two gifts, a very nice card from our President<sup>214</sup> from Bangkok, in which he wrote that he had established close and loving contact with Thai monks and had been invited to give a lecture at the Buddhist University. I do not begrudge his joy and enthusiasm.

---

208 The Austrian Indologist and scholar of Buddhism Erich Frauwallner (1898–1974). Occasionally, Frauwallner gave lectures at the Vienna Buddhist Society. So also, for example, on January 7, 1957, with a talk entitled “Die historische Verlässlichkeit der buddhistischen Überlieferungen” (The Historical Reliability of Buddhist Lore).

209 That is, Frauwallner’s two-volume *History of Indian Philosophy* (1953/1956), translated into English in 1973.

210 The English writer Aldous Huxley (1894–1963).

211 *Those Barren Leaves* is a novel by Huxley published in 1925. Kropatsch seems to have been an avid reader of Huxley. In his second book (Kropatsch 1963) he referenced Huxley’s *The Devils of Loudun* (1952) and *The Doors of Perception* (1954).

212 “Jeremias Gotthelf” is the pen name of the Swiss novelist Albert Bitzius (1797–1854).

213 Pāli: *taṇhā* (Sanskrit: *tṛṣṇā*; literally “thirst”), that is, the craving for sensory experience.

214 That is, Fritz Hungerleider.



I was sorry to learn from your letter that you do not want or are unable to take a continuous and longer holiday this year. If it is only halfway possible, take some time off, remember what I wrote to you recently and urgently translate my words to your husband. There is also the railway, which has become somewhat old-fashioned, but which nonetheless travels to beautiful regions and makes you forget the everyday life of the big city the moment the train starts moving. For us, this moment was always the most beautiful of the whole year, because in it the mountain meadows, fir forests, rocky peaks, and firn of the coming holiday days were enclosed as if in a bud.

Please do accept as well as your husband many cordial greetings and good wishes from my wife and  
your devoted

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

20. Juli 1956.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Ich danke Ihnen herzlich für die beiden Briefe vom 6. u. 9. Juli und für das Buch von Khosla, mit dem Sie mir eine Riesenfreude gemacht haben. Ich bin schon sehr begierig auf seine Lektüre, die ich gleich beginnen will, wenn ich den Abschnitt über Plato, den ich in Russell's "History of western Philosophie" [*sic*] gerade lese, beendet habe. R. Ausführungen sind meines Empfindens recht dürftig, verglichen mit den Arbeiten Deussen's und vor allem den Kapiteln über Plato in den "Griechischen Denkern" von Theodor Gomperz. Mit dem Sohn dieses Gomperz, zwischen 1920 u. 1930 Prof. d. Philosophie an der Wiener Universität, hatte ich ein lustiges Erlebnis. Er hielt damals Vorlesungen über Buddhismus, zeigte aber eine so geringe Vertrautheit mit der Materie, dass er einmal Ansichten, die von anderen Sekten über den Buddhismus fälschlich geäußert wurden, als Lehre Buddhas ausgab. Als ich [*sic*] ihn nach der Vorlesung unter vier Augen und sehr höflich auf diesen Irrtum aufmerksam machte und Stellen aus den Reden, die ich in Erinnerung hatte zitierte, geriet er in grosse Aufregung, mass mich von oben bis unten, riss seine Pelzmütze von einem Haken an der Wand und rauschte mit den rätselhaften Worten: "Ich bin doch nicht für den Buddhismus verantwortlich" zur Türe hinaus. – Das waren für lange Zeit [*sic*] die letzten Vorlesungen über B. an der Wiener Univ. Erst seit kurzer Zeit ist Frauwallner, dessen Geschichte der indischen Philosophie nun Band nach Band erscheint, wieder am orientalischen Institut tätig, nachdem er durch lange Jahre aus politischen Gründen ausgeschaltet war und als Bauernknecht sein Brot verdienen musste.

Zur Erholung von Russell lese ich daneben den von mir sehr geschätzten Aldous Huxley (*Those barren leaves*) und einen in England wahrscheinlich selbst dem Namen nach unbekannten Schweizer Klassiker, Jeremias Gotthelf, der in der 1. Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts seine unübertroffenen realistischen Schilderungen des bäurischen und Kleinstadtlebens aus dem Berner Land verfasste. Ich habe jetzt auch die erste Hälfte meiner Kommentare und Besprechungen von Reden Buddhas (diejenige zu „*Pothapada*“ habe ich Ihnen einmal geschickt), nämlich zu 75 Reden, welche das Leben Buddhas, die Grundzüge seiner Lehre und die 3 Hauptprobleme der b. Philos. (*Anatta*, *Tanha*, *Nibbana*) behandeln, beendet; ob ich die Besprechung der restlichen 75 Reden, die nur den Weg zur Erlösung behandeln, noch werde vollenden können, weiss ich nicht, doch möchte ich die vollständige Arbeit gerne der b. Gesellschaft Wiens geben.

Gestern trafen wieder, dem „Gesetz der Serie“ folgend, zwei sehr schöne Ereignisse zusammen. Zunächst Ihr Buch und dann, als Geschenk einer alten und treuen Patientin ein grosses Paket mit den reizendsten Alpenblumen, deren Farbenpracht und Duft uns unendlich erfreute und als Bindeglied zwischen den beiden Geschenken eine sehr nette Karte unseres Präs. aus Bangkok, in welcher er schrieb, dass er mit thail. Mönchen engen und liebevollen Kontakt aufgenommen habe und eingeladen worden sei, einen Vortrag an der buddh. Univ. zu halten. Ich gönne ihm seine Freude und Begeisterung von Herzen.

Es tat mir leid, aus Ihrem Brief entnehmen zu müssen, dass Sie heuer keinen zusammenhängenden u. längeren Urlaub nehmen wollen oder können. Wenn es nur halbwegs geht, machen Sie sich für einige Zeit frei, denken Sie daran, was ich Ihnen vor kurzem schrieb und übersetzen Sie meine Worte Ihrem Herrn Gemahl eindringlich. Es gibt ja auch noch die allerdings etwas altmodisch gewordene Eisenbahn, die aber nichtsdestoweniger in wunderschöne Gegenden fährt u. das Alltagsleben der Grossstadt in dem Moment vergessen macht, in welchem sich der Zug in Bewegung setzt. Dieser Augenblick war für uns immer der schönste des ganzen Jahres denn in ihm waren die Bergwiesen, Tannenwälder, Felszacken und Firne der kommenden Ferientage wie in einer Knospe eingeschlossen.

Nehmen Sie und Ihr Herr [*sic*] Gemahl viele herzliche Grüsse und gute Wünsche von meiner Frau und

Ihrem ergebenen

## 2.2.17. Bennett to Kropatsch (August 11, 1956)

Is Stefferns [*sic*] accounted as real figure with you? I have just come across this part in *Schumann et l'âme romantique* (Marcel Brion)<sup>215</sup> (in transl.“): “The external world is itself an aspect of our internal being. This grand dialogue between the All and itself which is carried on in each one of us ... that is the real mystery”,<sup>216</sup> Brion keeps referring to his *Karikaturen des Heiligsten*<sup>217, 218</sup>.

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
11th August 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

I expect you will have been surprised to have received another copy of MBI Wesak issue. I don't know why Calcutta suddenly decided to send you an author's copy – I thought I was supposed to do that – still perhaps you will be able to make use of this second. There is, though, that garbled passage at the end of your article which would make you feel less inclined to circulate it; on the other hand it gives an opportunity for correction at least in one copy adrift in the world. I thought of writing to Calcutta asking for a notice of correction to be put in a subsequent number, but they are just as likely to make the same mistake again; still, I will do so if you like. No hint of any June issue [---]<sup>219</sup>

Thank you very much for your letter of 20th July. One of the reasons I have been so long in replying is that I was trying to follow your advice! I impressed on my husband the need to break away from work for a spell and to get out – away if possible – and, as your letter arrived on one of the few fine warm days we have had for months, we decided to go down to the coast and see

---

215 The French novelist Marcel Brion (1895–1984).

216 “Le monde extérieur est lui-même un aspect de notre être intérieur. Ce grand dialogue du Tout avec lui-même, qui se poursuit en chacun de nous d'une façon particulière et définie, voilà le vrai mystère” (Brion 1954: 44). The corresponding original German passage reads: “[...] die Außenwelt selbst ist ein Aeußeres seines Inneren, er erkennt sich in ihr, sie in ihm. Dieses große Gespräch des Ganzen mit sich selber, in einem Jeden auf eine bestimmte, eigenthümliche Weise, ist das wahre Mysterium” (Steffens 1821: 697). Bennett quotes verbatim from the English edition of *Schumann et l'âme romantique* (Brion 1956: 33).

217 The Norwegian philosopher and poet Henrik Steffens' (1773–1845) *Caricaturen des Heiligsten* (Caricatures of the Most Holy) in two volumes (1819/1821). The above passage is a translation from volume 2.

218 This is a handwritten addition by Bennett.

219 Handwritten addition of which the rest is illegible.

what was doing with regard to hotels etc. for a few weeks later on. Before I begin to tell you what happened I must convey my husband's very grateful thanks to you for your kind thought of us. Well, the next day was fine and warm, weather chart showed a stout anticyclone over the Azores, Biscay, France, Grt. Britain – in fact, just all round the place. We had a lovely run down – coffee in a garden blazing with sunshine – until we came over the top of the South Downs. Then as we got into Brighton there came a sea-mist and a cold wind – I don't know how the weather achieved both at the same time but it did – so we went along the coast to Rottingdean hoping things would be better. They were far worse. We shivered when we got out of the car, and dived into the nearest of the only two *câfés* for some lunch. It got a little better after about an hour but the drop in temperature, as compared with the [*sic*] other side of the Downs, must have been at least 25°F. Still, we didn't want to go home and both my husband and Yvonne had come with the express idea of sun-bathing by the sea, so we tried Brighton again and for about an hour and a half it was not too bad – cold, of course, but still a little sun. At 4.30 we went into the town for some tea and in the meantime the mist came back good and hearty. The people in the streets all had top coats and everything looked as grey and beastly as it could in November. So we started home and the other side of the Downs came back into the warm weather. We never even looked at the hotels; on the contrary we kept on saying: "Thank goodness we are going back to the flat and don't have to stay in this place!" About 15 miles out of Brighton the car broke down – she had only just come out of a garage and was supposed to be all set for the expected warm spell. We got a tow to the nearest garage but they could do nothing without examining the whole interior. In the meantime, it was then about 7 p.m., the traffic was streaming along the main road nose to tail, and there was no hope of a lift. We telephoned to Brighton to get seats reserved on the hourly public bus but those were all booked up. However, a large Daimler pulled in and the owner offered to take the three of us to Clapham Common if we didn't mind his pulling up about every 10 miles to let his engine cool as he, too, was in trouble. After three stops of about half-an-hour each we got to C. Common and took the tube home. Bed about 12.30. The thermometer in London had reached 84°. Still, we got something out of it. Saturday afternoon we had to find our way back to the garage and collect the car. Queue for a holiday train crammed with people – we had somebody's reserved seats but they were never claimed – journey through dull grey countryside as the weather had broken – bus ride of half-an-hour – short walk – finally the garage. The car was standing outside and I could simply have hugged it. The sun came out and we had a marvellous ride home, stopping for tea at a place with marvellous home-made cakes – the shop ones [*sic*] here are generally compounded of saw-dust and cotton-

wool – and another lovely garden. We liked it so much that we went back last Sunday and I took some photos to send you. I will put them in my next letter. I forgot to say that I was fortunate the day in Brighton as I had with me a book on the latest findings concerning the Hittites.<sup>220</sup> I never thought they amounted to much, though one knows what their stock has been going up of late years with the archaeological research, but now I think much more of them than I do of Brighton! Perhaps now the weather will cheer up, though there isn't much sign of that at present. Anyhow I do assure you that we are taking every opportunity to get out, though if it comes to ssaside [*sic*] places they are now so crowded that one gets as much diesel oil in them as in London. How long does one get the diesel oil though???

I was very interested in that incident about the cognac. One hears often, as you say, of a transmission of thought when one person has definitely experienced that thought, but that your wife should have anticipated, as one might say, a thought which as far as you were concerned still remained in the next page of your book seems to to [*sic*] me to be phenomenal.

I wonder if you have finished your Russell book yet. I should like to know more of the Gomperz Griechische Denker as I have only a part of the chapter – as a quote in another tome – to which you refer. I meant to hunt it up but have been busy trying to get off some scripts to Calcutta; I must do it later. I enjoyed reading your experience with Gomperz fils at Vienna University; all the same I have never been able to understand why scholars who are models of integrity concerning certain subjects can, with no shame whatever, make ridiculous pronouncements about the religions and their attendant philosophies. One would think they would avoid making false statements on any subject, if only for the sake of their professional reputations. I am very glad you have a better successor for Professor of Philosophy. Which reminds me – if you have by any chance the name of the publishers and the title of the work on Indian Phil. I should like to get what information I can about it. When I did the list for the New Guide to Reference Books for Chaucer House,<sup>221</sup> for the Section Non-Christian religions, last year, I put up Das Gupta. His 5th vol. was published in 1955.<sup>222</sup> That was easily the best work I could get hold of here but I had then no details of any German ones of similar standard. It may be that the Philosophy section already have it on their lists – probably they have as language is no bar [*sic*] – but I could soon find out. In any case I am supposed to know something about it myself. One can't, of

---

220 See note 260.

221 Then the headquarters of the Library Association.

222 Bennett refers to the last volume (Dasgupta 1955) of Surendranath Dasgupta's five-volume *A History of Indian Philosophy* (1922–1955).

course, buy such a work oneself, but with a good conspectus and knowledge of the Preface one can recommend such a thing. As far as I know, the complete Guide has not yet gone to press, but even if it has there will always be supplements.

I don't remember anything about Jeremias Gotthelf except perhaps a small article in the Times Literary Supplement about – probably – a year ago. I will find out.

You [sic] Commentary on the 75 Discourses described would surely be invaluable. One of the types of Buddhist Commentary I have always felt to be lacking is anything of the nature of a summing-up. I started out on something of the sort, some time ago, and I am still pursuing with it from time to time, but I have taken the Chinese field as representing something akin to our own stages of development of understanding of the matter. The beginnings should appear in MBJ shortly, but the purpose will not be clear for quite a while.<sup>223</sup>

It is a question of the order in which Sanskrit works were translated – first, whatever works came to hand; then an interest in the Vinaya;<sup>224</sup> then odds and ends of the Āgamas;<sup>225</sup> then a try at some sutras; then a delve into the Sarvāstivādin<sup>226</sup> Abhidharma<sup>227</sup>; then a party of pilgrims to India to get anything they could to help [redacted without correction] to the root of the whole Teaching – and so on, the vagaries of historical events helping and hindering the while, always remembering that the Chinese had to work, as we do, without the traditional Indian background of legend and belief. I have, of course, a lot of Fa-hsien's account of his travels in it – just as well MBJ doesn't worry about copyright, though I have tried to keep within the limits – and some of the claims in the popular western treatises are thereby discredited.

I was very glad to hear you were improving and hope things are much better with you by now. I ought not to have worried you with all these pages but when one starts to write one just goes on! At least no unfortunate has to edit it!

Very best wishes from us both to you both

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett

---

223 See Bennett's "Catalogues of the Buddhist Tripitaka" (Bennett 1957a).

224 The monastic regulations.

225 Early Buddhist textual collections.

226 The Sarvāstivāda (Teaching that All Exists) was one of the Buddhism mainstream schools.

227 The *Abhidharmapiṭaka* is a compilation of texts systematically elaborating on the *suttas*. The Sarvāstivādin *Abhidharmapiṭaka* is particularly well-known for its refined engagement with the foundational texts.

P.S. I have not sent your MS out since June on the strength of a tip to hold up enquiries till after the credit squeeze is easier. I tried Macmillan – fortunately not one of my best selections – but they would not even let me submit the script. Better luck next time!

## 2.2.18. Bennett to Kropatsch (August 12, 1956)

9, Notland [sic] Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
12th August 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

I thought you might be interested to see the enclosed.<sup>228</sup> We went down to Windsor yesterday morning but did not go into the Castle as we have often taken visitors over it and expect to do so many times again. The post-cards are not bad reproductions; at least they give the general colour effect. I found this in the Brion book last night: “All is transient, nothing lasts; we exist because we are always changing, and it is inconceivable that an immutable existence would be existence at all. All that surrounds us is only true up to a point.” Brion says it is from Tieck<sup>229</sup> but does not give the work. I wondered what the context could be.

Best wishes

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.2.19. Kropatsch to Bennett (August 23, 1956)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

23 August 1956

Dear Madam!

Now I already have a whole series of items to thank you for. First and foremost for your two dear letters with the humorous description of your travel

---

<sup>228</sup> The enclosed material is not extant.

<sup>229</sup> The German poet and novelist Ludwig Tieck (1773–1853). The quote is from Brion 1956: 93–94. The French original reads: “Tout se transforme, rien ne dure; nous ne sommes que parce que nous changeons constamment, et nous ne pouvons comprendre comment une existence immuable pourrait encore s’appeler existence. Tout ce qui nous entoure n’est vrai que jusqu’à un certain point” (Brion 1954: 102).

experiences (as a title I suggest “Three in a car” loosely based on “Three men in a boat”<sup>230</sup> by J. K. Jerome),<sup>231</sup> which my wife and I read with a certain *schadenfreude* (I beg your pardon) as passionate non-car drivers. Actually, my advice was not for a car tour, but for a holiday of several days in a beautiful and quiet area of your island or the continent. Thank you also for the Wesak booklet, which I will give to the Buddhist Society. I think it is not necessary to correct the printing errors in my work. And last but not least, for the pretty pictures from Windsor, whose Duke<sup>232</sup> is presently paying a visit to Vienna. It occurs to me that many years ago, when he last visited Vienna, I was taken for his royal highness by a drunk in the street and greeted publicly, although the only similarity between us may be that our beards grow if we don’t shave. At the time, I had just enough time to disappear into a side alley so as not to be exposed to the ovations of the Viennese population. Yes, those were the days!

After Russell’s Plato chapters, I have now read Khosla’s “Himalayan Circuit.” What struck me most was the fact that the Indian travellers, with their European clothes, which by the way look terrible on them (see 1st picture), have also adopted the European views, indeed the European characters, thus proving once again the correctness of the proverb “Kleider machen Leute.”<sup>233</sup> Above all, there is the overzealous public official (“Gschaftehuber” is what they call someone like that in Vienna) Shrinagesh, whose head is buzzing and full of technical plans and innovations; his moody and grumbling wife; the “Christian” doctor with the ghastly braces. Khosla himself comes off best, but that is unsurprising since he is describing himself after all. Besides the excellent photos, I liked the individual descriptions of nature and the interspersed stories of the life of the inhabitants of the valleys. They will certainly be the right ones, but again seen through the eyes of a “European.” In contrast, the Englishman Paul Brunton<sup>234</sup> wrote like an “Indian” in “A Hermit in the Himalayas.”<sup>235</sup> As a belated “romantic,” I prefer the latter writing style,

---

230 The titles are given in English in the original.

231 Jerome Klapka Jerome (1859–1927), an English writer and author of the travelogue *Three Men in a Boat* (1889).

232 Edward VIII (1894–1972).

233 “Clothes Make the Man,” based on the novel of the same name (1874) by the Swiss poet and writer Gottfried Keller (1819–1890).

234 “Paul Brunton” is the pen name of the English writer and journalist Raphael Hurst (1898–1981), who was an important propagator of neo-Hindu spirituality. In both of his books Kropatsch referenced Brunton’s *Das Überselbst* (The Overself; 1940), the German edition of his *The Quest of the Overself* (1937).

235 A novel by Hurst first published in 1937 (Brunton 1937).



which I also found in Mrs David-Neel<sup>236</sup> and even in Migot<sup>237</sup> and Harrer<sup>238</sup> and which I appreciate so much in their books. Europeans and Indians seem to have reversed roles and now talk past each other. So it was cheerful to read a few weeks ago that a German minister on his visit to India assured Nehru<sup>239</sup> that in Germany Indian spirit and Indian culture were always held in high esteem. Nehru replied that the new India was proud of its dams and power plants.

That the Romantic Tieck made such strange sayings close to the anatta doctrine does not surprise me at all, since German Romanticism brought very significant results to light. Its exponents included not only Steffens<sup>240</sup> but also Schelling<sup>241</sup> and Baader<sup>242</sup> and above all Novalis.<sup>243</sup> The physician and natural philosopher C. G. Carus<sup>244</sup> – how odd, by the way, that he has the same first names (Carl Gustav) as C. G. Jung – is the man who first wrote scientifically and extraordinarily profoundly about the “unconscious.” The first people to deal with Indian philosophy, especially Schopenhauer in addition to Schlegel,<sup>245</sup> looked at the spiritual life of this country with the same romantic eyes. He called the Upanishads the “Trost seines Lebens.”<sup>246</sup> Following in his wake at the end of the last century and the beginning of the present century

---

236 The Belgian-French traveler and Buddhist-cum-esotericist Alexandra David-Néel (1868–1969), whose books (notably those on Tibetan Buddhism) were immensely popular during her lifetime. In his two books, Kropatsch referenced her *Vom Leiden zur Erlösung. Sinn und Lehre des Buddhismus* (From Suffering to Salvation: The Meaning and Teachings of Buddhism; 1937), which is the German edition of the 1936 volume *Le Bouddhisme: Ses doctrines et ses méthodes* (Buddhism: Its Doctrines and Methods). Additionally, in his second book (Kropatsch 1963), he referenced her most seminal book *Heilige und Hexer. Glaube und Aberglaube im Lande des Lamaismus* (Saints and Sorcerers: Belief and Superstition in the Land of Lamaism; 1931), the German edition of *Mystiques et magiciens du Tibet* (1929).

237 The French traveller André Migot (1892–1967), particularly known for his book *Caravane vers Bouddha: Un Français à travers la Haute-Asie mystique* (Caravan to Buddha: A Frenchman's Journey through Mystical Central Asia; 1954). An English edition was published in 1956 (Migot 1956). David-Néel provided a foreword to the French edition.

238 The Austrian mountaineer Heinrich Harrer (1912–2006), known for his book *Sieben Jahre in Tibet. Mein Leben am Hofe des Dalai Lama* (Seven Years in Tibet: My Life at the Court of the Dalai Lama; 1952).

239 Prime Minister of India (p. 1947–1964) Jawaharlal Nehru (1889–1964).

240 That is, Henrik Steffens.

241 The German philosopher Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schelling (1775–1854).

242 The German philosopher Franz von Baader (1765–1841).

243 The German writer and philosopher Novalis (Georg Philipp Friedrich von Hardenberg; 1772–1801).

244 The German naturalist, physiologist, and painter Carl Gustav Carus (1789–1869).

245 The German poet and scholar of Sanskrit August Wilhelm Schlegel (1767–1845).

246 “Consolation of his life.”

were Oldenberg, Deussen (the first three volumes of his extensive history of philosophy deal only with Indian philosophy), and more recently Helmuth v. Glasenapp,<sup>247</sup> the Königsberg Indologist, whose work on “Hinduism” became known beyond the borders of Germany. As for the Viennese Indologist Erich Frauwallner’s “History of Indian Philosophy,” only the first volume has been published by Otto Müller-Verlag in Salzburg so far.

A few days ago, the President of the Buddhist Society of Vienna returned from his “pilgrimage” through Thailand and Ceylon. He raves about Thailand in the highest terms, because he was welcomed and received in the warmest way by the monks and political leaders of the country (the President of the Parliament and the wife of the Prime Minister). His lecture at the university, for which a university professor was made available to him, was enthusiastically received and he literally thinks back with tears in his eyes to the “most beautiful days” of his life spent there. He was less pleased about the religious life of Ceylon, but long conversations with the apparently recovered Nyanatiloka and Nyanaponika and the English and German monks in Dudanduwa compensated him for the Europeanised spiritual elite of this country in a bad sense. He also conferred with the four Sinhalese monks who want to go to Hamburg as missionaries next spring, and with their very enterprising manager. While the long journey went smoothly, the plane almost crashed in a heavy thunderstorm on the return flight from Zurich to Vienna and he arrived in Vienna more dead than alive in a badly damaged aeroplane.

Since I have lost at least twelve to thirteen kilograms due to my diet and my heart is resting again, I am doing well, apart from thundery days, of which this summer was unfortunately replete. I can now spend five to six hours of the day out of bed and during this time I walk around the room a bit and read and write. I feel quite comfortable at home and especially in my library room. I am happy when I am about to read an interesting book or when I can develop a thought on paper that gives me pleasure, or a nice visit and a dear letter (especially when it brings me news and photos of “Three in a Car”). After all, what more could one want in a world that was said to be the “infernal rubbish heap” of other and better worlds, and of which the Buddha did not think much either.

But enough! Many cordial greetings from my wife and me to you and your dear husband and many good wishes for the next trip.

Your devoted

---

247 The German Indologist and professor of Religious Studies Helmuth von Glasenapp (1891–1963). He also published prolifically on Buddhism.

*Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

23.VIII.56.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Nun habe ich Ihnen schon für eine ganze Reihe von Sendungen zu danken. Zunächst und vor allem für Ihre beiden lieben Briefe mit der humorvollen Schilderung Ihrer Reiseerlebnisse (als Titel schlage ich vor: "Three in a car" frei nach "Three men in a boat" by J.K. Jerome), die meine Frau und ich mit einer gewissen Schadenfreude (I beg your pardon) als leidenschaftliche Nicht-Autofahrer gelesen haben. Eigentlich war mein Rat nicht auf eine Autotour gerichtet, sondern auf einen mehrtägigen Urlaub in einer schönen und stillen Gegend Ihrer Insel oder des Kontinents. Vielen Dank auch für das Vesak-Heft, das ich der buddh-Gesellsch. geben werde; eine Berichtigung der Druckfehler in meiner Arbeit halte ich für unnötig. Und last not least [*sic*] für die hübschen Bilder aus Windsor, dessen Herzog ja eben Wien einen Besuch abstattet. Da fällt mir ein, dass ich vor vielen Jahren, als er zuletzt Wien besuchte, von einem Betrunknen auf der Strasse für seine königliche Hoheit gehalten und öffentlich begrüsst wurde, obwohl die einzige Ähnlichkeit zwischen uns darin bestehen mag, dass uns der Bart wächst, wenn wir uns nicht rasieren. Ich hatte damals noch gerade Zeit, in einer Seitengasse zu verschwinden, um nicht den Ovationen der Wiener Bevölkerung ausgesetzt zu sein. Ja, das waren noch Zeiten!

Nach Russell's Plato-Kapiteln habe ich nun Khosla's "Himalayan Circuit" gelesen. Was mir besonders auffiel, war der Umstand, dass die indischen Reisenden mit ihren europäischen Kleidern, die ihnen übrigens grauenhaft stehen (siehe 1. Bild), auch die europäischen Anschauungen, ja die europäischen Charaktere übernommen haben und damit wieder einmal die Richtigkeit des Sprichwortes "Kleider machen Leute" unter Beweis stellen. Da sind vor allem der übereifrige öffentliche Beamte ("Gschaftelhuber" nennt man so jemanden in Wien) Shrinagesh, dessen Kopf von technischen Plänen und Neuerungen schwirrt und voll ist; seine launenhafte und nörglerische Gattin; der "christliche" Arzt mit den grässlichen Hosenträgern; am besten kommt noch Khosla selbst weg, aber das ist keine Kunst, da er sich ja schliesslich selbst beschreibt. Am besten gefielen mit neben den ausgezeichneten Photos einzelne Naturschilderungen und die eingestreuten Erzählungen des Lebens der Bewohner der Täler. Sie werden bestimmt die richtigen sein, doch wiederum mit den Augen eines "Europäers" gesehen. Im Gegensatz dazu schrieb der Engländer Paul Brunton in "A hermit in the Himalayas" wie ein "Inder". Ich bevorzuge als verspäteter "Romantiker" die letztere Schreibart, die ich auch noch bei Frau David-Neel und selbst bei Migot und Harrer fand und in deren

Büchern so schätze. Europäer und Inder haben scheinbar die Rollen vertauscht und reden nun mit verkehrten Vorzeichen an einander vorbei. So war es heiter, vor einigen Wochen zu lesen, dass ein deutscher Minister bei seinem Besuch in Indien Nehru versicherte, dass in Deutschland indischer Geist und indische Kultur immer in hohem Ansehen standen; ihm erwiderte Nehru, dass das neue Indien stolz sei auf seine Staudämme und Kraftwerke.

Dass der Romantiker Tieck so merkwürdige Aussprüche, die der Anatta-Lehre nahe stehen, gemacht hat, wundert mich gar nicht, brachte doch die deutsche Romantik sehr bedeutende Ergebnisse zu Tage; ihrem Kreis gehörten neben Steffens auch Schelling und Baader und vor allem Novalis an. Der Arzt und Naturphilosoph C.G. Carus – wie merkwürdig übrigens, dass er dieselben Vornamen (Carl Gustav) wie C.G. Jung trägt – ist jener Mann, der zuerst wissenschaftlich und ausserordentlich tief über das “Unbewusste” geschrieben hat. Mit denselben romantischen Augen betrachteten auch die ersten, die sich mit indischer Philosophie beschäftigten, neben Schlegel besonders Schopenhauer, das Geistesleben dieses Landes. Er nennt die Upanishaden den “Trost seines Lebens”. Seinen Spuren folgten Ende des vorigen und Anfang des jetzigen Jahrhunderts Oldenberg, Deussen (die drei ersten Bände seiner umfangreichen Geschichte der Philosophie behandeln nur die indische Philosophie, in letzter Zeit Helmuth v. Glasenapp, der Königsberger Indologe, dessen Werk über “Hinduismus” über die Grenzen Deutschland [*sic*] bekannt wurde. Von dem Wiener Indologen Erich Frauwallner ist bis jetzt nur der 1. Band seiner “Geschichte der indischen Philosophie” im Otto Müller-Verlag in Salzburg erschienen.

Vor einigen Tagen kam der Präsident der buddh. G. Wien von seiner “Pilgrimage” durch Thailand und Ceylon zurück. Er schwärmt von Thailand in den höchsten Tönen, denn er wurde von den dortigen Mönchen und politischen Spitzen des Landes (Präsident des Parlaments und Frau des Ministerpräses. in der liebenwürdigsten [*sic*] Weise begrüsst und aufgenommen. Sein Vortrag an der Universität, für welchen ihm ein dortiger Univ.Prof. zur Verfügung gestellt wurde, fand begeisterten Anklang und er denkt im wahrsten Sinne des Wortes mit Tränen der Rührung in den Augen an die dort verbrachten “schönsten Tage” seines Lebens zurück. Weniger erfreut war er über das religiöse Leben Ceylon’s, doch entschädigten ihn lange Gespräche mit dem anscheinend wieder genesenen Nyanatiloka und Nyanaponika und den englischen und deutschen Mönchen in Dudanduwa über die im schlechten Sinn europäisierte geistige Elite dieses Landes. Er konferierte auch mit den vier sinhalesischen Mönchen, die im nächsten Frühjahr als Missionare nach Hamburg gehen wollen, und mit deren sehr geschäftstüchtigen Manager. Während die lange Reise glatt von Statten ging, kam das Flugzeug auf dem Rückflug von Zürich [*sic*] nach Wien in einem schweren Gewittersturm beinahe zum

Absturz und er kam mit einem schwer havarierten Aeroplan mehr tot als lebendig in Wien an.

Seitdem ich auf Grund meiner Diät mindestens 12-13 Kilogram [*sic*] abgenommen habe und mein Herz wieder Ruhe gibt, geht es mir gut, von gewitterigen Tagen, an welchen der heurige Sommer leider reich war, abgesehen. Ich kann jetzt schon 5-6 Stunden des Tages ausser Bett [*sic*] verbringen und während dieser Zeit etwas im Z immer [*sic*] herumgehen und lesen und schreiben. Ich fühle mich innerhalb der vier Wände und besonders in meinem Bibliothekszimmer recht wohl, freue mich, wenn mir die Lektüre eines interessanten Buches bevorsteht oder ich einen Gedanken, der mir Freude macht, auf dem Papier entwickeln kann, über einen netten Besuch oder einen lieben Brief (besonders, wenn er mir Nachricht und Photos von "Three in a car" bringt). Was will man schliesslich mehr in einer Welt, von der behauptet wurde, dass sie der "höllische Abfall-Haufen" anderer und besserer Welten wäre und von der auch Buddha nicht viel gehalten hat.

Doch nun Schluss! Viele herzliche Grüsse von meiner Frau und mir Ihnen und Ihrem lieben Herrn Gemahl und viele gute Wünsche für die nächste Ausfahrt.

Ihr ergebener

## 2.2.20. Bennett to Kropatsch (October 4, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.XI  
4th October 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

At long last! Thank you very much indeed for your letter and enclosures of 23rd August. As you will have gathered, we took a "snap" holiday in Brighton for a week when the weather suddenly cheered up and we had really warm sunshine. We decided, all three of us, one Thursday afternoon, to "walk out on our jobs", and next day we packed up the car with a strange assembly of gear, destination Brighton. The hotels were full of Conferences – there was even one of Magicians – but we got a good one in the end and just forgot all about everything. The car is quite all right now; it only wanted a new ammeter. Three garages had failed to spot the trouble, but one night, after an awful experience in Holland Park Avenue – rush hour and masses of traffic – when we got stuck on the inside lane, a negro garage-hand came to do something with us and, on masterly sifting of evidence, found what was wrong. Since then the Ven. one has gone like a bird.

I was very amused about your likeness to the Duke. and [*sic*] also surprised to read what interest he and the Duchess<sup>248</sup> create in Vienna. Apparently, since the beginning of the last reign, they do not draw any money from the State and have taken to writing their memoirs. The Duke's book<sup>249</sup> was very good but later efforts do not seem to have aroused much interest. Many contemporaries say that, Duchess or no Duchess, Baldwin,<sup>250</sup> the Archbishop of Canterbury<sup>251</sup> and Dawson,<sup>252</sup> Ed. of *The Times*, meant to get rid of him in any case. He was far too democratic for their tastes, and, on his accession, bowled out lots of aged retainers at the Palace who, of course, favoured the old style. The story goes that he even had an office on the ground floor – he seems always to have hated the Palace because of its draughts and its sourish smell – and to have had a direct telephone line to certain departments etc. so that he should know at first hand more of what was going on. People ringing up, expecting to do the usual round of circumlocution, got the reply: “The King speaking. What can I do for you?” – whereupon they either forgot what they were going to say, or else thought it was a leg-pull. But the really disgusting thing about the whole affair was that, when he came over for his mother's funeral, having had to do the 4-5 mile slow march in the cortège, no one seems to have even offered him a bed. He went straight back to the Continent the same night. He must be sick of the *câfé*-life by now – what on earth do they both do with all those masses of luggage? She generally looks all right in photos, but not “splendacious” enough to justify tons of trucks. One has to admit, of course, that the Windsors do not travel in Ven. ones like we do, so there is no “Three in a car” (and contiguous [*sic*] episodes) for them. Enclosed are the photos which we took the day we went to reclaim the car.<sup>253</sup> Sorry they are not up to Khosla's standard – which reminds me: after the first few pages I had to look back to be sure it was an Indian writing. His departure from Delhi (or was it Simla?) was all in the vein of the one-time British official, high-powered car, or equivalent, and red chiprazis. I remember a letter from the mother of a friend of ours whose husband had had a long trek up the ladder of promotion to Chief Justice, the pay being slender en route. She wrote, “At last I have a red chiprazi; I have always longed for that” For a lot of people, as you say, “Those were the days!” Now the officials are Indian and their predecessors try to make out on a pension of depreciated pounds

---

248 Wallis Simpson (née Bessie Wallis Warfield; 1896–1986), Duchess of Windsor and wife of Edward VIII.

249 See Duke of Windsor 1947.

250 Stanley Baldwin (1867–1947), the three-time British Prime Minister.

251 The Archbishop of Canterbury (1928–1942) Cosmo Gordon Lang (1864–1945).

252 The English editor of *The Times* Geoffrey Dawson (1874–1944).

253 The photos are not extant.

sterling. Coming back to the photos – no, the snaps – (1) is the windmill to which I could not pay proper attention as I had to take it in the middle of the main road and the sun went in suddenly. That is a wash-out. (2) is from the top of a hill about 15 miles outside Brighton with the South Downs in the distance. The air is the purest imaginable. There was a good build-up of faint cloud but that did not, of course, come out. (3) is the beginning of the path through the wood to the right of (2). (4) is a field to the right of the garden where we had tea. It may seem very ordinary but it was so marvellous to see the sun and a semblance of summer after all the appalling weather we had had before. Besides, I like the feel of long grass round my feet and this did rather suggest that feeling. (5) gives the refractory geese. At first they arranged themselves attractively, but while I was manoeuvring into position to get the shadow of the gate as I wanted it, they went into a huddle and would not sort themselves out. In the end – well, you see how it was. (6) I was late in taking as the shadow had nearly gone off the green door. As Harold said, it was a “good pub” – it is the place where they had the home-made cakes. (7) is only a pond in the Gardens about five minutes walk from the flat. They used to be part of the grounds of a large house which was taken over by the Forces during the war. The mansion belonging [*sic*] to them got hit and is being pulled down, but the estate is now a public park and a very attractive one.

I was very interested to read about the visit of the President of the Vienna Buddhist Society to the Buddhist countries. Everyone seems agreed that the Siamese are the most charming people in the world and the reason often ascribed here is that they have never been conquered – formed part of anyone’s colonial empire. A few years ago some houses close to us were taken over by the Siamese Embassy; tiny people of two and three years of age equipped with little bicycles etc. used to hare along the pavements outside their quarters – they were just opposite to the Park aforementioned – and they were frightfully keen on things called “orange maids”, large flat sweets stuck on the end of a little stick. I was going one day into the little shop where they sold these things – as also frozen foods, bread and the like – and just missed an infant of about 2ft 6 ins in height, literally in mid-air. He was sucking his “orange maid” and in his joy had taken a colossal leap. For sheer undiluted happiness I have never seen a better instance than the expression on that child’s face, extended also to the whole poise of his body, and except for a faint gurgle he wasn’t making any noise at all. I thought of the Buddha’s question to the Brahmins: “Have you ever known complete happiness for a whole night or a

whole day, or even for half-a-night or half-a-day?”<sup>254</sup> I suppose the child would not remember the incident, was never even entirely conscious of it, but he was certainly completely happy for a few minutes. Ceylon is, of course, quite another story. Some of the stuff that comes out of Lanka, purporting to be Buddhist, is awful. In July issue of MBJ are many accounts of Jayanti celebrations; they had all to be cut for lack of space, but the one that was seemingly left intact was that of Ceylon which said the island spent Wesak Day in “prayer, fasting and meditation.”<sup>255</sup> I had objections to it but could only point out that the description must have been that of the Sinhalese themselves, and if they said they spent the Festival in that way, MBJ could not contradict them and say they didn’t. But coming from a country that presents itself as the premier exponent of Buddhism, the description could hardly have been worse. As regards your President’s journey, though, I am very glad he was able to see the various peoples in their own setting; it was a great pity he ran into the thunderstorm – air travel is all very well when the weather isn’t too bad, but otherwise, to be unable to get away and lie down by oneself must be horrible. How people manage when they have to go straight from their planes and address important meetings etc. I just don’t know.

Thank you very much for the very valuable information concerning [*sic*] the German Romantics. I know we have some British ones – Keats,<sup>256</sup> Shelley,<sup>257</sup> etc. – and there were the Soho poets and philosophers of the 1930’s who did not have time, presumably, to get into their stride, but, all told, they always seemed to me to be a lugubrious lot. The French ones were worse, according to Brion; the necessary qualifications for membership of the group seemed to be to have nervous gloomy fits in one’s early twenties and pass out entirely at the age of 30 or so. There seemed to be something decadent about the whole movement, though Brion hardly mentioned England and made it quite clear that such remarks did not extend to Germany. He was very enthusiastic about Novalis and quoted many extracts concerning him. Talking of books, Routledge & Kegan Paul have just sent me their autumn list; it includes a reprint of the Fa-hsien Travels and will be ready, they say, early next month. I am telling them to send you a copy direct, so if by any chance it should arrive without a card – which might conceivably be the case with a publisher’s office – you will know it came from me.

Do you feel like another translation for MBJ? I thought of the *Poṭṭhapāda Sutta* but decided to keep that for next Wesak, with your kind permission.

---

254 Bennett quotes almost verbatim her rendering of a passage from the *Poṭṭhapāda-sutta* (Bennett 1955b: 128).

255 See Anonymous 1956: 363.

256 The English Romantic poet John Keats (1795–1821).

257 The English Romantic poet Percy Bysshe Shelley (1792–1822).



The Calcutta Ed. wrote me they had started on my Skt. Bdt. Literature in order to make a break in the long series of Dīgha. Actually I have now only the Mahāparinibbana S. to be printed, so if they get that spread over the end of the year they will have a breather before I put up any more Dīgha. I wondered if you would feel like another excerpt from The Splendid Net relating to philosophies other than Buddhist – pp 43-51, for example.<sup>258</sup> That would all help when I get a reasonable chance of trying the whole work with another publisher. I am hoping quite a lot from the meeting of the new British Association of Theol. & Phil. Libraries on the 24th of this month. Also, and I have been meaning to ask you this for some time – does the Vienna Buddhist Society get copies of MBJ regularly from Calcutta? If not, I will “take action”! I was delighted to learn that you were putting on weight and that your heart is better. I have seen, from time to time, that you have had a good deal of thundery weather – here we have had really bad thunderstorms, for England, and are still getting them. Last night, going over to Caxton Hall to take the Study Class, we had a “peach” – I was in the Met. and didn’t know anything about it, which was just as well because I had no umbrella or anything of that sort. The week before I took one, but on arriving at the front door gave it to the porter to take upstairs for me as I couldn’ [*sic*] be bothered with it; last night he was standing there again and I said: “Don’t let it rain this evening; I’m not taking my rain things.” He grinned and said, “Oh no! There won’t be any rain to-night, madam.” Ten minutes after it was coming down in a flood! Now you will be saying “At long last” if I don’t hurry up and finish this screed! Our very best wishes to Mrs Kropatsch and yourself

Adrienne Bennett

## 2.2.21. Kropatsch to Bennett (October 20, 1956)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

October [*sic*] 1956

Dear Madam!

Once again I have a number of items to thank you for. Firstly for the beautiful postcards from Brighton with the accompanying descriptions. Fortunately, at

---

<sup>258</sup> Bennett’s translation of this chapter was published in the 1957 February issue of *The Maha Bodhi* under the title “Eternalists” (see Kropatsch 1957b). In the subsequent letters, Bennett and Kropatsch discuss Bennett’s translation.

the time your cards arrived, I was reading a book about the Hittites. (Ceram <sup>259</sup>: “Enge Schlucht und schwarzer Berg”). <sup>260</sup> Strangely enough, “Hethiter” is the name of this people in German since Martin Luther’s translation of the Bible. But that’s where I get into “lecturing” again. I cannot deny that my mother was a teacher of literature and history at a “Höhere Töchter-Schule” in Frankfurt am Main. Well, reading Ceram’s book familiarised me with the working methods of the Prague professor Hrozný<sup>261</sup> and I was able to apply them successfully in deciphering your characters, dear madam.<sup>262</sup> And yet my wife and I were eagerly hoping for the appearance of a “bilingual.” Please, do not be mad at us!

Next, I would like to thank you for the photos in your last kind letter. They are a charming illustration of the previous description of your travel adventures. To our regret, however, neither you nor any of your family members were to be seen in the pictures: You did not even allow us to see your shadow. So I want to set a good example. The first two photos were taken during our summer holiday in 1954.<sup>263</sup> In the first one, I am standing on the main street of our holiday resort, a small mountain village in the Salzburg Alps. The old houses are lovely, and under the balcony in the background the village band played on Saturday evenings in their old and picturesque traditional costumes and with great musical skill. The picture is taken on a bright and beautiful summer morning. We came from breakfast and our bellies are still full of the memory of the good coffee and the fresh rolls (= white bread) with butter and honey; and just now the first rays of sunshine stretch over the back of the mountain and warm the cool champagne air. And before us lay the whole glorious day, with the narrow path through the high meadows interspersed with countless flowers like a colourful carpet, the soft forest path between tall firs and spruces, and finally the steep climb over the alpine pastures with their lush greenery and the incredibly beautiful view of the opposite mountain range and its snow-covered peaks. Yet, above all the splendour a brilliant blue sky stretched out, in which one or another white cloud ship had just joined together and was preparing for its majestic journey through the ether.

---

<sup>259</sup> C. W. Ceram was the alias of the journalist and popular science author Kurt Wilhelm Marek (1915–1972).

<sup>260</sup> The English edition of Ceram’s book *Enge Schlucht und schwarzer Berg. Die Entdeckung des Hethiter-Reiches* (Narrow Gorge and Black Mountain: The Discovery of the Hittite Empire; 1955) was published in 1956 entitled *The Secret of the Hittites: The Discovery of an Ancient Empire*.

<sup>261</sup> The Czech Orientalist and founder of Hittitology Bedřich Hrozný (1879–1952).

<sup>262</sup> Kropatsch alludes to Bennett’s hardly legible handwritten additions in many of her letters.

<sup>263</sup> The photos are not extant.

In the second picture I am sitting high up in a mountain valley, just below the tree line. In the background the glaciers of the “Gross-Venediger,” one of the highest mountains of the Austrian Alps, are shining. These two photos are the last of me, taken in August of 54. So barely two months before the two heart attacks hit me like two terrible hooks to the chin and almost threw me “over time” onto the canvas. Yes, if it had only been one heart attack, these days I could have well applied for the US presidency. However, I think I lack some other prerequisites for doing so. Above all, I am not a Christian “crusader.” I do not know if you know the beautiful ballad by Ludwig Uhland,<sup>264</sup> which tells the story of a pious crusader who, in Christian charity, splits a Turkish horseman he meets by chance in two with a mighty blow of his sword, right down to the saddle of the horse, so that one half of the horseman falls down on each side of the horse: “Und zur Rechten sah man wie zur Linken einen halben Türken heruntersinken.”<sup>265</sup> If instead of “Turk” we insert “German,” we have roughly the situation in which Germany still finds itself today.

In the third picture (1956) you see my wife Marit on the bank of the “Danube Canal,” a branch of the Danube that flows through Vienna and is no more blue than the Danube, but dirty grey-green, as various canals of the city flow into it. The building complex where we live is also on the Danube, but our windows look out on another side onto a large villa-like house, which is partly in ruins due to bombs and artillery fire. A nice jungle of shrubs and hedges has grown up on these ruins blooming beautifully in spring. I send up prayers to heaven every day that the ownership of the house may remain unsettled so that the ruins will be preserved for us.

And thirdly, I thank you for your kind lines and for your willingness to continue to promote the “Prachtnetz.” I do not know what to say. If I say that the work is not worth anything, it smacks of “fishing for compliments.”<sup>266</sup> If I say that the publishers do not appreciate it, it would be arrogance and nothing is further from my mind than being arrogant. So I say nothing at all and leave it to your kindness and to chance whether anything comes of it. If you think that the publication of another chapter in the Mahabodhi would be beneficial, I will of course give you free rein. It also seems to me that the portion you have chosen is quite suitable. I suggest the title: “Ewigkeitsbekenner”<sup>267</sup> and think of the beginning as follows:

---

264 The German poet and Germanic philologist Ludwig Uhland (1787–1862).

265 “And on the right, as on the left, one saw half a Turk sinking down.” A passage from Uhland’s poem *Schwäbische Kunde* (The Swabian Tale; 1814).

266 In the original: “fishing compliments.”

267 Literally, “confessor of eternity.” Bennett translated this as “Eternalists” (see Kropatsch 1957b).

In the Brahmajala Sutta of the Digha-Nikaya there is the following passage: “There is some penitent or Brahman logician and epistemologist who, on the basis of his own purely logically attained, epistemologically gained insight, speaks thus: ‘Eternal is the self as well as the world, rigid, immutable, fixed like a pillar; and these beings run, wander, disappear, emerge. It is precisely the ‘eternal-same’.’”<sup>268</sup>

Epistemological confessors of eternity of the World and the Soul (page 44).....to realise this goal of final disappearance (page 50).

However, I believe that the translation will not be easy and will give us both many “hard nuts to crack.”

It strikes me how many difficult phrases I have interspersed in my letter, but I swear to you, I did not do it for pedagogical reasons, because I had, besides my German mother who burdened me in this respect, an Austrian father who, as garden administrator of the former imperial house, apparently had enough time besides his job to live his “hobby,” that is, landscape painting. He died when I was still a little boy and in my memory I only ever see him sitting behind his easel in the green surrounded by the painting utensils of the turn of the century. Many of his numerous paintings from the surroundings of Vienna adorn the walls of our flat and are very dear to me. Among other things, he also painted a series of watercolours of England and Scotland, which he had travelled to as a young man. Otherwise, they are mostly oil paintings of the melancholy floodplain landscapes of the Danube with mist-covered autumn trees and lonely ponds. But there are also some that seem quite modern with their abruptly broken clouds. I have such a study hanging above my Buddha statue and the light breaking through the clouds is a good symbol for Buddha’s enlightenment. I seem to be attracted to painters in general. The only friend of my early life, who is now dead, was a painter and a pupil of the Tyrolean painter Egger-Lienz,<sup>269</sup> who is probably also known in England. I should not be at all surprised if you also indulge in this vice. Sadly, I myself have not inherited any talent for it. But, what I wanted to say after this long diversion, it was not for your perfectioning of German that I chose the often difficult expressions, but quite simply because I wanted to take revenge. Because you do not make it easy for me to read your letters either. For example, in the final part of your last letter, which incidentally reveals your undisputed talent as a novelist in its splendid description of your conversation with the porter and the conciseness of his weather forecast, I read the expression “peach.” Quite easy to understand in context, but when I then looked it up in the dictionary, I was surprised to see that this word means “peach tree” in

---

268 See Dahlke 1921: 262.

269 The Austrian painter Albin Egger-Lienz (1868–1926).

German. I hope with all my heart that you will now have to look in your dictionary and shake your head in amazement.

However, my complicated style also had its disadvantages. You mistakenly assumed that I looked like the Duke of Windsor or that I have gained weight (“putting on weight”)<sup>270</sup>. When in fact the opposite is true: I am putting away weight.<sup>271</sup> I am proud and happy that through a strict diet, which my wife, in her caring way, always tries to break, I have lost at least fifteen kilograms in the last four months so that my heart got some air. There is a saying among Austrian doctors; that heart therapy ultimately consists of turning a fresh and juicy pear into a “Kletzen,” i.e., a sapless and powerless, dried up and shrivelled former fruit. I have not yet fully achieved this goal, but I am well on my way. And from there, in my opinion, it cannot be far to nibbana.

Now, finally, cordial greetings from my wife and me to you and your loved ones.

Always your devoted

AK

PS: Thank you for kindly remembering the Fa-hsien book. You may use my thoughts on “Potthapada,” which I sent you previously, at your own discretion. Would you like to send them an abridged version of the Discourse or a summary of its contents?

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

Oktober 1956

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Wieder habe ich für eine ganze Reihe von Sendungen meinen Dank abzustatten. Zunächst für die schönen Ansichtskarten aus Brighton mit der fortlaufenden Legende. Glücklicherweise las ich zu jener Zeit, als Ihre Karten kamen, ein Buch über die Hittites. (Ceram: “Enge Schlucht und schwarzer Berg”). “Hethiter” heisst dieses Volk merkwürdigerweise bei uns seit der Bibelübersetzung Martin Luther’s. Aber da komme ich schon wieder ins “Dozieren”. Ich kann es halt doch nicht verleugnen, dass meine Mutter Lehrerin für Literatur und Geschichte an einer “Höheren Töchter-Schule” in Frankfurt a. Main war. Nun die Lektüre des Ceram’schen Buches machte mich mit den Arbeitsmethoden des Prager Professors Hrozny vertraut und ich konnte diese

---

270 English in the original.

271 English in the original.

mit Erfolg bei der Entzifferung Ihrer Schriftzeichen, liebe gnädige Frau, in Anwendung bringen. Und trotzdem hofften meine Frau und ich sehnsüchtig auf das Auftauchen einer “Bilingue”. Bitte, nicht böse sein!

Als nächstes gilt mein Dank den Photos in Ihrem letzten lieben Briefe. Sie sind eine reizende Illustration zu der vorausgegangenen Schilderung Ihrer Reiseabenteuer. Zu unserem Leidwesen waren aber weder Sie noch eines Ihrer Familienmitglieder auf den Bildern zu erblicken, nicht einmal Ihren Schatten haben Sie uns gegönnt. Da will ich denn mit gutem Beispiel vorangehen. Die beiden ersten Photos sind in unserem Sommerurlaub 1954 gemacht. Auf dem ersten stehe ich auf der Hauptstrasse unseres damaligen Ferienortes, eines kleinen Gebirgsdorfes in den Salzburger Alpen. Lieb sind die alten Häuser, unter dem Balkon im Hintergrund spielte am Samstag-Abend die Kapelle des Ortes in ihren alten und malerischen Trachten und mit grossem musikalischen Können. Das Bild ist aufgenommen an einem strahlend-schönen Sommer-Morgen, wir kamen vom Frühstück und unser Magen ist noch voll der Erinnerung an den guten Kaffee und die frischen Semmeln (= Weissbrot) mit Butter und Honig; und gerade kommen die ersten Sonnenstrahlen über den Rücken des Berges und erwärmen die kühle Champagner-Luft. Und vor uns lag der ganze herrliche Tag, mit dem schmalen Weg durch die hohen Wiesen, die wie ein farbiger Teppich mit unzähligen Blumen durchsetzt waren, dem weichen Waldpfad zwischen hohen Tannen und Fichten und schliesslich dem steilen Anstieg über die Almen mit ihrem saftigen Grün und dem unwahrscheinlich schönen Blick auf die gegenüberliegende Bergkette und ihre schneebedeckten Gipfel [*sic*]. Über all die Pracht aber spannte sich ein strahlend-blauer Himmel, in dem sich eben das eine oder andere weisse Wolkenschiff zusammenfügte und zu seiner majestätischen Fahrt durch den Aether rüstete. Im 2. Bild sitze ich hoch oben in einem Gebirgstal, knapp unterhalb der Baumgrenze; im Hintergrund leuchten die Gletscher des “Gross-Venedigers” auf, eines der höchsten Berge der oesterreichischen Alpen. Die beiden Aufnahmen sind die letzten von mir, im August 54 gemacht, also knapp 2 Monate, bevor mich die beiden Herzinfarkte wie zwei fürchterliche Kinnhaken trafen und beinahe “über die Zeit” auf die Bretter warfen. Ja, wenn es nur bei einer Herzattacke geblieben wäre, dann könnte ich mich heute auch um den Präsidentenstuhl der U S A bewerben. Doch ich glaube, mir fehlen dazu noch einige andere Voraussetzungen. Vor allem bin ich kein christlicher “Kreuzfahrer”. Ich weiss nicht, ob Sie die schöne Ballade von Ludwig Uhland kennen, in der von einem frommen Kreuzritter erzählt wird, der in christlicher Nächstenliebe einen Türkenreiter, dem er zufällig begegnet, mit einem gewaltigen Hieb seines Schwertes bis auf den Sattel des Pferdes entzwei spaltet, sodass zu jeder Seite des Rosses je eine Reiterhälfte herunterfällt: “Und zur Rechten sah man wie zur Linken einen halben Türken

heruntersinken“. Setzt man statt “Türke” “Deutscher” ein, so haben wir ungefähr die Situation, in der sich Deutschland auch heute noch befindet. Auf dem 3. Bild (1956) sehen Sie meine Frau Marit am Ufer des “Donau-Kanales”, eines Seitenarmes der Donau, der durch Wien fliesst und ebenso wenig wie die Donau blau ist, sondern schmutzig grau-grün, da verschiedene Kanäle der Stadt in ihn einmünden. An ihm liegt auch der Gebäudekomplex, in dem wir wohnen, doch gehen unsere Fenster nach einer anderen Seite auf ein grosses villenähnliches Haus, das zum Teil durch Bomben und Artilleriebeschuss in Trümmern liegt. Auf diesen Trümmern hat sich ein netter Urwald von Sträuchern und Hecken angesiedelt, der im Frühjahr wunderschön blüht. Ich schicke täglich Gebete zum Himmel empor, dass die Eigentumsverhältnisse des Hauses ungeklärt bleiben mögen und uns so die Ruinen erhalten bleiben.

Und zum Dritten danke ich Ihnen für Ihre lieben Zeilen und für Ihre Bereitschaft, auch weiterhin für das “Prachtnetz” zu werben.. [*sic*] Ich weiss nicht, was ich sagen soll; sage ich, die Arbeit ist nichts wert, so riecht es nach “fishing compliments”; sage ich, die Verleger wissen sie nicht zu würdigen, so wäre es eine Ueberheblichkeit und nichts liegt mir ferner als überheblich zu sein. So sage ich gar nichts und überlasse es Ihrer Güte und dem Zufall, ob etwas daraus wird. Wenn Sie glauben, dass die Veröffentlichung eines weiteren Kapitels in der Mahabodhi von Vorteil wäre, so lasse ich Ihnen natürlich freie Hand. Auch scheint mir, die von Ihnen gewählte Stelle ganz geeignet zu sein. Ich schlage als Titel vor: “Ewigkeitsbekenner” und denke mir den Beginn folgendermassen:

Im Brahmajala-Sutta des Digha-Nikaya findet sich folgende Stelle: “Da ist irgend ein Büsser oder Brahmane Logiker und Erkenntnistheoretiker; der spricht dann auf Grund eigener, rein logisch erreichten, erkenntnistheoretisch gewonnenen Einsicht so: ‚Ewig ist das Selbst sowohl wie die Welt, starr, unwandelbar, feststehend wie ein Pfeiler; und diese Wesen laufen hin, wandern hin, entschwinden, tauchen auf. Es ist eben das Ewig-gleiche‘.”

Erkenntnistheoretische Ewigkeitsbekenner der Welt und der Seele (Seite 44).....um dieses Ziel des endgültigen Verwehens zu verwirklichen. (Seite 50).-

Allerdings glaube ich, dass die Uebersetzung nicht leicht sein wird und uns Beiden manch “harte Nuss zu knacken” aufgeben wird.

Da fällt mir auf, wie viele schwierige Redewendungen ich in meinen Brief eingestreut habe, aber ich schwöre Ihnen, ich tat es nicht aus pädagogischen Gründen, denn ich hatte neben meiner mich in dieser Hinsicht belastenden deutschen Mutter einen österreichischen Vater, der als Gartenverwalter des ehemaligen Kaiserhauses neben seinem Beruf anscheinend genügend Zeit hatte, seinem “hobby”, der Landschaftsmalerei, zu leben. Er starb, als ich

noch ein kleiner Junge war und ich sehe ihn in meiner Erinnerung immer nur hinter seiner Staffelei im Grünen sitzen von den Mal-Utensilien der Jahrhundertwende umgeben. Viele seiner zahlreichen Bilder aus der Umgebung Wiens schmücken die Wände unserer Wohnung und sind mir sehr lieb. Unter anderem malte er auch eine Serie von Aquarellen aus England und Schottland, die er als junger Mann bereist hatte. Sonst sind es meistens Oelbilder aus den schwermütigen Au-Landschaften der Donau mit nebelverhangenen Herbstbäumen und einsamen Teichen, daneben aber auch solche, die mit ihren jäh aufgerissenen Wolkenfetzen ganz modern anmuten. Ich habe eine solche Studie über meiner Buddha-Statue hängen und das eben die Wolken durchbrechende Licht ist mir ein gutes Symbol für die Erleuchtung Buddhas. Ich fühle mich anscheinend überhaupt zu Malern hingezogen, der einzige und nun auch schon tote Freund meiner ersten Lebensjahre war als Maler ein Schüler des wohl auch in England bekannten Tiroler Malers Egger-Lienz. Es sollte mich gar nicht wundern, wenn auch Sie diesem Laster fröhnen [*sic*] sollten; ich selbst habe leider kein Talent dafür geerbt. Aber, was ich nach diesem langen Umweg sagen wollte, nicht zu Ihrer Vervollkommenung in deutscher Sprache wählte ich die oft schwierigen Ausdrücke, sondern ganz einfach, weil ich mich rächen wollte. Denn auch Sie machen mir die Lektüre Ihrer Briefe nicht leicht. So war zum Beispiel im Schlussteil Ihres letzten Briefes, der übrigens in seiner famosen Schilderung Ihres Gespräches mit dem Portier und der Prägnanz seiner Wettervorhersage Ihr unbestrittenes Talent als Roman-Schriftstellerin verrät, der Ausdruck “peach” zu lesen. Im Zusammenhang ganz leicht verständlich, aber als ich dann im Wörterverzeichnis nachlas, musste ich zu meiner Ueberraschung sehen, dass dieses Wort im Deutschen “Pfirsichbaum” bedeutet. Ich hoffe von ganzem Herzen, dass nun Sie in Ihrem Lexikon nachsehen müssen und nun erstaunt den Kopf schütteln werden. Aber meine komplizierte Schreibweise hatte auch ihre Nachteile. So nahmen Sie irrtümlich an, dass ich dem Herzog von Windsor ähnlich gesehen habe oder dass ich an Gewicht zugenommen habe (“putting on weight”). Dabei ist das gerade Gegenteil der Fall: I am putting away weight. Ich bin stolz und glücklich, durch eine strenge Diät, die meine Frau in ihrer fürsorglichen Art immer wieder zu durchbrechen sucht, in den letzten 4 Monaten mindestens 15 Kilogram abgenommen zu haben, wodurch mein Herz etwas Luft bekam. Unter den österreichischen Ärzten geht das Sprichwort; dass die Herz-Therapie letzten Endes darin besteht, aus einer frischen und saften Birne eine “Kletzen” zu machen, d.h. eine saft- und kraftlose, vertrocknete und verschrumpfte ehemalige Frucht. Ich habe dieses Ziel zwar noch nicht vollkommen erreicht, aber ich bin auf dem besten Wege dazu. Und von dort kann es meiner Meinung nach nicht mehr weit zum Nibbana sein.



Nun zum Schluss herzliche Grüsse von meiner Frau und mir für Sie und Ihre Lieben.

Ich bin stets Ihr ergebener

AK

P.S. Vielen Dank für Ihr liebenswürdiges Gedenken bezüglich des Fa-hsien-Buches. Meine Gedanken zu "Potthapada", die ich Ihnen seinerzeit schickte, können Sie nach Belieben verwenden. Wollen Sie Ihnen eine gekürzte Wiedergabe der Rede oder eine Inhaltsangabe derselben vorausschicken?

2.2.22. Bennett to Kropatsch (November 7, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
7th November 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much indeed for your letter of 20th October. The photographs are lovely and Mrs. Kropatsch is beautiful; it was very kind of you to send them. I have often wondered how many people there are who have lived through the most recent decades of the present century who really preserve a calm – we were out East for so long that we have another background. I will send you some snaps of ourselves as soon as I can get some – which will probably be next summer as the light is bad at this time of year. We abandoned the camera some time ago, except for things I wanted for my painting, because we got such an accumulation, but about two summers ago some of husband's opposite numbers in Germany and South Africa came over and they, of course were taking photos of the entire party at every opportunity. I came across one of the results a few days ago, quite by chance, but so far have been unable to unearth the rest; no doubt I shall do so soon as Harold is giving up his office and is coming to work at home. I have therefore to excavate the contents of a large Victorian sideboard, originally designed to hold dinner services, glass, china etc., but which has now descended to the ignominy of sheltering anything anyone decides to "keep" but doesn't know what to do with! The exterior is really handsome, but I wouldn't say the same about the interior. A friend of Yvonne's has just taken a large flat and is looking for large pieces of furniture to put in it, so for a fleeting moment we thought he might like our antique even as a gift, but she has been to sale-rooms with him and says large pieces can be had "for a song" – whose song or whose singing not specified.

So sorry I misread your previous remarks about “putting on weight”; my first impression was that, since you had taken to a particular diet, you had lost weight. Then I thought that could not be so because all the tonics and patent foods they give people over here are calculated to make them put on weight. Obviously I ought to have taken the safe way and said “I am delighted to learn that you are making satisfactory change of weight.” Never mind! I will try to do better next time. About writing slang, or at least colloquialisms, if one doesn’t then the composition, of whatever nature, comes out like a treatise or an article for MBJ. I remember reading through a letter I wrote to you – ages ago – and thinking it sounded absolutely dreadful; schwierig is no word for it, it was far worse. I remember thinking at the time that I would never do such a thing again. So what about this? I am informed by Messers Routledge and Kegan Paul that the their reprint of The Journey of Fa-hsien will not be available until the end of next month. They will, however, post you a copy as soon as the issue is released. (Pouf!) Also, I did know Pfirsichbaum. (Except I do not think it is a Baum; it is surely a palm).<sup>272</sup> I am not bad at fruits in foreign languages but fish defeat me entirely – I suppose because I do not like it to eat, except mountain trout. It reminds me of a story told of Kreisler – he was talking along a shopping street with a friend and they passed a fishmonger’s which had cod spread out on the marble slab. K. remarked: “That reminds me. I have a matinée at the – Hall at 2.30.” I don’t know how the audience looks from a concert platform, but the three front rows of the stalls always look like that from the stage in the theatre.

I was rather surprised that you do not paint but I suppose I got the idea that you might from something in your writing – which is likely enough as your father was an artist. The part in your last letter, in which you described the early morning at that village you stayed at – the one of which you sent me a photograph – is just that that [*sic*] one feels so marvellously at the beginning of a day’s painting. – “vor uns lag der ganze herrliche Tag” – When you begin to be conscious of its coming on the canvas you realise there really is something beyond the six āyatanas. But I suppose orthodox Buddhists would say that, as long as one is handling rūpā such as paints and brushes, one is still in the realm of the āyatanas. I don’t think so, for the reason that one is not aware of handling brushes or palette knives or anything else.

Thank you very much about the new excerpt for translation. I was about half-way through it when I got a letter from a Sri Norman Perera of Calcutta – I imagine from his name that he is a Sinhalese – to say he was bringing out a Buddha Jayanti Review next May and asking me to get material from the

---

272 Handwritten addition.

European and USA Buddhist Societies. It is apparently to be a de luxe production, and the only authentic one on the subject to be published in India. All the Embassies and High Commissioners etc. are supporting it and MB Editorial is functioning on it in an advisory capacity. I have written back to Calcutta asking for details of space available, and particularly for information concerning articles, and in the meantime have had to put aside [sic] your translation. However I expect to finish it now that I have written round to the various societies and before I get the reply from Calcutta, after which I shall be busy again translating. The French had a tremendous celebration and published in their Journal detailed reports of all the speeches, which will, of course, have to be translated. It is easy enough to do but means hours and hours of typing, so if I post you your script without a covering letter please forgive me. I hope the Review does not want much in the way of formal articles because I shall soon be coming up to collection of the Wesak 1957 MBJ and I want contributions for that; on the other hand, if the Review is to constitute an official record I suppose I shall have to give that first place. I shouldn't think, though, in any case, that there will be much left to say after the state of literature that has been forthcoming during the present year!

I do not know the Ludwig Uhland poem but the metaphorical inferences still leave me cold with horror. A few weeks back I was asked for suggestions concerning a work on Karma; who dares to think of Karma these days? With the majority flatly refusing to see the things staring them in the face, clinging desperately to notions of comfortable commercial prosperity, – well, better not to start writing about that. Surely the Hittites knew all about it too. Enge Schlucht und schwarzer Berg is the work I was reading that day in Brighton! I thought of sending it to you when I found that Fa-hsien was not available but decided you would get a German copy yourself. Times Literary Supplement was advertising it and writing it up “good and hearty” during August. Apart from the Hittites themselves, I am full of admiration for the genius who worked out the hieroglyphics concerning bread and water, and deduced therefrom that there had been a famine. The Near East have done a better job in the matter of working out dates than the Indian contingent ever did – simply shifting the arrival of the Aryans in India some 500 years forward because there was a gap in dates they were unable to fill.

About the Library Association meeting last month, though everyone seemed very pleased, I could not see that we had made any advance. Nothing whatever transpired that would help me about your book. For myself, I like it better and better every time I make a translation of an excerpt or study any part in detail, but that, in a way, is no help towards getting it published because one realises the more that only a careful study can make it possible to estimate the worth. A conscientious Buddhist reader – I mean a publisher's reader –

would, of course, take the trouble; a non-Buddhist reader would not, [*sic*] Moreover, it would take him some time to discern the Brahmajala text. I hope to have more excerpts translated by the time I put it up to another publisher, and am wondering if a short introduction explaining the plan adopted in the text – something that would rather “catch the eye” of the reader – would not be a help. More about this later!

Well. “all the best” to you both, and many thanks for the photos, especially the one of Mrs Kropatsch

Always yours sincerely  
Adrienne Bennett

- I. takkī<sup>273</sup> vīmaṇṣī<sup>274</sup> patibhāna: There does not seem to be anything disparaging in the Pali such as Rhys Davids would suggest with “Sophist”.<sup>275</sup> The prefix “paṭi” is directional, meaning “back (to), against, towards, in opposition to.” “Bhāna” is “reciting, preaching”; “ready wit” does not seem to be justified. The Pali is much more like your “--- fordert ihn auf, durch ‘vernünftiges Denken’ die Wahrheit zu erkennen.”
2. kūtattho: The interpretation as “standing erect, immovable”, as given in Rhys Davids’s Dictionary, seems to be arbitrary; he may have put it in to support his own translation. Buddhadatta does not give the word at all. But both B. and R.D. give “kūta” as “trap, snare”, and the use in a figurative sense in the compound “kūṭavāṇija”, a dishonest trader. Though “vāṇija is in no way connected with vaṇjho”, it seems the idea of fraudulent practice cannot be excluded. R.D. here translates “vaṇjho” as “giving birth to nothing new”, but nothing like this appears in your German quotation.
3. Cavanti – upapajjanti: this “falling away” and “rising up again” suggests that the word “transmigration” would be better avoided.
4. sassati-saman: This seems to be the exact equivalent of your “Ewiggleiche.”

The above is not necessarily important in the present connection, but when I missed “vaṇjho” in the German I went over the whole quotation. I just thought you might like to know the result. I make the passage:

---

273 Logician.

274 Thinker.

275 That is, *takkī*.

Here, bhikkus, some samana<sup>276</sup> or brahman is a logician, an investigator by process of reasoning. Relying on logic, practising the reasoning process, from his own intelligence he has said this: “Eternal is the self; and the world, sterile and a false giver, stands immovable like a strong post before a city gate;<sup>277</sup> and these living things pass along, move about continuously, fall away from one existence and rise up in another. Yet it is eternally the same.

The following is the Pāli text of the part from the B.-J. Sutta:<sup>278</sup>

Pali <sup>279</sup>	Literal Tr. <sup>280</sup>	Rhys-Davids <sup>281</sup>
Idha, bhikkhave ekacco samaṇo vā brāhmaṇo vā	Here bhikkus  some samana or brahman (or)	Here bhikkus  some samana or brahman
I) takkī	sophist, logician  (from takketi: to think, reason, argue, trust.)	
hoti	is	is addicted to logic and reasoning
I) vīmaṇsī.	investigator (from vīmaṇsati: to consider, examine, in- vestigate)	
So	He	
takka-pariyāhatam	thought                      struck, reasoning – knocked	He gives utterance to the following conclusion of his own,

276 Pāli: *samaṇa* (Sanskrit: *śramaṇa*); literally, “those who strive,” a “renunciant.”

277 From here onwards the original letter is not typed but handwritten.

278 For Bennett’s contemporaneous translation of this passage, see Bennett 1954b: 252–253.

279 See Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1890: 16.

280 Bennett draws on Rhys Davids and Stede’s *Pali-English Dictionary*.

281 Copied with minor emendations from Rhys Davids 1899: 28–29.

vīmaṃsānucaritaṃ (vīmaṃsā – anucarita)	logic	against	beaten out by his argumentations, and based on his sophistry;
I) sayam - paṭibhānam	investigation – accompanied by forwarded with practised		
evam āha:	self - ready wit be oneself	promp- titude	
Sassato (Nom. Sing.)	readiness of speech	intelli- gence	Eternal is the soul; and the world,
attā ca loko ca	thus	has said:	
vañjho (Nom. Singular)	Eternal		giving birth to something new
2) kūṭaṭṭho (Nom. Sin- gular)	oneself and world and  barren, sterile		
esikaṭṭhāyitṭhito,	standing erect, immovable but also as “kūṭa + aṭṭha”: false, fraudulent + defi- nite measure. (aṭṭha, meaning eight number used in objective significance or in subjective signifi- cance as (i) mark of honour (ii) as a definite meas- ure of		is steadfast as a mountain peak, as a pillar firmly fixed;

	quantity & distance im- plying the respectability of a gift	
te ca sattā	esikā                      a strong esikāthambha      post before	and those living creatures, though
3) sandhāvanti	a city gate.	
3) saṃsaranti	ṭhāyī      being in a state of, lasting	they transmigrate and pass away,
3) cavanti	ṭhita      stood, station- ary, immovable	fall from one state of existence and spring up in an- other,
upapajjanti, atthi	they      and human be- ings then	
tveva (tu + eva)	now	
	run through transmigrate	yet
4) sassati – saman	move about continu- ously transmigrate	they are for ever and ever.
ti	fall away, shift pass from one state of existence to another  rise, to be reborn into  to be, it is  however	

	but, yet, + em- phatic now, then parti- cle  eternity – even, equal, like level, similar, same  thus, conclusion of sen- timent, etc	
--	---	--

### 2.2.23. Kropatsch to Bennett (November 23, 1956)

#### *Translation*

Dr Anton Kropatsch  
Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

23 November 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your very kind letter of 7 November and for sending me your translation from the “Prachtnetz” with the comments on the Pali passage, which was of great interest to me. I was also very pleased with the friendly words you found for my work. My wife thanks you especially for your kind words about the photos, some of which she took herself. Perhaps one day your “Victorian sideboard” will reveal its photographic treasures and you will let us participate in them. But “duty calls.”

I would like to make the following suggestions for changes to your translation, yet they only concern minor details:

1 move about (according to your own translation in the enclosure; also in Dahlke’s translation it does not say: “wandern hinüber,” but “wandern hin,” which means as much as “wandern umher”)

2 the goddess of truth warns the poet

3. [*sic*] appearance

4 patterns (logoi spermatikoi)

5 forms of things go

6 is identified

7 fast (siehe das erste Zitat aus der Rede Buddhas)

8 move about (see above)



- 9 this circle, in which you are a grain
- 10 the Eleatic Essence is transferred into the Heraclitic Becoming”
- 11 key-stone
- 12 at first
- 13 condition
- 14 suicide (ich meine “Selbstmord” ganz wörtlich genommen)
- 15 of his own existence
- 16 must
- 17 shall
- 18 finds
- 19 must (see above)
- 20 after a dash (–)
- 21 by the will to bide (?) (= auf sich nehmen) the Fate
- 22 the stimulation to escape

Although I assume that you are familiar with the following translation of our text by the “English Editorial Department, Union Buddha Sasana Council,” I take the liberty of adding it (quoted from “The Light of the Dhamma” Vol. III/2, p. 34, January 1956 Rangoon):

“In this world, monks, some recluse or Brahman is addicted to logic and investigating things. He, through his logical reasoning and from his own investigation, says as follows: ‘The soul as well as the world is eternal, unproductive, is steadfast as a mountain peak, as a gate-post firmly fixed; and though those living creatures run through and fare-on from this existence to that, fall from this existence and arise in another, yet there are the *atta* and the world that are similar to things eternal’”<sup>282</sup> (Curiously, as with Dahlke, the expression “false giver” or something similar to it is also missing here).

I enjoyed your rendition very much and am very grateful for it. May I take this opportunity to ask you for something? In the beginning of the *Satipatthana Sutta*,<sup>283</sup> it is said that the *Satipatthana* path is the “only” way to attain salvation. At least this is how Seidenstücker, Nyanaponika,<sup>284</sup> and Warren<sup>285</sup> translate this passage. On the other hand, Neumann translates it as the “*gerade Weg*”<sup>286</sup> and Dahlke speaks of a “unique” way.<sup>287</sup> In a note to his translation

---

<sup>282</sup> See English Editorial Department 1956: 34.

<sup>283</sup> The *Satipatṭhānasutta* (Discourse on the Foundations of Mindfulness) is the tenth *sutta* of the *Majjhimanikāya*.

<sup>284</sup> See Nyanaponika 1950 and 1956.

<sup>285</sup> See Warren 1906: 353.

<sup>286</sup> “straight way”; see Neumann 1922a: 122.

<sup>287</sup> See Dahlke 1921: 672.

he says: “The meaning of the word *ekayana* is not quite certain, but it probably amounts to ‘unique’ in the sense of ‘exquisite.’” But “unique,” i.e., the only possible way, is not the same as “unique,” i.e., the most exquisite way among other possible ways. In your opinion, which translation does the most justice to the Pali text? Prof. Frauwallner, whom I asked about this, said at first glance that the “*einzigste Weg*”<sup>288</sup> was the correct translation, but he would only make a final decision after studying the text in detail and comparing it with other passages in the Discourses.

The last few weeks have been quite exciting for us here in Vienna. Like me, all my acquaintances were deeply shocked by the events in Hungary, with which we still feel connected bound by old tradition. At first we feared – and not without reason, as it turned out later – that the Russian armoured roller might take part of Austria with it. But we were also stunned by the short-sightedness of the British and French politicians and strategists who, by launching their Suez action at the most inopportune moment and, as it now turns out, without success, let an hour of destiny for Europe pass by unused. The Austrians, who belong to my generation, have acquired a certain political instinct through the experiences of the last fifty years. This statement will certainly not seem arrogant to you if you consider that we have been through almost every possible political system in the past half century: My boyhood and youth fell during the last years of the Austro-Hungarian monarchy under Franz Josef. The disintegration of this Empire seemed impossible to us and yet it dissolved into its ethnic components at the end of the First World War. The first years of the young Republic brought inflation and severe material hardship. When these were over, the passionately fought battles between the right-wing “*Heimwehr*” under Starhemberg<sup>289</sup> and the left-wing “*Schutzbund*” under Körner,<sup>290</sup> the current president of Austria, began, which degenerated into open and bloody civil war. In 1933, in a legally very controversial coup d’état, the authoritarian Catholic corporative state under Dollfuss<sup>291</sup> was founded, which, like every dictatorship, worked with the means of material and conscience coercion and not least with concentration camps. Austrian National Socialism grew out of resistance against this system, which, despite its Catholic sentiments, did not find any resonance among the people, and not out of the struggle against democracy, as is usually assumed. In 1938 came the annexation by Germany and eventually the Second World War, the last phases of which rolled over Vienna and the eastern part of Austria with all

---

288 “only way.”

289 Engelbert Dollfuß (1892–1934), the Austrian Chancellor between 1932 and 1934.

290 The then Austrian president (1951–1957) Theodor Körner (1873–1957).

291 The Austrian politician Ernst Rüdiger Starhemberg (1899–1956).

their horrors. Then the four occupying powers established themselves in Austria, and Eastern Austria only owed it to the emerging enmity between America and Russia that it did not become Communist. During these ten years of military occupation, the country was de facto under the rule of the military of these countries, as no law or important decree could be enacted or implemented without their approval. Then, after the Treaty of 1955, when the Second Republic began to govern independently, it found itself – owing to the political lethargy of the population, which was only understandable – confined to proclaiming neutrality and dealing with and solving mainly economic questions. With such a background, it is not surprising that we can no longer be fooled in matters of politics. But forgive the long story; yet, I thought it might interest you, since people abroad – and unfortunately also in England – are often quite incorrectly informed about the situation in Austria.

I myself have been quite unwell during the past week. I was afflicted with unpleasant weaknesses, which not only made me unable to work, but also confined me to bed for most of the day. Since the cold high-pressure weather has set in, I have been feeling better and have been able to tackle the review of your translation as well as this letter. But it is nonsensical to demand more from life than it can give. At least that is what I have learned, and so I submit without resistance, rejoice in every hour that is granted to me free of complaints, and try to use it as best I can.

My wife sends many cordial greetings. I kindly ask you to give my regards to your family and to receive the best greetings and wishes for yourself, with which I remain

Your ever devoted

PS: The issues of the M.B.J. come only very irregularly and rarely and by no means continuously to the Vienna Buddhist Society. If you want to do something about this, the members would certainly be very grateful. The journals from Nepal that you announced previously have never arrived. The Nepalese monk Sugata (formerly Dr Wagner from Sweden),<sup>292</sup> who is touring Europe as a lecturer, was very disappointing while in Vienna. His lectures are characterised not only by beautiful photographs but also by his complete ignorance of Buddhist teachings. For example, he referred to the observance of the silas<sup>293</sup> as the Eightfold Path. The nonsense that not only monks and lay

---

292 The German Karl Heinz “Hendrick” Wagner (1911–2007) who was ordained in Nepal in 1955 together with his Swedish wife Ingrid Wagner (1910–2001). For more information on “the first dharma tourists” in Nepal, see Liechty 2017: 326–329.

293 Pāli: *sīla* (Sanskrit: *śīla*) or “morality.” Here Kropatsch refers to the Five Precepts or *pañcaśīla* (Sanskrit: *pañcaśīla*).

followers, but also educated university professors lecture about Buddhism is increasing at an alarming rate in recent times.

### *Original*

Dr. Anton Kropatsch  
Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

23.XI.1956.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Vielen Dank für Ihren überaus liebenswürdigen Brief vom 7.XI. und die Uebersendung Ihrer Uebersetzung aus dem "Prachtnetz" mit den Bemerkungen zu der Pali-Stelle, die mich überaus interessierten. Sehr gefreut haben mich auch die freundlichen Worte, die Sie für meine Arbeit fanden. Meine Frau dankt Ihnen besonders für Ihre lieben Worte zu den Photos, die sie zu m [*sic*] Teil selbst aufgenommen hat. Vielleicht gibt doch einmal Ihr "Victorian sideboard" seine photographischen Schätze preis und Sie lassen uns an ihnen partizipieren. Doch "die Pflicht ruft".

Zu Ihrer Uebersetzung erlaube ich mir die folgenden Aenderungsvorschläge zu machen, die aber nur Kleinigkeiten betreffen:

1 move about (entsprechend Ihrer eigenen Uebersetzung in der Beilage; auch in der Uebersetzung Dalke's [*sic*] heisst es nicht: "wandern hinüber", sondern "wandern hin", was so viel bedeutet wie "wandern umher")

2 the goddess of truth warns the poet

3. [*sic*] appearance

4 patterns (logoi spermatikoi)

5 forms of things go

6 is identified

7 fast (siehe das erste Zitat aus der Rede Buddhas)

8 move about (siehe oben)

9 this circle, in which you are a grain

10 the Eleatic Essence is transferred into the Heraclitic Becoming"

11 key-stone

12 at first

13 condition

14 suicide (ich meine "Selbstmord" ganz wörtlich genommen)

15 of his own existence

16 must

17 shall

18 finds

19 must (wie oben)

20 after a dash (–)

21 by the will to bide (?) (= auf sich nehmen) the Fate

22 the stimulation to escape

Obwohl ich annehme, dass Ihnen die nachfolgende Uebersetzung unserer Textstelle durch das “English Editorial Department, Union Buddha Sasana Council” bekannt ist, erlaube ich *[sic]* mir diese (zitiert nach “The Light of the Dhamma” Vol. III/2, pag. 34, vom Januar 1956 Rangoon) anzuschliessen: “In this world, monks, some recluse or Brahman is addicted to logic and investigating things. He, through his logical reasoning and from his own investigation, says as follows: ‘The soul as well as the world is eternal, unproductive, is steadfast as a mountain peak, as a gate-post firmly fixed; and though those living creatures run through and fare-on from this existence to that, fall from this existence and arise in another, yet there are the attā and the world that are similar to things eternal’” (Merkwürdigerweise fehlt auch hier, wie bei Dahlke, der Ausdruck “false giver” oder ihm ähnliches).-

Ihre Uebertragung hat mir sehr gut gefallen und ich danke Ihnen herzl. Darf ich Sie bei dieser Gelegenheit gleich um etwas bitten? Im Satipatthana-Sutta ist zu Beginn die Rede davon, dass der Satipatthana-Weg der “einzige” sei, um zur Erlösung zu gelangen. So übersetzen diese Stelle wenigstens Seidenstücker, Nyanaponika und auch Warren. Andererseits findet sich bei Neumann die Uebersetzung der “gerade Weg” und Dalke *[sic]* spricht von einem “einzigartigen” Weg. Er meint in einer Anmerkung zu seiner Uebersetzung: “Die Bedeutung des Wortes ekayana ist nicht ganz sicher, doch dürfte sie auf “einzigartig” im Sinne von “vorzüglich” hinauslaufen”. Doch “einziger”, d.h. einzig-möglicher Weg, ist nicht gleichbedeutend mit “einzigartiger”, d.h. vorzüglichster Weg unter anderen auch möglichen Wegen. Welche Uebersetzung wird Ihrer Meinung nach am ehesten dem Pali-Text gerecht? Prof. Frauwallner, den ich *[sic]* darüber befragen liess, meinte auf den ersten Blick, “einziger Weg” sei die richtige Uebersetzung, doch wollte er sich endgültig erst nach genauem Studium des Textes und nach seinem Vergleich mit anderen Stellen in den Reden festlegen.

Die letzten Wochen waren für uns hier in Wien recht aufregend. Alle meine Bekannten waren so wie ich aufs Tiefste erschüttert von den Ereignissen in Ungarn, mit dem wir uns aus alter Tradition noch immer verbunden fühlen. Wir fürchteten anfänglich – und das nicht ohne Grund, wie sich später herausstellte –, dass die russische Panzerwalze gleich einen Teil Oesterreichs mitnehmen könnte. Fassungslos standen wir aber auch der Kurzsichtigkeit der englischen und französischen Politiker und Strategen gegenüber, die durch ihre im ungeeignetsten Moment gestartete und ausserdem, wie sich jetzt zeigt, erfolglose Suez-Aktion eine Schicksalsstunde Europas ungenutzt

vorübergehen liessen. Die Oesterreicher, die meiner Generation angehören, haben sich durch die Erfahrungen der letzten 50 Jahre einen gewissen politischen Spürsinn erworben. Diese Behauptung wird Ihnen bestimmt nicht überheblich erscheinen, wenn Sie mit mir bedenken, dass wir in dem vergangenen halben Jahrhundert fast jedes nur mögliche politische System mitgemacht haben: Meine Knaben- und Jünglingszeit fiel in die letzten Jahre der österreichisch-ungarischen Monarchie unter Franz Josef; der Zerfall dieses Kaiserreiches erschien uns unmöglich und doch löste es sich am Ende des 1. Weltkrieges in seine völkischen Bestandteile auf. Die ersten Jahre der jungen Republik brachten Inflation und schwerste materielle Not; als diese vorbei waren, begannen die mit Leidenschaft geführten Kämpfe zwischen der rechtgerichteten [*sic*] "Heimwehr" unter Starhemberg und dem linksgerichteten "Schutzbund" unter Körner, dem gegenwärtigen Präsidenten Oesterreichs, die bis zum offenen und blutigen Bürgerkrieg ausarteten. Im Jahre 1933 wurde in einem rechtlich sehr umstrittenen Staatsstreich der autoritäre katholische Ständestaat unter Dollfuss gegründet, der wie jede Diktatur mit den Mitteln des materiellen und Gewissenszwanges und nicht zuletzt mit Konzentrationslagern arbeitet e [*sic*]. Im Widerstand gegen dieses System, das trotz seiner katholischen Gesinnung im Volke keinen Widerhall fand, und nicht im Kampfe gegen die Demokratie, wie gewöhnlich angenommen wird, erwuchs der österreichische National-Sozialismus. Im Jahre 38 kam der Anschluss an Deutschland und schliesslich der 2. Weltkrieg, dessen letzte Phasen mit all ihren Greueln [*sic*] über Wien und den östlichen Teil Oesterreichs hinwegrollten. Dann etablierten sich die 4 Besatzungsmächte in Oesterreich und Ost-Oesterreich verdankte es nur der aufkommenden Feindschaft zwischen Amerika und Russland, dass es nicht kommunistisch wurde. In diesen 10 Jahren der militärischen Besetzung stand das Land de facto unter der Herrschaft der Militärs dieser Länder, da kein Gesetz und keine wichtige Verordnung ohne deren Genehmigung erlassen oder durchgeführt werden konnte. Als dann nach dem Staatsvertrag des Jahres 55 die 2. Republik selbstständig zu regieren begann, sah sie sich bei der nur zu begreiflichen politischen Lethargie der Bevölkerung darauf beschränkt, die Neutralität zu proklamieren und hauptsächlich wirtschaftliche Fragen zu behandeln und zu lösen.- Bei einer solchen Vorbildung ist es nicht verwunderlich, dass man uns in Fragen der Politik nicht mehr täuschen kann. Aber verzeihen Sie die lange Erzählung; doch ich dachte, es könnte Sie interessieren, da man im Ausland – und leider auch in England – über die Verhältnisse in Oesterreich oft ganz unrichtig orientiert ist.

Mir selbst ist es in der vergangenen Woche recht schlecht gegangen; ich wurde von unangenehmen Schwächezuständen heimgesucht, die mich nicht nur arbeitsunfähig machten, sondern auch be8nahe [*sic*] den ganzen Tag ans

Bett fesselten. Seitdem das kalte Hochdruckwetter eingesetzt hat, fühle ich mich wohler und konnte so die Durchsicht Ihrer Uebersetzung und diesen Brief in Angriff nehmen. Doch es ist unsinnig, vom Leben mehr zu verlangen, als es geben kann; das wenigstens habe ich gelernt, und so beuge ich mich ohne Widerstreben, freue mich jeder beschwerdefreien Stunde, die mir gegönnt ist, und such sie, so gut es nur geht, zu nutzen.

Meine Frau sendet viele herzliche Grüsse. Ich bitte Sie, Ihre Familie von mir zu grüssen und für Sie selbst die besten Grüsse und Wünsche in Empfang zu nehmen, mit denen ich verbleibe

Ihr Ihnen stets ergebener

P.S. Die Hefte des M.B.J. kommen nur sehr unregelmässig und selten und keineswegs fortlaufend in die Wiener buddh-Gesellschaft; wenn Sie hier etwas unternehmen wollten, wären Ihnen die Mitglieder bestimmt sehr dankbar. Die seinerzeit von Ihnen angekündigten Zeitschriften aus Nepal sind niemals eingetroffen. Sehr enttäuscht hat in Wien der nepalesische Mönch Sugata (früher Dr. Wagner aus Schweden), der Europa als Vortragender bereist. Seine Vorträge zeichnen sich neben schönen Lichtbildern vor allem durch seine vollkommene Unkenntnis der buddhistischen Lehre aus. So bezeichnete er als den Achtpfad die Einhaltung der Silas. Der Unfug, dass nicht nur Mönche und Laienanhänger, sondern auch ausgebildete Universitätsprofessoren über Buddhismus vollkommenen Unsinn vortragen, häuft sich in der letzten Zeit in erschreckendem Masse.

## 2.2.24. Bennett to Kropatsch (December 3, 1956)

9, Norland Square Mansions  
Holland Park, London W.II  
3rd December 1956

Dear Dr. Kropatsch,

Thank you very much for your letter and enclosed script of 23rd November. I am so glad you were pleased with the translation; I will make all the alterations in the script and post it to Calcutta immediately.<sup>294</sup> I did not want to send it before because I know everyone of note is in Khatmandu [*sic*] for the

---

<sup>294</sup> The first paragraph as published in Kropatsch 1957b: 36 eventually read: "In the Brahmajala Sutta of the Digha Nikaya occurs the following passage: 'There is some Samana or Brahman, a logician and theorist, who, on the ground of insight gained from his own logic and reasoning, speaks thus: "Eternal is the Self, as also the World, inflexible, immutable, standing fast as a pillar: and these beings pass along, move about, disappear, rise again to the surface. Yet, is eternally the same".'"

Congress,<sup>295</sup> and I would just as soon that things of value should not lie about in the General Office where there are only babus. I was very interested to read the translation from the Union Buddha Sasana Council, especially as that is the first specimen I have seen of their work; it conforms exactly to the little I have heard of the translation side in that it is a hotch-potch of the Rhys Davids efforts. “Mountain peak” is suggested as a simile in R.D.’s dictionary;<sup>296</sup> “fare-on” is Mrs R.D.,<sup>297</sup> who was addicted to the expression and, I think, must have coined it – unless she got it from some early Victorian tract. It doesn’t mean anything in particular! I am glad, though, that the B.S. Council struck to “atta” and did not try to translate the term. I am about to study the matter of Ekāyana<sup>298</sup> and will append a separate sheet concerning it.

Harold’s office desk, together with a collection of files, papers, carpet (very welcome!), chair, stool, and so on, arrived at the flat a week ago last Friday. I was grateful when I found the desk and chair fitted easily without our having to do anything about the famous sideboard. You might wonder why we didn’t take some measurements beforehand, but H. got the idea into his head that the desk was no larger than a table that once occupied the space in question, and just would not condescend to feet and inches! I feel sure Mrs. Kroparsch [*sic*] will agree with me that men are pig-headed creatures and sometimes there is no doing anything with them. Still, there were no disastrous results this time, but as H. only wanted one cupboard of the sideboard for his things – it yielded only bales of ancient postcards though there is no reason to suppose the remainder will prove entirely kūṭatṭha<sup>299</sup> – I deferred examination because of (a) some translations I had to make of Kathā-Vatthu<sup>300</sup> (a fearsome business), and (b) the international situation. Herewith my august views concerning the latter!

When we began piling up forces etc. in Cyprus and the Russian leaders came to pay us visits – somewhere, I think, about May or June – we all thought there must be something of importance pending. No one I met, or heard of, trusted the visits, and the newspaper posters used to announce day by day:

---

295 That is, the Fourth World Buddhist Conference of the World Fellowship of Buddhists held in Kathmandu, Nepal, from 15 to 21 November 1956.

296 See Rhys Davids and Stede 1922b: 53.

297 The English scholar of Buddhism and wife of Thomas William Rhys Davids, Caroline Rhys Davids (1857–1942).

298 A Pāli compound (*eka + ayana*), literally meaning “one way.” The exact meaning has been discussed both by Buddhist commentators and modern scholars. See, for example, Vélez de Cea 2013: 61–67.

299 Literally, “immovable,” “unchangeable,” “standing erect.”

300 The *Kathāvatthu* (Points of Controversy) is the fifth book of the Pāli *Abhidhammapiṭaka*.



“B.&K.<sup>301</sup> visit so-and-so”, which seemed to be a rather undignified way of referring to any potentates. “I don’t like it; I shall be glad when that lot goes”, was the sort of remark one heard frequently from many different kinds of people. When USA suddenly refused money for the Assuan dam, without informing us they were going to do so, and the Egyptians replied by seizing the Canal, one assumed that something of the nature had been foreseen and that our answer was ready. I don’t think it occurred to anyone [*sic*], though, that the USA was acting [*sic*] to a large extent in concert with the Egyptians; rather the matter was ascribed to the USA oil interests which had, 2-3 years before, been instrumental in getting us out of Abadan because they wanted to control the Middle East oil interests entirely. Then the French got hold of information – it is said that both their intelligence and ours have been maintained since the war – which seemed to make it essential that immediate action should be taken. We, apparently, also had something of the information but were less convinced until the ultimatum was issued [*sic*] with a 12-hour notice. All along, the reasons given out here were to the effect that we had to protect the Suez Canal for shipping, but when the Allied troops did actually move into Egypt and the Russians threatened to rocket-bomb Britain and France, it was clear that the Soviet had had something in train which we had at least halted; hence their utter fury with us. USA said they would regard that as “an unfriendly action”, to themselves, that is. There was nothing very remarkable in events so far, but when USA suddenly became rude and objectionable also – well, that wasn’t so clear. There followed a series of incredible volte-face as, for example, the Allied troops were getting on well in the Suez, and the Israelis were making a good job of their thing – the Egyptians did not show any avidity for dying for Nasser and were ready to give up any time – when, following on clear statements on the Wednesday evening that we were continuing in our various theatres, Ben Gurion<sup>302</sup> told the Israeli parliament on the Thursday morning that they were ordering a cease-fire; we did similarly. No reasons transpired for a few days and then we learnt that the American Jews would withdraw all financial help to Israel – it was claimed that they had always maintained the country with their money and that the Israeli armed forces were entirely financed by them. We also learnt that the USA had threatened both France and Britain with economic sanctions. Still later

---

301 That is, the Premier of the Soviet Union (1955–1958) Nikolai Bulganin (1895–1975) and First Secretary of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union (1953–1964) Nikita Khrushchev (1894–1971).

302 The Prime Minister of Israel (1948–1954 and 1955–1963) David Ben-Gurion (1886–1973).

we heard that Eisenhower<sup>303</sup> had received a letter from Eden<sup>304</sup> and that replied to the effect that he would be pleased to meet him and discuss things, but that in less than 6 hours Eden got another letter – message, I suppose – from Eisenhower reversing the former completely and following up with more communications which were abusive. Somewhere about this time came [*sic*] the US Presidential elections, and one supposed Eisenhower was trying to shelve the whole thing until he was sure of his own re-election. In the meantime, New York Times and Washington Post had been hammering for weeks the necessity of USA making a clear statement of their policy in the Middle East, and even New York Tribune – Eisenhower’s particular paper – was adding its voice to the quota. Then it came out that Eisenhower would do nothing till he had seen Nehru in the middle of December, and it was obvious that he was contemplating – as has since been said – an entire re-shuffle with USA and the Asia-Africa group standing in together, leaving Western Europe – where? One sees from that something of the bitterness of the UN throughout [*sic*]; at first UN would, understandably, ask why we went into Egypt without a consultation, but the matter was urgent and the real reason of USA plus Russia could not be stated. It had also to be borne in mind that, apart from not possessing any armed force, UN is not composed of entirely disinterested members; for example, S.E. Asia has already a large and influential Chinese population, and India has China on her doorstep, so to speak. Further, over 200 meetings had already been held in connection with the division in the Middle East and no single member had had the courage to urge a settlement; USA sat on the fence because [*sic*] of internal oil interests and no one would take the chance of opposing her. Under similar circumstances, regarding lack of time in an emergency, USA went into Korea and was supported later by all the rest, but the opportunity occurred only because Russia did not attend the particular meeting of the UN so there was no veto. Now, UN having got together a little force and installed some of it in Egypt, I think we are right to bring our men home. If UN cannot become effective – and in an emergency it would obviously be too small and incompletely equipped – then we are better off than we were before because it will be proven that UN is a liability no one can sustain. But where does Hungary come in in all this? According to a report from Buda-Pesth radio the Hungarians staged their own affair without intervention or suggestion from anyone else, and what has UN done for them? Nagy’s<sup>305</sup> last words on the wireless were: “What is the UN

---

303 The thirty-fourth US President (1953–1961) Dwight D. Eisenhower (1890–1969).

304 The Prime Minister of the United Kingdom (1955–1957) Anthony Eden (1897–1977).

305 Former Hungarian Chairman of the Council of Ministers (1953–1955) and leader of the Hungarian Revolution Imre Nagy (1896–1958).

doing?” At one pf [*sic*] the worst moments in the whole ghastly business the UN “postponed” a discussion of Hungarian affairs “till the end of next week” – i.e. for 5-6 days. Dulles told the press reporters, when he left his meeting with Eisenhower in Georgia 2-3 days ago, that he would rather see Hungary “in a state of evolution that revolution.” When university students were demonstrating all over Western Europe against the Soviet action in Hungary, Eisenhower told USA students that any of them who volunteered for action would lose his USA citizenship. One knows, of course, that bands of unarmed, untrained students would be of little use to the Hungarians, even if they could have reached the scene of action, but Eisenhower’s pronouncements seemed just brutal. Out of the whole thing I think the suggestion of Metaxas<sup>306</sup> is the key – provides the key, rather, since he was speaking in a slightly different connexion. He says that on his last visit to Russia – a few months back, it seems – that the Russian youth was indifferent to Communism and was convinced that when Eisenhower and Bulganin met (for several hours) alone at the Geneva conference last year they came to a secret agreement, and that this explains the anomalies in Russia’s foreign policy. If that is so, and it seems likely, the agreement must have been after the pattern of Yalta – namely, that in return for certain observations – which in the present case would probably refer to Asia – Russia should have a free hand in S.E. Europe. We all know USA carried out that policy to the letter; the Balkan states have lived in misery for years as a result. Further we know now – that is, the general public – from all the war memoirs and reports of people in high places, that the Allies wanted to go into the Balkans after Italy but that Eisenhower was jealous of the British influence and would not permit it. We also know of the fateful August days in Warsaw when the Russians would not even let us refuel our planes which were trying to give help to Warsaw. Further we know of Eisenhower’s order to Montgomery<sup>307</sup> to withdraw British troops from Berlin so that the Russians could go in and occupy a part of it. So much for Yalta, and what does the last “meeting” promise for us? We have had, in the last three days, firm assurances that NATO stands and is unaffected by the differences of opinion displayed at UN and elsewhere – this from Gen. Gruenther<sup>308</sup> and the succeeding Norwegian Commander,<sup>309</sup> but we have not yet heard what Eisenhower may do with Nehru. And when one comes to think

---

306 The French journalist Alexandre Métaxas (1919–1974).

307 The British Field Marshall Bernard Montgomery (1887–1976).

308 NATO’s Supreme Allied Commander in Europe from 1953–1956, the US-General Alfred Gruenther (1899–1983).

309 Gruenther’s successor (1956–1963), the US-General Lauris Norstad (1907–1988) who was of Norwegian descent.

of it, as Dr. Adenauer<sup>310</sup> [*sic*] said a short while back, there are 190 millim [*sic*] people in Western Europe – well, can’t they look after themselves – know where they stand rather than be tied to the shifting and shifty policy of a nation that has, after all, a vast and wealthy population that wants a larger market for its goods?

Sorry I seem to have covered many sheets of paper with all this. I enclose a few photos etc. from the Times and Sunday Times to make good my deficiencies. Don’t pay too much attention to the Labour Party – they are all split up amongst themselves and want to gloss over their differences by getting back into power.

I was so glad to get your post card last evening and to know you are better and have received Fa-hsien – on your birthday, too!<sup>311</sup> I feel in my bones that that is a good karma for us both! When Kegan Paul postponed their reprinting I could not possibly guess when you would receive your copy. In any case I did not know the date of your birthday and could not possibly have arranged any date of delivery!

With very best wishes – and now that I come to think of it I believe the good karma belongs to Mrs. Kropatsch since, in actual fact, it must have been she who handed you the book.

Yours sincerely

Adrienne Bennett<sup>312</sup>

PS: I forgot to say that the B.B.C. correspondent, who got out of Egypt about a week ago, broadcast that Cairo is full of machine-gun nests & Russian tanks, camouflaged in parks etc. He said that the Egyptians were in a state of terror thinking that this would become a second Hungary. Syria seems about the same and to have the same fears. [...]. Saturday we heard the oil companies were making arrangements “on their own”; Sunday we heard at least one tanker had arrived here!!!

Kūtatto I know how R.D. got his “mountain peak”. One might take the word as *kūtataṭṭha*, which could be prominence, top, or eight. “Eight” may signify the actual number, a mark of respectability [*sic*] or honour, or a definite measure of quality or distance.<sup>313</sup> The same phrase occurs in *Sāmañña-Phala Sutta* 26 (--- *vañjo kūtaṭṭho esikaṭṭhāyitaṭṭhito*) and here R.D. translates as follows: “---they are barren (so that nothing is produced out of them), steadfast as a

---

310 The Chancellor of West Germany (1949–1963) Konrad Adenauer (1876–1967).

311 The post card is not extant.

312 The following paragraph is a partly illegible handwritten postscript by Bennett regarding the situation in the Middle East.

313 Bennett draws on Rhys Davids and Stede 1921: 15.

mountain peak, as a pillar firmly fixed.” (The “they” refers to “seven thibgs [sic]” which are neither made nor created etc., namely: the four elements, ease, pain, and the soul. The words “so that --- out of them” are in brackets in R.D.’s text.)<sup>314</sup>

### Satipatthāna S.

#### Ekāyano

“Ekāyano ayaṃ bhikkave maggo sattānaṃ visuddhiyā soka-pariddavānaṃ samatikkamāya duhkha-domanassānaṃ atthagamāya ñāyassa adhigamāya nibbānassa sacchikiriyaṃ, yadidaṃ cattāro satipatthāna [sic]. Katame cattāro? Idha bhikkhave bhikku kāya [sic] kāyānupassī viharati ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhiññhā domanassaṃ – vedanāsu vedanānupassī -- cite cittanupassī [sic] --- vineyya loke abhiññhā-domanassaṃ - - dhammesu dhammānupassī viharati ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhikkhā [sic]-domanassaṃ.”<sup>315</sup>

This would read, according to more or less superficial translation: This is the only way, bhikkus, to the purification of beings, to the passing beyond of grief and lamentation, to the extinction of grief and misery, to the attainment of the right manner for / of realisation of Nibbana, namely, the four applications of mindfulness. (Or, the passage might read: ---- to the attainment of the right manner / method, to the realisation of Nibbana --- etc.) What are the four? Here, bhikkus, the bhikku lives, with regard to the body, an observer of the body, strenuous, aware and mindful, having overcome the covetousness and grief of the world, (Similarly [sic] with regard to: feelings, thoughts (or mind), and “dhamme”. For “dhamme”, PTS translates “ideas”, but I think the translation given by Radhakrishnan in a similar case in the Dhamma-phada (Opening lines) is intended here, namely, that “dhamme” in such connection is to be taken as vedanā,<sup>316</sup> saññā<sup>317</sup> and saṅkhāra.<sup>318</sup>

Ekāyano. There seems to be no doubt in the English dictionaries that this word means “The one way”, i.e. the one and only way. There are dozens of compounds of “eka” in which this sense is preserved, such as: ekacara, one who lives alone; ekapaṭṭa, having a single lining; ekatta, unity, loneliness; ekapadika-magga, a foot-path; ekarāja, universal king; ekavidha, of one kind

314 See Rhys Davids 1899: 74.

315 See Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1903: 290.

316 Literally, “sensation.”

317 Sanskrit: *saṃjñā*, that is, “perception.”

318 Sanskrit: *saṃskāra*, that is, “volition.”

-- etc. There is also *ekaṅsaṃ uttarāsaṅgaṃ karoti*, to arrange the upper robe over one shoulder.<sup>319</sup>

If therefore *ekāyano* is to be taken as the only way, how far is does [*sic*] the sutta bear out the claim?

It deals with awareness of the body, feelings and mental processes – the first at some length – as in many other suttas, as for example, *Sāmañña-Phala*. For “*dhamme*” it considers the Five Hindrances (*nīvaraṇa*), the Five Skandhas, the *Ayatanas*, Fetters (*saṃyojana*), the Factors of Enlightenment (*bojjhaṅga*), the Four Noble Truths and the Eightfold Path. – all the “*dhammas*” at length. The Sutta would therefore seem to be a general résumé of the Buddha’s teaching. Is this – the whole teaching – to be considered as the “only way”? In that case, what are the possible meanings of *satipaṭṭhāna*?

*Sati*<sup>320</sup> – memory, recognition, consciousness, intentness of mind, watchfulness of mind, mindfulness, alertness.<sup>321</sup>

Of these, “memory” is the nearest to the original meaning of “*sati*”, and this should be taken into account as parts of the present sutta are obviously old. The Vedic form was “*smṛti*”, from *smṛ*, memory. The *Kalpa-suttas* were all *smṛti*, as contrasted with the *Vedas* and *Brahmanas* which were *śruti*, or revealed.

Perhaps one comes to consider the sense as the “only way” being the remembering or bearing in mind of the Buddha’s teachings. \*

*Paṭṭhāna* – (pa-etha) setting forth, putting forward; used in compounds only with *sati*, hence: the setting up of *sati*. Origin, starting-point, cause, were later meanings of *paṭṭhāna*.<sup>322</sup>

*Ñāya* – also of interest. Skt: *nyāya* ni+i, method, truth, system. (Later meaning: logic).

Also, fitness, right manner, right conduct. Often applied to the “right path” (*ariyamagga*=*ariyañāya*; *ariya ñāya* is the causal law; *ñāya-patipanna*=walking the right path).<sup>323</sup>

\* After all, *sati* is only one of 19 factors present in all types of moral consciousness.

The conclusion of the sutta provides some evidence.

“*Yo hi koci bhikkhave ime cattāro satapaṭṭhāne evaṃ bhāveyya sattavassāni [sic], tassa dvinnam phalaṇam aññataram phalam pāṭikaṅkham ditth’ eva*

319 Bennett draws on Rhys Davids and Stede 1922a: 160–161.

320 Sanskrit: *smṛti*; commonly rendered as “mindfulness.”

321 See Rhys Davids and Stede 1925: 131.

322 See Rhys Davids and Stede 1923a: 25.

323 See Rhys Davids and Stede 1923b: 122.

[sic] dhamme aññā sati vā upādisese anāgāmitā.<sup>324</sup> (Whoever bhikkus, should develop these 4 Satipatthanas for seven years, to him one of two desired fruits (shall accrue), (either) he is an Arhat (aññā) in the present world, or, if he has a residuum of karmic effect, he is an anagami (one who will return no more). The sutta then reduces the 7 years to 6, 5, 4, etc, and finally to 7 days. Then comes the following: “Ekāyano ayaṃ bhikkhave maggo --- sacchikiriyaṃ yad idaṃ (sic) 4 Satipatthāna ti’ iti yaṃ taṃ vuttaṃ, idaṃ etaṃ paṭicca vuttan ti.”<sup>325</sup> – Because of this, there was said that which was said (namely) Ekāyano --- satipatthāna.

## 2.2.25. Kropatsch to Bennett (December 15, 1956)

### *Translation*

Vienna, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

15 December 1956

Dear Madam!

Thank you very much for your kind letter of 3 December and especially for the trouble you have taken with the word Ekayano. You must have a profound knowledge of Pali, which I unfortunately lack completely, so that I always have to seek the advice of others in such matters. It is true that the “practice of right mindfulness” is the only way recommended by the Buddha. However, it is strange that not only in the meditation schools of Ceylon and Burma, but also in European circles dealing with meditation, the completely un-European way of pure body contemplation is practised, even though the largest part of the Discourse deals with mind-object contemplation, under which the various aspects of the Buddha’s teachings are to be understood. This could be due to the fact that in the translations of the Discourse, the exercises of inhalation and exhalation, the body postures, and the corpse contemplations are usually given in full, due to their lesser scope, while the contemplations of the mind-object are only given in abbreviated form, precisely because of their length, so that the impression may arise that they are less important. Yet, the exact opposite is the case. I believe that European Buddhists urgently need to be enlightened in this respect, otherwise it will come to what is already beginning to be lamented in Ceylon, namely, that tantric exercises will take the place of a clear and sensible view of reality. Perhaps Nyanaponika

324 See Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1903: 315.

325 See Rhys Davids and Carpenter 1903: 315.

should have placed more emphasis on this in his book “Satipatthana”<sup>326</sup> and in later publications.

No less interesting were your political comments and newspaper clippings. Shortly after receiving your lines, I read an Austrian account of events in the Middle East, which almost completely coincides with yours. However, one also hears other voices here and one cannot blame the average Austrian for not distinguishing so sharply between Americans and English and for speaking commonly of a shared “Anglo-Saxon policy” after the two World Wars. Goethe’s<sup>327</sup> words: “Politisch Lied”, ein garstig’ Lied”<sup>328</sup> are now being quoted more and more frequently. And yet Goethe lived in a time when even politicians and generals were still gentlemen. I do not know whether you are familiar with the following story. Goethe was awarded the Cross of the Legion of Honour by Napoleon,<sup>329</sup> who held him in high esteem. When Napoleon had to withdraw from Central Germany and the united Prussian-Austrian troops entered Weimar, the commander-in-chief of the Allies took up quarters in Goethe’s house. The master of the house received him with the French decoration awarded to him by Napoleon in his buttonhole, whereupon the commanding general, an Austrian, pointed to the ribbon with a friendly smile and said: “Aber, Herr Geheimrat, das trägt man doch nicht mehr.”<sup>330</sup> You can imagine what would have happened if Zhukov<sup>331</sup> or Eisenhower or de Gaulle<sup>332</sup> had been received by a German with a National Socialist emblem on his chest. For years I have been unable to get rid of one thought: What is the real reason – for economic or political problems cannot be the only decisive factor here – that Germans and Englishmen cannot find their way to each other despite their national and spiritual affinity? If they had stood by each other in the last century not as foes but as friends, there would have been no World War I and thus no Bolshevism, no Versailles, no Hitler and no World War II, and the two peoples would be playing the roles in world history that correspond to their abilities. The last battle that the English and Germans fought together led to the glorious victory at Waterloo. Is the nemesis of

---

326 See Nyanaponika 1950, which Kropatsch also referenced in his first book.

327 The great German poet Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749–1832).

328 Kropatsch refers to Goethe’s tragic play *Faust I* (1808): “Ein garstig Lied! Pfui! ein politisch Lied!” (A lousy song! Bah! A political song!). Drawing on Goethe, fellow German poet August Heinrich Hoffmann von Fallersleben’s (1798–1874) poem *Ein politisch Lied ein garstig Lied* (A Political Song, A Lousy Song; 1842) begins with “Ein politisch Lied, ein garstig Lied,” the version quoted by Kropatsch.

329 The then Emperor Napoleon I (r. 1804–1814 and 1815; 1769–1821). Goethe received the Cross in 1808.

330 “But, Mr Privy Councillor, you don’t wear that any more.”

331 The Soviet Minister of Defence (1955–1957), Georgy Zhukov (1896–1974).

332 The French politician Charles de Gaulle (1890–1970).



which the Greek tragedians sang a song at work here, or are demonic forces at work who have the misfortune of humanity dear to their heart?

But now comes the time of the year that I always look forward to with joyful anticipation – Christmas. Whenever it was possible, a fir tree with its lights and colourful decorative figures, which I still inherited from my mother, stood in our living room, and so it will be this year too. And when on the evening of 24 December the candles will spread their good and gentle glow in the room and my wife will play the old German Christmas carols on the piano, I will, as always, remember all my friends near and far with love; among them you, dear madam, will not be the last. But already today my greetings go to you and I wish you with all my heart all the best for the festive season and the New Year. My wife joins me in wishing you all the best, which I also ask you to pass on to your family.

Your very devoted

### *Original*

Wien, II. Thugutstrasse 4/14

15.XII.1956.

Liebe, verehrte gnädige Frau!

Vielen Dank für Ihr liebes Schreiben vom 3.XII. und vor allem für die Mühe, die Sie sich mit dem Worte Ekayano gemacht haben. Sie müssen über eine profunde Kenntnis des Pali verfügen, die mir leider vollkommen abgeht, sodass ich in solchen Fragen immer den Rat anderer einholen muss. Es ist schon richtig, dass es sich bei der “Uebung der rechten Aufmerksamkeit” um den einzigen Weg handelt, den Buddha empfiehlt. Allerdings ist es merkwürdig, dass nicht nur in den Meditationsschulen Ceylons und Burmas, sondern, von dort übernommen, auch in europäischen Kreisen, die sich mit Meditation befassen, der ganz un-europäische Weg der reinen Körper-Betrachtungen geübt wird, obwohl der größte Teil der Rede sich mit den Geistobjekt-Betrachtungen, unter welchen wohl die verschiedenen Gesichtspunkte der Lehre Buddhas zu verstehen sind, beschäftigt. Es könnte dies daran liegen, dass bei den Uebersetzungen der Rede die Uebungen der Ein- und Ausatmung, der Körperstellungen und der Leichenbetrachtungen zumeist im vollen Wortlaut gebracht werden, da sie geringeren Umfanges sind, während die Geistobjekt-Betrachtungen eben wegen ihrer Länge nur gekürzt wiedergegeben werden, sodass der Eindruck entstehen mag, sie wären weniger wichtig; doch ist gerade das Gegenteil der Fall. Ich glaube, hier wäre eine Aufklärung der euro-

päischen Buddhisten dringend nötig, da es sonst dazu kommt, was man bereits in Ceylon zu beklagen beginnt, dass tantrische Uebungen an die Stelle einer klaren und verständigen Durchschauung der Wirklichkeit treten. Vielleicht hätte auch Nyanaponika in seinem Buche “Satipatthana” und in späteren Veröffentlichungen darauf grösseres Gewicht legen sollen.

Nicht weniger interessant waren Ihre politischen Ausführungen und Zeitungsausschnitte. Knapp nach Erhalt Ihrer Zeilen las ich eine österr. Darstellung der Ereignisse im nahen Osten, die sich fast vollkommen mit der Ihren deckt. Allerdings hört man hier auch andere Stimmen und man kann es dem Durchschnitts-Oesterreicher nicht verargen, dass er nicht so scharf zwischen Amerikanern und Engländern unterscheidet und nach den beiden Weltkriegen gemeinhin von einer beiden Staaten gemeinsamen “angelsächsischen Politik” spricht. Immer häufiger werden jetzt auch Goethes Worte: “Politisch Lied’, ein garstig’ Lied” zitiert; und dabei lebte Goethe in einer Zeit, in der selbst Politiker und Feldherrn noch Kavaliers waren. Ich weiss nicht, ob Ihnen folgende Geschichte bekannt ist. Goethe erhielt von Napoleon, der ihn sehr schätzte, das Kreuz der Ehrenlegion verliehen. Als Napoleon sich aus Mitteldeutschland zurückziehen musste und die vereinigten preussisch-österreichischen Truppen in Weimar einzogen, nahm der Oberbefehlshaber der Alliierten im Hause Goethes Quartier. Der Hausherr empfing ihn mit der ihm von Napoleon verliehenen französischen Auszeichnung im Knopfloch, worauf der kommandierende General, ein Oesterreicher, mit einem freundlichen Lächeln auf das Ordensband zeigte und sagte: “Aber, Herr Geheimrat, das trägt man doch nicht mehr”. Sie können sich vorstellen, was geschehen wäre, wenn Schukow oder Eisenhower oder de Gaulle von einem Deutschen mit einem nat.-soz. Emblem auf der Brust empfangen worden wäre. – Mich lässt seit Jahren ein Gedanke nicht los: Was ist der eigentliche Grund – denn wirtschaftliche oder politische Probleme können hier nicht allein ausschlaggebend sein –, dass Deutsche und Engländer trotz ihrer volklichen und geistigen Verwandtschaft nicht zu einander finden können. Wären sie sich im letzten Jahrhundert nicht als Feinde gegenüber, sondern als Freunde zur Seite gestanden, so hätte es keinen 1. Weltkrieg und dadurch auch keinen Bolschewismus, kein Versailles, keinen Hitler und keinen 2. Weltkrieg gegeben und die beiden Völker würden die ihren Fähigkeiten entsprechenden Rollen in der Weltgeschichte spielen. Die letzte Schlacht, die Engländer und Deutsche gemeinsam schlugen, führte zu dem glorreichen Sieg bei Waterloo. Wartet hier jene Nemesis, von der die griechischen Tragiker ein Lied singen wussten oder sind dämonische Kräfte am Werke, denen das Unheil der Menschheit am Herzen liegt?

Doch nun kommt jene Zeit des Jahres, der ich immer, so alt ich bin, mit freudiger Erwartung entgegen sehe, Weihnachten. Wann immer es nur möglich

war, stand ein Tannenbaum mit seinen Lichtern und bunten Figurenschmuck, den ich noch von meiner Mutter übernommen habe, in unserem Wohnzimmer, und so wird es auch in diesem Jahre sein; und wenn am Abend des 24. Dezember die Kerzen ihren guten und sanften Schein im Zimmer verbreiten werden und meine Frau auf dem Klavier die alten deutschen Weihnachtslieder spielen wird, werde ich, so wie immer, all meiner Freunde in Nah und Fern mit Liebe gedenken; unter ihnen werden Sie, liebe gnädige Frau, nicht die letzte sein. Doch schon heute gehen meine Grüsse zu Ihnen und ich wünsche Ihnen von ganzem Herzen alles Liebe und Gute für das Fest und das Neue Jahr. Meine Frau schliesst sich meinen Wünschen an, die ich auch Ihrer Familie zu übermitteln bitte.

Ihr Ihnen sehr ergebener

## Appendix I

The table of contents of Kropatsch's unpublished book manuscript was apparently as follows (Kropatsch 1953d: 2–5):

I. Buddha: (1) Der Gang in die Hauslosigkeit (Transitioning to Homelessness), (2) Die Erleuchtung zu Uruvela (The Enlightenment at Uruvela), (3) Die erste Predigt zu Benares (The First Sermon at Benares), (4), Buddhismus als Weltreligion (Buddhism as World Religion), (5) Das "Opfer" der Brahmanen und Buddhas Opfer-Begriff (The "Sacrifice" of the Brahmins and Buddha's Concept of Sacrifice), (6) Der "mittlere Weg" (The "Middle Way"),<sup>333</sup> (7) "Brahma-Himmel" und das christliche "Reich Gottes" ("Brahma Heaven" and the Christian "Kingdom of God"), (8) Buddha und der Mystiker (Buddha and the Mystic), (9) Religion für den Einzelnen und Bekehrung "en bloc" (Religion for the Individual and Conversion "en bloc"), (10) Buddha und der Kriegsminister (Buddha and the Minister of War), (11) Buddha und die soziale Frage (Buddha and the Social Questions), (12) Das endgültige Verlöschen Buddhas (The Final Extinction of Buddha);

II Die Lehre (The Teachings): (1) Ablehnung aller Fragen nach den "letzten Dingen" (Rejection of all Questions about the "Last Things"), (2) "Verstehen" und "Erleben" der Lehre ("Understanding" and "Experiencing" the Teachings);

---

<sup>333</sup> Kropatsch's *Der "mittlere Weg" Buddhas* (The "Middle Way" of Buddha; Kropatsch 1953c) is probably based on this section of his book manuscript.

III Rechte Einsicht (Right View): (1) Die Wahrheit vom Leiden (The Truth of Suffering), (a) Das gefühlte Leiden (The Felt Suffering), (b) Vergänglichkeit als erkanntes Leiden (Impermanence as Recognised Suffering), (c) Die Weltcyclen [*sic*] des “Schrumpfens” und “Erblühens” (The World Cycles of “Shrinking” and “Blossoming”),<sup>334</sup> (d) Die menschliche “Persönlichkeit” und das Leib-Seele-Problem (The Human “Personality” and the Body-Soul Problem), (e) Die fünf “Greifegruppen” (The Five Khandhas), (f) Die Vergänglichkeit der fünf “Greifegruppen” (The Impermanence of the Five Khandhas), (g) Die Nicht-Selbstheit der “Person” (der Anatta-Gedanke) (The Non-Selfness of the “Individual” [The Notion of Anatta]), (h) Die Ich-Vorstellung von der Entstehung des Leidens (The Idea of the Ego Regarding the Origination of Suffering); (2) Die Wahrheit von der Entstehung des Leidens (The Truth of the Origination of Suffering), (a) Der “Lebensdurst” und die Frage der Willensfreiheit (“Thirst” and the Question of Free Will), (b) Die “Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens” innerhalb des Einzeldaseins (The “Chain of Dependent-simultaneous Origination” within Single Existence), (c) Die “Wiedergeburt” innerhalb der “Reihe des abhängig-gleichzeitigen Entstehens” (“Rebirth” within the “Chain of Dependent-simultaneous Origination”), (d) “Wiedergeburt” und “Seelenwanderung” (“Rebirth” and “Transmigration of Souls”), (e) Die “Wirkungsquanten” der modernen Physik und die “Wiedergeburt” (The “Quanta of Action” of Modern Physics and “Rebirth”), (f) Die “Mutationen” der modernen Biologie und die “Wiedergeburt” (The “Mutations” of Modern Biology and “Rebirth”), (g) “Bewusstsein” und “Wiedergeburt” (“Consciousness” and “Rebirth”), (h) Die verschiedenen Möglichkeiten der Wiedergeburt (The Different Ways of Rebirth), (i) Die “Wahlverwandtschaft” bei der Richtung der Wiedergeburt (The “Elective Affinity” in the Direction of Rebirth), (k) [*sic*] Die Lehre vom Kamma, von der Frucht des Wirkens (The Doctrine of Kamma, On the Fruit of Action); (3) Die Wahrheit von der Vernichtung des Leidens (The Truth of the Annihilation of Suffering), (a) Das Versiegen des Lebensdurstes (The Cessation of Thirst), (b) “Nibbana” und “Parinibbana” (“Nibbana” and “Parinibbana”), (c) Die “Seeligkeit” Nibbanas (The Bliss of “Nibbana”), (d) Nibbana als das “Verlöschen” (Nibbana as “Extinction”), (e) Die Möglichkeit des Zuruhekommens der Willensregungen (The Possibility of the Movements of the Will Coming to Rest), (f) Nibbana, die Voll-Endung des Lebens (Nibbana, the Perfectioning of Life), (g) Nibbana und Anatta-Gedanke (Nibbana and the Notion of Anatta);

---

334 Kropatsch’s *Das “Schrumpfen und Erblühen” der Welt* (The “Shrinking and Blossoming” of the World; Kropatsch 1953b) is probably based on this section of his book manuscript.

IV Rechter Entschluss (Right Determination): (1) Der Entschluss zum Entsagen (The Decision to Renounce), (2) Bettelmönch und Laienanhänger (Mendicant and Lay Follower), (3) Der Entschluss zum Wohlwollen (The Decision to be Benevolent);

V Rechte Rede (Right Speech);

VI Rechtes Tun (Right Action): (1) Das Verbot der Tötung des Mitmenschen und das Problem des "Weltfriedens" (The Prohibition of Killing Fellow Men and the Problem of "World Peace"), (2) Das Verbot der Tötung und Quälung von Tieren (The Prohibition of Killing and Torturing Animals), (3) Die Frage des Selbstmordes (The Question of Suicide), (4) Das Verbot des Diebstahls (The Prohibition of Stealing), (5) Das Verbot der Unkeuschheit und die Stellung Buddhas zum weiblichen Geschlecht (The Prohibition of Unchastity and the Buddha's Position on the Female Sex), (6) Das Verbot der Lüge (The Prohibition of Lying), (7) Das Verbot des Alkoholgenusses (The Prohibition of Drinking Alcohol);

VII Rechte Lebensführung (Right Livelihood): (1) Die verschiedenen Arten der Lebensführung (The Different Forms of Livelihood), (2) Die Ethik des Buddhismus (The Ethics of Buddhism), (3) Christliche und buddhistische Moral (Christian and Buddhist Morality);

VIII Rechte Anstrengung (Right Effort);

IX Rechte Verinnerung (Right Mindfulness): (1) Das Satipatthana-Sutta, die Rede von der "Vergewärtigung der Achtsamkeit" (The Satipatthana Sutta, the Discourse on the "Realisation of Mindfulness"), (2) Meditationen über die moderne Biologie (Reflections on Modern Biology), (3) Die "lenkenden Kräfte des Organischen" und die buddhistischen "Sankharas" (The "Directiveness of Organic Activities" and the Buddhist Sankharas), (4) "Tiefenpsychologie" und Buddhismus (Depth Psychology and Buddhism), (5) Die Frage des "Selbst" (The Question of "Self"), (6) Das Erleben der "Nicht-selbstheit" (The Experience of Non-Selfhood);

X Rechte Vertiefung (Right Absorption): (1) Der Weg zu den Vertiefungen (The Path to the Absorptions), (2) Die formhaften und die formfreien Versenkungen (Absorptions With and Without Form), (3) Buddhismus und Mystik (Buddhism and Mysticism), (4) Der Buddhismus und die Phänomene der "Parapsychologie" (Buddhism and the Phenomena of "Parapsychology"), (5) Das Erleben der Erlösung (The Experience of Salvation);

## XI Literatur (Literature)

**Appendix II**

Kropatsch enclosed the Preface (*Vorwort*) to his *Betrachtungen zu den Reden Buddhas* (Reflections on the Buddha's Discourses) in his first letter to Nāṇaponika Mahāthera (Kropatsch 1953d: 1–2):

*Translation*

## Preface

The plan of the present work is as follows: Drawing on Buddha's Discourses – according to the German translations by Dahlke, Neumann, Nyanaponika, Nyanatiloka, Oldenberg, and Seidenstücker – both the Buddha's person and especially his teachings are being reflected upon. From the Buddha's life, those passages are selected from the Pali texts that appear to be particularly noteworthy, and personal thoughts are attached to them, which do not have a fixed boundary and order. In these passages, some aspects of the teaching system are anticipated, but they are more hinted at than brought to a conclusion, in order to lead to the main part of the work, the reflection on the teaching itself. As we enter into the reflection of the teaching itself, this more personal statement gives way to a systematic order in which the references to the results of modern science, especially physics, biology, and psychology, come more and more clearly to the fore and more experienced experts on the teachings than I am have their say. But even these presentations, which mainly concern the first three Buddhist Truths of suffering, the origination of suffering, and the annihilation of suffering, only serve to prepare the most important section of the book, in which the path leading to the experience of salvation is attempted to be shown. Right View and Right Moral Livelihood then seem to be no more than steps leading up to the realisation of the teaching goal in Right Mindfulness. The actual aim of this work is to make this most important part of the path to salvation as clear as possible to the reader. Here, the author will step back completely, leaving only the Buddha and the most outstanding interpreters of his sayings – primarily Dahlke and Nyanaponika – to speak, and only facilitating understanding through comparisons with biological and psychological findings of recent times. A reflection upon the stages of absorption of the last part of the Eightfold Path, the Right Absorption, forms the conclusion that completes the discussion. The more the author disappears, the better, since he owes all the thoughts expressed here to

the words of the Exalted One and to those men who lived and thought as his disciples in the recent past or are heralds of his imperishable wisdom in the present.

### *Original*

#### Vorwort.

Der Plan vorliegenden Werkes ist folgender: An Hand der Reden Buddhas – nach den deutschen Uebersetzungen von Dahlke, Neumann, Nyanaponika, Nyanatiloka, Oldenberg und Seidenstücker – wird sowohl die Person Buddhas als vor allem seine Lehre in den Kreis von Betrachtungen gezogen. Aus dem Leben Buddhas werden jene Stellen aus den Pali-Texten ausgewählt, die besonders beachtenswert erscheinen, und an diese persönliche Gedanken angeschlossen, die keine feste Umgrenzung und Ordnung aufweisen. In ihnen wird manche, das Lehrsystem Betreffende vorweggenommen, doch mehr angedeutet, als zu einem Abschluss gebracht, um so auf den Hauptteil des Werkes, die Betrachtung der Lehre selbst, hinzuführen. Mit dem Eintritt in die Betrachtung der Lehre selbst macht diese mehr persönliche Stellungnahme einer systematischen Ordnung Platz, in welcher die Bezugnahmen auf die Ergebnisse der modernen Wissenschaft, besonders der Physik, Biologie und Psychologie, immer deutlicher in den Vordergrund treten und erfahrenere Kenner der Lehre, als ich es bin, zu Worte kommen. Doch auch diese Darstellungen, die vor allem die drei ersten buddhistischen Wahrheiten vom Leiden, von der Leidensentstehung und von der Leidensvernichtung betreffen, dienen nur zur Vorbereitung des wichtigsten Abschnittes des Buches, in welchem der Weg, der zum Erleben der Erlösung führt, zu zeigen versucht wird. Rechte Einsicht und rechte sittliche Lebensführung scheinen dann nicht mehr zu sein als Stufen, die zur Verwirklichung der Lehrziele in der Rechten Verinnerung emporführen. Diesen bedeutsamsten Teil des Weges zur Erlösung dem Leser so deutlich als möglich vor Augen zu stellen ist das eigentliche Ziel dieser Arbeit. Hier will die Person des Verfassers zur Gänze zurücktreten, u einzig Buddha und den hervorragendsten Interpreten seiner Aussprüche – vornehmlich Dahlke und Nyanaponika – das Wort zu lassen und nur durch Vergleiche mit biologischen und psychologischen Erkenntnissen der letzten Zeit das Verständnis zu erleichtern. Eine Betrachtung der Versenkungsstufen des letzten Gliedes des Achtpfades, der Rechten Vertiefung, bildet den Abschluss, der die Gesamtschau vollendet. Je mehr die Person des Verfassers verschwindet, um so besser, verdankt sie doch alle hier ausgesprochenen Gedanken den Worten des Erhabenen und jenen Männern, die als seine Jünger

in der jüngsten Vergangenheit lebten und dachten oder in der Gegenwart Kunder seiner unvergänglichen Weisheit sind.

## References

### Primary Sources

- Abel-Rémusat, Jean-Pierre. 1836. *Foë Kouë Ki ou Relation des royaumes bouddhiques: Voyage dans la Tartarie, dans l'Afghanistan et dans l'Inde. Exécuté, à la fin du IV<sup>e</sup> siècle, par Chy Fa Hian, traduit du chinois et commenté*. Paris: Imprimerie Royale.
- Allen, G. F. (Y. Siri Nyana). 1959. *The Buddha's Philosophy: Selections from the Pāli Canon and an Introductory Essay*. London: Allen and Unwin.
- Anonymous. 1956. "The World Celebrates Buddha Jayanti." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (7), pp. 357–367.
- Bauer, Paul. 1955. *Das Ringen um den Nanga Parbat 1856–1953. Hundert Jahre bergsteigerischer Geschichte*. München: Süddeutscher Verlag.
- Bavink, Bernhard. 1914. *Ergebnisse und Probleme der Naturwissenschaften. Eine Einführung in die heutige Naturphilosophie*. Leipzig: Hirzel Verlag.
- Bavink, Bernhard. 1928. *Die Hauptfragen der heutigen Naturphilosophie*. Berlin: Verlag Otto Salle.
- Bavink, Bernhard. 1947. *Das Weltbild der heutigen Naturwissenschaft und seine Beziehungen zur Philosophie und Religion*. Iserlohn: Silva-Verlag.
- Beal, Samuel. 1869. *Fah-Hian and Sung-Yun, Buddhist Pilgrims, from China to India (400 A.D. and 518 A.D.)*. Translated from the Chinese. London: Trübner & Co.
- Beal, Samuel. 1911 [1888]. *The Life of Hiuen-Tsiang by Shaman Hwui Li. With an Introduction Containing an Account of the Work of I-Tsing*. New edition. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1954a. "'I Went to Them and Said'." *The Maha Bodhi*, 62 (5–6), pp. 215–216.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1954b. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 62 (7), pp. 248–254.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1954c. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 62 (8), pp. 305–313.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1954d. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 62 (11), pp. 449–453.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1954e. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 62 (12), pp. 484–487.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1955a. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (2), pp. 46–49.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1955b. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (4), pp. 121–130.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1955c. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (7), pp. 285–289.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1955d. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (9), pp. 358–359.



- Bennett, A. A. G. 1955e. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (11), pp. 430–435.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956a. "Sanskrit Buddhist Literature." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (7), pp. 333–339.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956b. "Sanskrit Buddhist Literature." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (8), pp. 393–399.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956c. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (2), pp. 57–64.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956d. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (3), pp. 89–97.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956e. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (9), pp. 423–425.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956f. "The Buddha's Teachings in the Digha Nikaya Suttas I–XVI." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (11), pp. 489–492.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1956g. "Value of the Buddhist Philosophies to Present-day Thought." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (5), pp. 165–173.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1957a. "Catalogues of the Buddhist Tripitaka." *The Maha Bodhi*, 65 (1), pp. 6–14.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1957b. "Reprints of Jayanti Year." *The Maha Bodhi*, 65 (5), pp. 215–218.
- Bennett, A. A. G. 1964. *Long Discourses of the Buddha (Digha-Nikaya I–XVI): Translation from the Pali with an Introduction*. Bombay: Chetana.
- Brion, Marcel. 1954. *Génie et destinée. Schumann et l'âme romantique*. Paris: Éditions Albin Michel.
- Brion, Marcel. 1956. *Schumann & The Romantic Age*. London: Collins.
- Brunton, Paul. 1937. *A Hermit in the Himalayas*. London: Leonard & Co.
- Brunton, Paul. 1940. *Das Überselbst*. Zürich and Leipzig: Rascher Verlag.
- Buddhistische Gesellschaft Wien. 1955. *Zeitschrift der buddhistischen Gesellschaft Wien*, 2 (April–May).
- Ceram, C. W. 1955. *Enge Schlucht und schwarzer Berg. Die Entdeckung des Hethiter-Reiches*. Hamburg: Rowohlt.
- Dahlke, Paul. 1921. *Buddha. Auswahl aus dem Palikanon*. Berlin: Brandussche Verlagsbuchhandlung.
- Dasgupta, Surendranath. 1955. *A History of Indian Philosophy. Volume 5: Southern Schools of Śaivism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- David-Neel, Alexandra. 1931. *Heilige und Hexer. Glaube und Aberglaube im Lande des Lamaismus*. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus.
- David-Neel, Alexandra. 1937. *Vom Leiden zur Erlösung. Sinn und Lehre des Buddhismus*. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus.
- Deussen, Paul. 1907. *Die Geheimlehre des Veda. Ausgewählte Texte des Upanishad's. Aus dem Sanskrit übersetzt*. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus.
- Deussen, Paul. 1919. *Allgemeine Geschichte der Philosophie unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der Religionen. Zweiter Band, erste Abteilung: Die Philosophie der Griechen*. 2nd edition. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus.
- Duke of Windsor. 1947. *A King's Story: The Memoirs of the Duke of Windsor*. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons.
- Eddington, Arthur Stanley. 1931. *Das Weltbild der Physik und ein Versuch seiner philosophischen Deutung*. Wiesbaden: Vieweg+Teubner Verlag.

- Eddington, Arthur Stanley. 1939. *Philosophie der Naturwissenschaft*. Bern: Verlag A. Francke.
- English Editorial Department, Union Buddha Sāsana Council. 1956. "Brahma-Jāla Sutta." *The Light of the Dhamma*, 3 (2), pp. 28–52.
- Franke, Rudolf Otto. 1913. *Dīghanikāya. Das Buch der langen Texte des buddhistischen Kanons. In Auswahl übersetzt*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Frauwallner, Erich. 1953. *Geschichte der indischen Philosophie. 1. Band, Die Philosophie des Veda und des Epos, der Buddha und der Jina, das Samkhya und das klassische Yoga-System*. Salzburg: Otto Müller Verlag.
- Frauwallner, Erich. 1956. *Geschichte der indischen Philosophie. 2. Band, Die naturphilosophischen Schulen und das Vaisesika-System, das System der Jaina, der Materialismus*. Salzburg: Otto Müller Verlag.
- Freud, Sigmund. 1916/1917. *Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die Psychoanalyse*. Leipzig and Wien: Hugo Heller & Cie.
- Geiger, Wilhelm. 1905. *Dīpavaṃsa und Mahāvaṃsa und die geschichtliche Überlieferung in Ceylon*. Leipzig: A. Deichert'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung Nachf.
- Geiger, Wilhelm. 1925. *Samyutta-Nikāya. Die in Gruppen geordnete Sammlung aus dem Pāli-Kanon der Buddhisten*, 2. München-Neubiberg: Benares-Verl.
- Geiger, Wilhelm. 1930. *Samyutta-Nikāya. Die in Gruppen geordnete Sammlung aus dem Pāli-Kanon der Buddhisten*, 1. München-Neubiberg: Benares-Verl.
- Giles, Herbert Allen. 1877. *Record of the Buddhist Kingdoms. Translated from the Chinese*. London: Trübner & Co / Shanghai: Kelly & Walsh.
- Gomperz, Theodor. 1896–1909. *Griechische Denker. Eine Geschichte der antiken Philosophie*. 3 volumes. Leipzig. Verlag von Veit & Comp.
- Gupta, K. C. 1956. "Review of Indo-Chinese Relations." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (3), p. 109.
- Harrer, Heinrich. 1952. *Sieben Jahre in Tibet. Mein Leben am Hofe des Dalai Lama*. Frankfurt am Main: Ullstein Verlag.
- Humphreys, Christmas. 1956. *A Buddhist Student's Manual*. London: The Buddhist Society.
- Khosla, Gopal Das. 1956. *Himalayan Circuit: The Story of a Journey in the Inner Himalaya*. London: Macmillan & Co.
- Klar, Helmut. 1972. "In memoriam." *Buddhistische Monatsblätter*, 18, pp. 43–44.
- Klar, Helmut. 1978. "Zum Tode Johann Stepanovskys." *Bodhi Baum*, 3 (2), p. 129.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1953a. "Betrachtungen zur 'Erleuchtung Buddhas'." *Indische Welt, Buddhistische Monatshefte*, 5, pp. 74–78.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1953b. "Das 'Schrumpfen und Erblühen' der Welt." *Indische Welt, Buddhistische Monatshefte*, 8, pp. 130–134.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1953c. "Der 'mittlere Weg' Buddhas." *Indische Welt, Buddhistische Monatshefte*, 7, pp. 108–111.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1953d. *Letter to Nyanaponika Thera* (23 May), 4pp. + 5pp.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1955a. "Betrachtungen zur 'Erleuchtung Buddhas'." *Zeitschrift der buddhistischen Gesellschaft Wien*, (6 May Special Issue), pp. 4–6.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1955b. "Grundsätze des Buddhismus." *Zeitschrift der buddhistischen Gesellschaft Wien*, 1 (January), pp. 4–7.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1955c. "The Mutations of Modern Biology and the 'Rebirth' of Buddhism." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (1), pp. 3–10.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1955d. "'Thirst' and the Question of Free Will." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (8), pp. 325–331.

- Kropatsch, Anton. 1956. "The Body-Soul Problem in Modern Psychology and in Buddhism." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (5), pp. 198–204.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1957a. *Die letzte Freiheit des Menschen (Buddhas Lehre vom Nicht-Selbst)*. Bidingen-Gettenbach: Avalun-Verlag.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1957b. "Eternalists." *The Maha Bodhi*, 65 (2), pp. 36–41.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1960. "Reflections on the Potthapada Sutta." *The Maha Bodhi*, 68 (5), pp. 159–163.
- Kropatsch, Anton. 1963. *Wiedergeburt und Erlösung in der Lehre des Buddha*. Gelnhausen: Heinrich Schwab Verlag.
- Migot, André. 1956. *Tibetan Marches*. London: Readers Union/Rupert Hart-Davis.
- Murti, Tirupattur R. V. 1955. *The Central Philosophy of Buddhism: A Study of the Mādhyamika System*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Nanatiloka Mahathera. 1927. *The Word of the Buddha: An Outline of the Ethico-philosophical System of the Buddha in the Words of the Pali Canon. Compiled, Translated, and Explained*. n/a.
- Neumann, Karl Eugen. 1922a. *Die Reden Gotamo Buddhos. Aus der Mittleren Sammlung Majjhimanikāyo des Pāli-Kanons zum ersten Mal übersetzt. Erster Band*. 3rd edition. München: R. Piper.
- Neumann, Karl Eugen. 1922b. *Die Reden Gotamo Buddhos. Aus der Mittleren Sammlung Majjhimanikāyo des Pāli-Kanons zum ersten Mal übersetzt. Zweiter Band*. 3rd edition. München: R. Piper.
- Neumann, Karl Eugen. 1922c. *Die Reden Gotamo Buddhos. Aus der Mittleren Sammlung Majjhimanikāyo des Pāli-Kanons zum ersten Mal übersetzt. Dritter Band*. 3rd edition. München: R. Piper.
- Nyanaponika. 1950. *Satipaṭṭhāna. Der Heilsweg buddhistischer Geistesschulung. Die Lehrrede von der Vergegenwärtigung der Achtsamkeit. (Satipatthana-Sutta). Text u- und Kommentar. Übersetzt, eingeleitet und erläutert*. Konstanz: Christiani.
- Nyanaponika. 1956. *Der einzige Weg. Buddhistische Texte zur Geistesschulung in rechter Achtsamkeit. Aus dem Pali und Sanskrit übersetzt und erläutert*. Konstanz: Christiani.
- Nyānatiloka. 1919. *Die Fragen des Milindo. Ein historischer Roman enthaltend Zwiegespräche zwischen einem Griechenkönige und einem buddhistischen Mönche über die wichtigsten Punkte der buddhistischen Lehre. Aus dem Pāli zum erstenmale vollständig ins Deutsche übersetzt*. München-Neubiberg: Oskar Schloss Verlag.
- Oldenberg, Hermann. 1881. *Buddha. Sein Leben, seine Lehre, seine Gemeinde*. Berlin: Verlag von Wilhelm Hertz.
- Oldenberg, Hermann. 1922. *Reden des Buddha. Lehre/Verse/Erzählungen*. München: Kurt Wolff Verlag.
- Österreichisches Volkshochschularchiv. Online: [http://archiv.vhs.at/vhsarchiv\\_suche.html](http://archiv.vhs.at/vhsarchiv_suche.html) (accessed: July 15, 2022).
- R. E. 1922. "Vorwort des Herausgebers." In Karl Eugen Neumann, *Die Reden Gotamo Buddhos. Aus der Mittleren Sammlung Majjhimanikāyo des Pāli-Kanons zum ersten Mal übersetzt. Erster Band*. 3rd edition. München: R. Piper, pp. ix–xx.
- Rensch, Bernhard. 1954. *Neuere Probleme der Abstammungslehre. Die transspezifische Evolution*. 2nd edition. Stuttgart: Ferdinand Enke Verlag.
- Rhine, Joseph Banks. 1947. *The Reach of the Mind*. New York: William Sloane Associates.

- Rhine, Joseph Banks. 1950. *Die Reichweite des menschlichen Geistes. Parapsychologische Experimente*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Verlagsanstalt.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William. 1899. *Dialogues of the Buddha: Translated from the Pāli*. London: Henry Frowde.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and Joseph Estlin Carpenter, eds. 1890. *The Dīgha Nikāya, Vol. 1*. London: Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and Joseph Estlin Carpenter, eds. 1903. *The Dīgha Nikāya, Vol. 2*. London: Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and Joseph Estlin Carpenter, eds. 1949. *The Dīgha Nikāya*. London: Luzac for the Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1921. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part I (A)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1922a. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part II (Ā–O)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1922b. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part III (K–Cit)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1923a. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part III (Cit–No)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1923b. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part V (P–Ph.)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rhys Davids, Thomas William and William Stede, eds. 1925. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary, Part VIII (Vim–H.)*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Rothacker, Erich. 1938. *Die Schichten der Persönlichkeit*. Leipzig: Barth.
- Russell, Bertrand. 1946. *History of Western Philosophy and Its Connection with Political and Social Circumstances from the Earliest Times to the Present Day*. London: George Allen and Unwin.
- Russell, Edward Stuart. 1945. *The Directiveness of Organic Activities*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Russell, Edward Stuart. 1945. *Lenkende Kräfte des Organischen*. Bern: Verlag A. Francke.
- Sangharakshita. 1956. "Where Buddhism Begins – And Why It Begins There." *The Maha Bodhi*, 64 (5), pp. 174–180.
- Sangharakshita. 2003. *Moving Against the Stream: The Birth of a New Buddhist Movement*. Birmingham: Windhorse Publications.
- Sangharakshita. 2013. *Beating the Drum: Maha Bodhi Editorials by Sangharakshita. With an Introduction and Notes by Kalyanaprabha*. Ledbury: Ibis Publications.
- Seidenstücker, Karl. 1911. *Pāli-Buddhismus in Übersetzungen. Texte aus dem buddhistischen Pāli-Kanon und dem Kammavācam*. Breslau: Markgraf.
- Steffens, Henrich. 1821. *Caricaturen des Heiligsten. Zweiter Theil*. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus.
- Takakusu, Junjiro. 1947. *The Essentials of Buddhist Philosophy*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii.
- Wallaser, Max. 1904. *Die buddhistische Philosophie in ihrer geschichtlichen Entwicklung. Erster Teil: Die philosophische Grundlage des älteren Buddhismus*. Heidelberg: Carl Winter's Universitätsbuchhandlung.
- Warren, Henry Clarke. 1906. *Buddhism in Translations*. Cambridge: Harvard University.
- Whitehead, Alfred North. 1948. *Essays in Science and Philosophy*. London: Rider and Company.

- Zouzelka, Franz. 1955a. "Account of the Finding and Honouring of the Grave of K. E. Neumann." *The Maha Bodhi*, 63 (12), pp. 490–491.
- Zouzelka, Franz. 1955b. "Zum Geleit." *Zeitschrift der buddhistischen Gesellschaft Wien*, January, pp. 1–3.

### *Secondary Sources*

- Baumann, Martin, ed. 1995. *Helmut Klar. Zeitzeuge zur Geschichte des Buddhismus in Deutschland*. Konstanz: Universität Konstanz.
- Baumann, Martin. 1997. "'Entsagung und Entselbstung'. Eine Neuinterpretation des Lebens und Werkes des Buddhisten Paul Dahlke." In Reiner Mahlke, Renate Pitzer-Reyl, and Joachim Süß, eds., *Living Faith – Lebendige religiöse Wirklichkeit. Festschrift für Hans-Jürgen Greschat*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, pp. 263–282.
- Hecker, Hellmuth. 1986. *Karl Eugen Neumann. Erstübersetzer der Reden des Buddha, Anreger zu abendländischen Spiritualität*. Wien: Octopus Verlag.
- Hecker, Hellmuth, ed. 1995. *Der erste deutsche Bhikkhu. Das bewegte Leben des Ehrwürdigen Nyānatiloka (1878–1957) und seine Schüler*. Konstanz: Universität Konstanz.
- Hecker, Hellmuth. 1996a. *Lebensbilder deutscher Buddhisten. Ein bio-bibliographisches Handbuch, Band I: Die Gründer*. Stambach: Verlag Beyerlein & Steinschulte.
- Hecker, Hellmuth. 1996b. *Lebensbilder deutscher Buddhisten. Ein bio-bibliographisches Handbuch, Band II: Die Nachfolger*. Stambach: Verlag Beyerlein & Steinschulte.
- Kalyanaprabha. 2013 [2012]. "Introduction." In Sangharakshita, *Beating the Drum: Maha Bodhi Editorials*. Ledbury: Ibis Publications, pp. 7–89.
- Liechty, Mark. 2017. *Far Out: Countercultural Seekers and the Tourist Encounter in Nepal*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Oliver, Ian P. 1979. *Buddhism in Britain*. London: Rider & Company.
- Steinke, Ulrich. 1989. "Karl Bernhard Seidenstücker (1876–1936): Leben, Schaffen, Wirken." M.A. thesis, University of Tübingen, Germany.
- Tragl, Karl Heinz. 2007. *Chronik der Wiener Krankenanstalten*. Wien: Böhlau Verlag.
- Vélez de Cea, J. Abraham. 2013. *The Buddha and Religious Diversity*. London and New York: Routledge.